

**“IN THE BEGINNING THERE WAS A WORD ...”: EXPERIENCE OF EXEGETICS
IN THE LANGUAGE ASPECT”**

***“NO PRINCÍPIO HAVIA UMA PALAVRA...”: EXPERIÊNCIA DE EXEGÉTICOS NO
ASPECTO DA LÍNGUA ”***

***“AL PRINCIPIO HABÍA UNA PALABRA ...”: EXPERIENCIA DE EXEGÉTICA EN EL
ASPECTO LENGUAJE ”***

Polina VOLKOVA¹
Elena PANOVA²
Natalya SAENKO^{3*}
Vadim KORTUNOV⁴
Ekaterina BOBYREVA⁵

ABSTRACT: The article takes the experience of exegetics of the initial phase of the gospel text “At the beginning, there was a Word, and God had a Word, and God was the Word” based on a systematic approach to a language. Considering the language as an actual and at the same time a virtual phenomenon, the authors justify the synonymic character of lexemes Word, Number (V. Nalimov), Sound (A. Makarevich), Music (N. Bobyleva), Emotion (V. Shakhovskiy), Gesture (A. and N. Ustiny). Starting with the binary oppositions, rational-irrational, verbal-nonverbal, discrete-continual, real-virtual, authors suggest a linguistic (psycholinguistic) perspective in the process of interpretation of such religious phenomena as the Trinity and the Holy Cross. As a result, the authors conclude that the biblical Word is the process of organization of the informational system of the innate natural “arrangement” (God-Father) to transform it into an above-natural “arrangement” (Holy Spirit).

KEYWORDS: Ambivalence of the language. Conceptual system. Exegetics. Hermeneutics.

RESUMO: O artigo retoma a experiência da exegética da fase inicial do texto evangélico “No início havia uma Palavra, e Deus tinha uma Palavra, e Deus era a Palavra” a partir de uma abordagem sistemática de uma linguagem. Considerando a linguagem como um fenômeno atual e ao mesmo tempo virtual, os autores justificam o caráter sinônimo dos lexemas Palavra, Número (V. Nalimov), Som (A. Makarevich), Música (N. Bobyleva), Emoção (V. Shakhovskiy), Gestura (A. e N. Ustiny). Começando com as oposições binárias, racional-irracional, verbal-

¹ Krasnodar Higher Military School named after General of the army S.M. Shtemenko, 350063 Krasnodar, Krasina Street 4, polina7-7@yandex.ru, <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-3534-5792>.

² Moscow Polytechnic University, Bolshaya Semyonovskaya str., 38, Moscow, 107023, panova_ep@mail.ru, <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-9940-9855>.

³ Moscow Polytechnic University, Bolshaya Semyonovskaya str., 38, Moscow, 107023, rilke@list.ru, <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-1815-4169>.

⁴ Russian State University of Tourism and Service, 99 Glavnaya Street, dp.Cherkizovo, Pushkinsky district, Moscow region, 141221, kortunov@bk.ru, <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-6058-498X>.

⁵ Volgograd State Socio-Pedagogical University, Lenin prospect, 27, Volgograd, new_life@mail.ru, <https://orcid.org/0000-0003-0359-5751>.

não verbal, discreto-contínuo, real-virtual, os autores sugerem uma perspectiva lingüística (psicolingüística) no processo de interpretação de fenômenos religiosos como a Trindade e a Teoria da Cruz. Como resultado, os autores concluem que a Palavra bíblica é o processo de organização do sistema informacional do “arranjo” natural inato (Deus-Pai) para transformá-lo em um “arranjo” acima do natural (Espírito Santo).

PALAVRAS-CHAVE: *Ambivalência da linguagem. Sistema conceitual. Exegética. Hermenêutica.*

RESUMEN: *El artículo toma la experiencia de la exegética de la fase inicial del texto evangélico “Al principio había una Palabra, y Dios tenía una Palabra, y Dios era la Palabra” basada en un enfoque sistemático de un lenguaje. Considerando el lenguaje como un fenómeno actual y al mismo tiempo virtual, los autores justifican el carácter sinonímico de los lexemas Palabra, Número (V. Nalimov), Sonido (A. Makarevich), Música (N. Bobyleva), Emoción (V. Shakhovskiy), Gesto (A. y N. Ustiny). Partiendo de las oposiciones binarias, racional-irracional, verbal-no verbal, discreto-contínuo, real-virtual, los autores sugieren una perspectiva lingüística (psicolingüística) en el proceso de interpretación de fenómenos religiosos como la Trinidad y la Cruz. Como resultado, los autores concluyen que la Palabra bíblica es el proceso de organización del sistema de información del “arreglo” natural innato (Dios-Padre) para transformarlo en un “arreglo” por encima de lo natural (Espíritu Santo).*

PALABRAS CLAVE: *Ambivalencia del lenguaje. Sistema conceptual. Exegética. Hermenêutica.*

Introduction

In the book, which was published in 1999, on the threshold of the 21st century, Irina Vladimirovna Arnold raises the question of the quotation character of the title, paying attention to a number of works the titles of which actualize the sacred subtext. Among them are novels of such writers as Gr. Green (“Power and Glory”), V. Dudintsev (“White Clothes”), A. Christie (“Pale Horse”), L. Pasternak (“Doctor Zhivago”), E. Hemingway (“And the sun rises”), etc. Noting that the title, the beginning and the end of literary text are always in a strong position which can act as a starting point for stylistic decoding (Michael Riffater), I.V. Arnold has a particular goal: “to create high culture of reading” (ARNOLD, 1999:126).

According to the scholar, the indicated culture is intended:

- to take an uninspired reader away from surface approach when, as a rule, he finds in the text only what he already knows or expects to find;
- to work out the desire and readiness to penetrate deeply into the “underwater part of the iceberg” (E. Hemingway), being not satisfied with knowledge of the plot and general idea of the text;
- to help the reader to see the most subtle shades of thoughts and feelings, avoiding cultural stamps in the interpretation of the literary work;

- to prevent emotional unresponsiveness and emotional stupidity of the reader;
- to developmental taste (ARNOLD, 1999:126).

Wishing to express our solidarity with the author on this issue we would like to express our opinion - that culture is defined by a particular level of consciousness (BOLGOVA, 2021; BAŞOK AND SAYER, 2020; OGUILVE ET AL., 2021). The specifics of this level is precisely revealed, in our opinion, by a phrase that occupies the strongest position of the text in one of the most widely-read and quoted books –“The Gospel”: “At first there was a Word, and God had a Word, and God was Word”.

Problem Statement

The essence of the problem lies in the experience of the exegetics of the opening phrase of the Gospel.“At first there was a Word, and the Word was God, and the Word was God” functioning under the sign of language as a system. Established position can’t be reached without receiving answers to a number of questions.

Sharing the position of the philosopher-researcher A.L. Nikiforov we set “the problem of meaning in terms of metaphysical statements” (NIKIFOROV, 2016: 98). Following A.L. Nikiforov, we realize that interpretation presents “the attribution of meaning to the symbols of the formal system, due to which the game with symbols turns into a language the sentences of which describe something” (NIKIFOROV, 2017: 51). However, we do not share the position of I. S. Kurilovich, who says that practical use of the language demonstrates “insignificance of polysemy as a problem of understanding in a live dialogue and reading of the text” (Kurilovich, 2017:69).

Research Questions

1. Why does the biblical Word act as a correlate of Number, Sound, Music (Bobyleva, 2010: 4-10), Emotions (SHAKHOVSKIY, 2008), Gesture (USTINA, 2013), M. Plisetskaya (NABORSCHIKOVA, 2010) and B. Eyfman (SMAGARINSKAYA, 2017) together witness that “There was a gesture at first”.

Paying attention to the polymorphic character of the Greek word *λόγος*, V.V. Nalimov introduces the idea of similarity of such lexemes as: calculation, counting and number. It allows V.V. Nalimov to speak about peripheral sense of the phrase that is of interest to us: “At first there was a Word, and God had a Word and God was Word” (NALIMOV, 2015).

In the book “At first there was a sound” A.V. Makarevich draws the following parallel lines: note La is correlated to the used by Buddhists sound Aum/Om which is transferred in Christian religion into Am-Inm which is synonymic to the alphabetic definition of the sound which defines the beginning and the end of our alphabet – A/Z. Conclusion to which famous musician comes to is: from the point of view of physics the world had come from primary standing wave (MAKAREVICH, 2010; PASHINA, 2021).

2. What is language as a system?

3. How does the dual nature of language reveal the depth of the phrase “The Word was first, and the Word was God, and the Word was God”?

4. What are the conditions that bring a linguistic personality closer to mastering the Word of Bible?

Purpose of the Study

The aim of the study can be seen in the necessity to desacralize the desired phrase in order to articulate the direction of the linguistic personality’s path in order to achieve a full vital activity of consciousness.

Research Methods

The Methodology of the research is based on a systematic approach, principles of ambivalence of the language sign and binary character of oppositions, hermeneutic method, method of stylistic decoding, and method of analyzing dictionary definitions analysis.

We undertake the attempt of complex use of hermeneutics and logical analysis of the language, as we share position of the researchers who believe that: “Rediscovering of logic-semantic analysis for the interpretation of natural languages’ expressions together with the results of modern linguistics allows us to breathe new life into the conceptions of classics of analytical philosophy, and besides, can make modern research in the field of language philosophy less disconnected from the real language practice” (Kusliy & Vostrikova, 2016: 17). More than that, we conduct a dialogue with researches using standard and alternative means of logical analysis (BORISOV, 2016; GORBATOV, 2016; MIKIRTUMOV, 2016; MORGOEVA, 2021; DONOHUE, 2020).

Findings

Let's presuppose that differences in understanding of the biblical Word are the result of the fact that this phenomenon is not only material, but it is also intangible and it takes into account the unity of rational and irrational, verbal and non-verbal, real and virtual, current and potential, discrete and continual. Accordingly nothing but boundaries of this lexeme, determined by the material boundaries of the token, initiate the search for the equivalents which will be adequate to the world perception of the mentioned above authors (N. BOBYLEVA, A. AND N. USTINA, V. SHAKHOVSKY) AND PEOPLE OF ART (A MAKAREVICH, M. PLISETSKAYA, B. EIFMAN).

Researchers who follow L. Wittgenstein suppose that "...explores the idea of linguistic meaning in the case of metaphysical references..." (Villanueva, 2016:94). Using philosophical arguments in favor of a representative interpretation of consciousness, which remove ontological questions in the context of linguistic-cognitive research are called, for example, "transparency argument" and "probability argument" (Baryshnikov, 2016: 124-125). Besides, we share the idea that "religious cognition is natural" (Sears, 2017: 82).

To build an argumentation system which excludes any fleur of mysticism, we will consider the dual nature of the language from the position of the system (Volkova, 2017: 207-214). On the one hand, we are talking about an individual system of information as an "integrated arrangement" which can be found in every biological organism, designed to carry out a communicative function realized through language. At the same time, information system of the language can be considered as a correlation of the learning activity of consciousness. Due to the fact that such system is directly connected with a natural "arrangement", it inevitably determines the program of life of its carrier. We are talking about setting up for survival for the purpose of self-preservation, regardless of what it is about: a genus, a class, a detachment, a species or a population as a whole. Realizing that in a situation where the question of self-preservation dominates among other vital issues, the next moment becomes obvious. The activity of nature exceeds the actual human activity, making the language subject a passive consumer parasitizing on natural data. It encourages medieval scholastics and humanists of the 16th century... "to comprehend the nature of the primitive language in a relatively casual way, recognizing its historical primacy and onto-epistemic superiority, manifested in the pure motivation of its names and religious-metaphysical depth of their meanings - but not the availability of magical potential" (KARABYKOV, 2020:62).

On the contrary, situation that determines linguistic personality's activity turns out to be significant at the level of the individual conceptual system as a purely human creation, which

presents a kind of “superstructure” built over the information system. Its fundamental mismatch with the latter is because formation of the conceptual system occurs exclusively with the support of reflection as a result of which cognitive activity of consciousness is balanced by its semantic-forming activity (SHAKHOVSKIY & VOLKOVA, 2017). In other words, while the information system operates at the level of self-organization the conceptual system is always created (born) through individual system organization. Such an experience involves activities (mental activities) which opposite to natural automatism. And, in particular, while in case with the information system its non-verbal elements are encoded by its verbal elements, then in the case with a conceptual system the verbal elements are decoded by the non-verbal elements and only then are re-encoded.

So we found that the biblical Word can stand as a synonym to such lexemes as Number, Sound, Music, Emotion, Gesture which is due to the dual character of the language as the information system, on the one hand, and the conceptual system, on the other. Accordingly, while in the first case we can speak about verbal, rational, direct, real character or the relevance and reality related to the language sign, in the second, we can mention non-verbal character, that is, irrationality, continuity, potentiality, virtuality, acting as correlation of sensual experience. Before answering the question of how the dual nature of language provides identification of deep meaning of the phrase with which one of the most important cultural texts begins, we will give a number of statements (not in chronological order):

- “Christ is the one who is measured” (the apocryphal Gospel of Philip);
- “Measure and likeness” (inscription on the Valaam icon of God’s Mother);
- “God ordered all things according both number and weight” (Solomon’s Wisdom);
- “My kingdom is not from this world... I am the way, the truth and life...” (The Gospel of John);
- “The kingdom of God is within you” (the Gospel of Luke);
- “But the kingdom is within you and beyond you” (Gnostic Gospel of Thomas).

Let us suggest that the information system as an inherent natural “arrangement” related to any organism, can be considered as God-the-Father -source of life on earth of all creatures, including man. The justification of this statement comes from the following point. Beside adaptive function of the individual information system, as well as transference of experience resulting from such adaptation which becomes possible through communication, balance between the outside world and the organism existing in this world is can’t be reached. In other words, nothing but desired equilibrium - or dimensional tension –can provide natural diversity,

which is supported by natural selection. In more details about law of measured tension – see (KAYDAKOV, 2002).

On the other hand a man as a natural being, the relevance of which is initiated by the reality of the individual information system (God-Father) and, at the same time, as a natural being (God-Son) which potential is directly related to the virtual character of the individual conceptual system (Holy Spirit), remaining in the captivity of nature, violates the inherent equilibrium of the natural world. The latter becomes possible to achieve only when the potential (conceptual system) becomes relevant, so creating a precedent of dimensional tension, recognized at the level of meaning as the unity of what is given and what is created, verbal and non-verbal, rational and irrational (SHAKHOVSKIY & VOLKOVA, 2020: 48-62). It is significant that the desired dimensional tension is no longer achieved at the expense of the external influence of the world on the system which in its turn gives rise to the necessity to adapt to it, as well as influence of the system on the world, which leads to its destruction and, as a result, to the destruction of somebody who holds the information, but such destruction comes from inside.

In this case, the harmonization of relations between verbal and non-verbal, rational and irrational, discrete and continuum, relevant and potential occur. A situation when natural automatism (self-organization) is substituted by linguistic activity of linguistic personality (organization) rhymes with a situation where the flesh is spiritualized and the spirit is embodied. From this point of view, the idea captured in the Gnostic Gospel of Thomas: “But the kingdom is inside you and outside you” - seems to be more preferable than the similar idea presented in the Gospel of Luke, which can be found in the abridged version. In this context, the cross - one of the main attributes of religious ritual– stands as a reminder of the dual nature of a person and the necessity to overcome it within immanent oppositions adherent to linguistic personality.

In its turn, sinfulness of the action which is connected with violation of the ban on eating fruits from the Tree of Knowledge of Good and Evil can be interpreted as follows. Realization of cognitive activity as an integral component of individual informational system is destructive due to its one-dimensional nature. Outside of actualization of the conceptual system, through which cognitive activity is filled with meaning, ensuring the integrity of a man as part of a whole – natural world surrounding him - their harmonious coexistence is violated, initiating various dissonances: ecological, political, economic, etc. We are apt to think that moving linguistic personality closer to mastering the biblical Word or to the achievement of dimensional tension between verbal (rational, discrete, actual) and non-verbal (irrational, continual, potential) will necessarily suggest:

1. Awareness of the original unity of a man and nature due to their common natural “arrangement” as an individual informational system that functions at the level of continuity in discreteness (God-Father).

2. Acceptance of reality of noosphere (V.I. Vernadsky), marked by continual character (Holy Spirit).

3. Performing process of decoding of verbal elements of the informational system and encoding its non-verbal elements as experience aimed at maintaining full life activity of the language subject consciousness or otherwise -experience of transforming system of information into a conceptual system that functions at the level of discreteness in continuity (God-Son).

Borrowing methodological aspects of linguistic relativity hypothesis, we, as many philosophers of the language, believe that “grammatical models determine perception and investigation of native speakers, and, consequently, the way they see the world, what world is for them and how they see their place in it” (VERETENNIKOV, 2016: 214-215).

Realizing that generally practiced idea of the language as a means of communication nullifies its essential purpose - to initiate the process of meaning formation - it becomes clear why today the ability to distinguish meaning from nonsense, light from darkness, good from evil is not clearly marked. Such situation is a clear evidence of the loss of the human factor in language which is directly related to conscience, professionalism, responsibility. According to I.V. Arnold, “all this threatens the survival of humanity – feral, ecological and atomic apocalypse are awaiting around the corner” (Arnold, 1999:173). In such conditions it is possible to discuss the possibility of salvation and, besides, who can take responsibility for achieving the optimal result?

In our opinion, the answer can be positive if linguistic community begins acting together, overcoming isolation and performing its educational mission. At the same time, everyone should be ready to take responsibility to be sure that the majority understands current situation and remembers that difficulties inevitable on the way to the future will be overcome only by those who come close to understanding at least this initial phrase, from which the dialogue with yourself begins: “At first there was a Word, and God had a Word, and God was the Word”.

Conclusion

Summing up everything mentioned above, we would note that focusing on the initial phrase of the Gospel we, in no way, set the goal of covering all its semantic potential. We

wanted to stress the fact that work with sacred texts in the aspect of language as a system can allow to get closer to the real meaning of messages addressed to modern readers over the darkness of centuries. We suppose that possibility to find the truth in such texts (to which we refer the Torah, the Quran, Tripitaka, the Mahabharata and many others) must become a spiritual goal for a person who has departed from traditional culture and true faith but, nevertheless, continues to be ‘homoverboagens’.

We must agree with the academician Andrey Dmitrievich Sakharov, who insisted that “inner spiritual life of people, internal impulses of their activity are the most difficult phenomena to predict, but on their understanding ultimately depend death and salvation of civilization” (Sakharov, 2011).

References

- ARNOLD, I.V. (1999) Semantics. Stylistics. Intertextuality. St. Petersburg, USSR: Publishing house of St. Petersburg.
- BARYSHNIKOV, P. N. (2016) Cognitive linguistics and philosophy of mind: an explanatory gap in the ontology of linguistic sign. *Epistemology & Philosophy of Science*. vol. 50, no. 4, 119–134. DOI: 10.5840/eps201650474
- BAŞOK, E., & SAYER, P. (2020). Language Ideologies, Language Policies and their Translation into Fiscal Policies in the U.S. Perspectives of Language Education Community Stakeholders. *Journal of Culture and Values in Education*, 3(2), 54-80. <https://doi.org/10.46303/jcve.2020.13>
- BOBYLEVA, N.V. (2010) In the beginning there was music: *Historical and socio-educational thought*. 2 (4), 4-10.
- BOLGOVA E.V. (2021). Connotative Potential of the Vocabulary of the Modern Russian Language (On the Material of Modern Speech Use of Zoonyms of the Thematic Group “Hare-Like Mammals”). *Sovremennye issledovania socialnyh problem* [Modern Studies of Social Issues], vol. 13, no. 1, pp. 130-167, doi: <https://doi.org/10.12731/2077-1770-2021-13-1-130-167>
- BORISOV, E. (2016) How to analyze the sentence "I thought your yacht was larger than it is"? *Epistemology & Philosophy of Science*. vol. 50, no. 4, 21–31. DOI: 10.5840/eps201650463
- CHOMSKY, N. (2011) Language and the cognitive science revolution(s). Text of lecture given at the Carleton University April 8. 2011. Retrieved from <https://www.chomsky.info/talrs/20110408.htm>.
- DONOHUE, D. (2020). Culture, cognition, and college: How do cultural values and theories of intelligence predict students’ intrinsic value for learning?. *Journal of Culture and Values in Education*. <https://doi.org/10.46303/jcve.2020.3>
- GORBATOV, V. (2016) Who was thinking that yacht was larger than it is? *Epistemology & Philosophy of Science*. vol. 50, no. 4, 32–35. DOI: 10.5840/eps201650464
- KAIDAKOV, S.V. (2002) A man in the mirror of ancient philosophy. Moscow, USSR: Labyrinth.
- KARABYKOV, A.V. (2020) Goropius Becanus, the adamic language, and the renaissance mytholinguistics. *Tomsk State University Journal of Cultural Studies and Art History*. 38, 59–73. DOI: 10.17223/2220836/38/

- KURILOVICH, I. S. (2017) Understanding as recognition. *Epistemology & Philosophy of Science*. vol. 54, no. 4, 68–73. DOI: 10.5840/eps20175447
- KUSLIY, P. & VOSTRIKOVA, E. (2016) Rediscovering the logical analysis of language... *Epistemology & Philosophy of Science*. vol. 50, no. 4, 8–20. DOI: 10.5840/eps201650462
- MAKAREVICH, A.V. (2010) In the beginning there was Sound. Small and STORY. Moscow, USSR: Eksmo.
- MIKIRTUMOV, I. B. (2016) Arranging the rigging, or why "object" attitudes do not exist. *Epistemology & Philosophy of Science*. vol. 50, no. 4, 36–43. DOI: 10.5840/eps201650465
- MORGOEVA L.B. (2021). Regulation Potetial of Neutral Vocabulary in the Context of the Author's Ideostyle. *Sovremennye issledovania socialnyh problem* [Modern Studies of Social Issues], vol. 13, no. 2, pp. 129-143, doi: <https://doi.org/10.12731/2077-1770-2021-13-2-129-143>
- NABORSHCHIKOVA, S. & PLISETSKAYA, M.M. (2010) In the beginning there was a gesture. *News*. Retrieved from <https://iz.ru/news/360607>
- NALIMOV, V.V. (2015) Throwing thoughts. On the way and at the crossroads. Moscow, USSR: TsGI-Print.
- NIKIFOROV, A. L. (2016) Is speaking about the transcendental possible? *Epistemology & Philosophy of Science*. vol. 50, no. 4, 98–101 DOI: 10.5840/eps201650472
- NIKIFOROV, A. L. (2017) Linguistic universals in the structure of understanding. *Epistemology & Philosophy of Science*. vol. 54, no. 4, 49–56. DOI: 10.5840/eps201754468
- OGUILVE, V., WEN, W., BOWEN, E., ABOUREHAB, Y., BERMUDEZ, A., GAXIOLA, E., & CASTEK, J. (2021). Community Making: An Expansive View of Curriculum. *Journal Of Curriculum Studies Research*, 3(1), 69-100. <https://doi.org/10.46303/jcsr.2021.8>
- PASHINA L.A. (2021). The Main Research Topics of the Social Aspects of Ageing in a Foreign Science. *Sovremennye issledovania socialnyh problem* [Modern Studies of Social Issues], vol. 13, no. 2, pp. 38-54, doi: <https://doi.org/10.12731/2077-1770-2021-13-2-38-54>
- SAKHAROV, A.D. (2011) Peace in half a century. Retrieved from https://svv1964.blogspot.com/2011/04/blog-post_30.html
- SEARS, R. E. (2017) The naturalness of religious ideas: soundings from the cognitive science of religion. *Epistemology & Philosophy of Science*. vol. 54, no. 4, 82–98. DOI: 10.5840/eps201754474
- SHAKHOVSKIY, V.I. & VOLKOVA P.S. (2020) Language as a System: *Significance and Sense Philological Sciences at MGIMO*. 3 (23), 48-62.
- SHAKHOVSKIY, V.I. & VOLKOVA, P.S. (2019) Sense as a Psycho- and Sociolinguistic Phenomenon *The World of Linguistics and Communication: Electronic Scientific Journal*. 4, 1-26. Retrieved from <https://www.tverlingua.ru>
- SHAKHOVSKIY, V.I. (2008) In the beginning there was ... emotion *The World of Linguistics and Communication: Electronic Scientific Journal*. 11, 19-23.
- SMAGARINSKAYA, O. & EIFMAN, B. (2017) In the beginning there was a gesture from the Literary and Art Magazine “Etazhi”. Retrieved from <https://etazhi-lit.ru/publishing...v-nachale-by-l-zhest.html>
- USTIN, A.K. & USTINA, N.V. (2013) *Culturosphere*. Moscow, USSR: Institute of Social Pedagogy
- VERETENNIKOV, A. A. (2016) Mind and language in the work of B. Whorf. *Epistemology & Philosophy of Science*. vol. 50, no. 4, 214–219 DOI: 10.5840/eps201650480
- VILLANUEVA, E. (2016) Argument and metaphysics. *Epistemology & Philosophy of Science*. vol. 50, no. 4, 94–97. DOI: 10.5840/eps201650471
- VOLKOVA, P.S. (2017) Language and speech in the space of culture: interpretation and reinterpretation: *Bulletin of Volgograd State University*. 16 (4), 207-214. DOI: <https://doi.org/10.15688/jvolsu2.2017.4.20>

ZHINKIN, N.I. (1998) From the article “Sound communication system of monkeys”. In G.N. Shelogurova & I.V. Peshkov, *Language. Speech. Creativity* (pp. 36-42). Moscow, USSR: Labyrinth .