

Volume 7, Number 2



Educación de las clases populares: La Sociedad de Instrucción Popular en el
Extremo Norte de Chile (1914-1924)– Elías Pizarro, Raúl Bustos González 104

Memorias Adaptables para la Construcción de Identidades Colectivas– Lucas
Bietti 124

Articles

Slavery in a Remote but Global Place: the British East India Company and
Bencoolen, 1685-1825– Richard B. Allen 150

The Historical Effects of Centralization of Egyptian Islamic Higher Education–
Mohammed Sabrin 177

A History of childhood– Marta Font 198

Reviews

Pedagogy of Oppressed– Nerea Gutiérrez Fernández 201

Instructions for authors, subscriptions and further details:

<http://hse.hipatiapress.com>

Educación de las clases populares: La Sociedad de Instrucción Popular en el Extremo Norte de Chile (1914-1924)

Elías Pizarro¹ y Raúl Bustos González¹

1) Universidad de Tarapacá. Chile

Date of publication: June 23th, 2018

Edition period: June 2018-October 2018

To cite this article: Pizarro, E., y Bustos González, R. (2018) Educación de las clases populares: La Sociedad de Instrucción Popular en el Extremo Norte de Chile (1914-1924). *Social and Education History*, 7(2), 104-124. doi: 10.17583/hse.2018.3039

To link this article: <http://dx.doi.org/10.17583/hse.2018.3039>

PLEASE SCROLL DOWN FOR ARTICLE

The terms and conditions of use are related to the Open Journal System and to [Creative Commons Attribution License \(CCAL\)](#).

For Teaching and Welfare of the Working Classes: Popular Instruction Society in the Extreme North of Chile (1914-1924)

Elías Pizarro
Universidad de Tarapacá

Raúl Bustos González
Universidad de Tarapacá

Abstract

The purpose of this article is to introduce the contributions of the "Society of Popular Instruction" to the promotion of teaching in the far north of Chile, highlighting the emphasis and concern that had this institution with the popular classes and the work recognized as an ally of the Chilean State in the task of its deployment in the area. Thus, through the review of primary and secondary sources, the action is motivated by the coincidence of principles between a particular group of civil society and the newly installed state in a region incorporated as a result of military expansion. Particularly review the actions aimed at night schools for men and women, schools for proletarians and public lectures, the latter being another way of educating the people through the diffusion of culture, letters and knowledge, as the road to progress.

Keywords: Teaching, Popular Classes, Popular Instruction Society, extreme north of Chile.

Educación de las Clases Populares: La Sociedad de Instrucción Popular en el Extremo Norte de Chile (1914-1924)

Elías Pizarro
Universidad de Tarapacá

Raúl Bustos González
Universidad de Tarapacá

Resumen

El propósito de este artículo es conocer los aportes de la “Sociedad de Instrucción Popular” para el fomento de la enseñanza en el extremo norte de Chile, destacando el énfasis y preocupación que tuvo dicha institución con las clases populares y la labor reconocida como aliado del Estado chileno en la tarea de su implantación en la zona. De esta manera, a través de la revisión de fuentes primarias y secundarias, se expone la acción motivada por la coincidencia de principios entre un grupo particular de la sociedad civil y el Estado, recién instalado en una región incorporada como resultado de la expansión militar. De manera particular se revisa las acciones orientadas a los establecimientos de escuelas nocturnas para hombres y mujeres, escuela para proletarios y las conferencias públicas, siendo estas últimas, otra forma de educar al pueblo a través de la difusión de la cultura, las letras y el conocimiento, como el camino hacia el progreso.

Palabras clave: Enseñanza, Clases Populares, Sociedad de Instrucción Popular, extremo norte de Chile.



A partir de 1880, el Estado Chileno se va a ser presente en el extremo norte del actual territorio nacional como consecuencia de la Guerra del Pacífico (1879-1883), que enfrenta a Chile con Perú y Bolivia. Con el propósito de poner fin al conflicto, Chile firmó con el Perú el Tratado de Paz y Amistad del 20 de octubre de 1883, conocido generalmente con el nombre de Tratado de Ancón y en el que se establecían las condiciones de la paz. Por dicho tratado, la República del Perú cedió a Chile perpetua e incondicionalmente el territorio de la provincia de Tarapacá. En cuanto a los territorios de Tacna y Arica, estos continuarían poseídos por Chile durante diez años, al término de los cuales un plebiscito decidiría el definitivo la suerte de estos, estableciendo una circunstancia singular en lo que es la solución de conflictos.

Por otro lado, en el contexto de la época, la modernidad decimonónica impregnaba de un liberalismo triunfante a las estructuras políticas y sociales aceptadas por las élites dominantes, el que tendrá como pilares básicos: “Progreso económico y social y libertad política”; este será estilo de conducta que Chile planificó establecer en Tacna y Arica (Galdames et. al., 1981, p.105; Aguirre y Mondaca, 2011, p.6-9). Para el caso específico de la ciudad de Arica, las primeras disposiciones del Estado chileno, se manifestaron a través de un conjunto de decretos emitidos por las autoridades militares encabezadas por Manuel Baquedano (Agosto, 1880), que buscaban restablecer el orden que aparecía difuso como consecuencia de la ausencia de las autoridades peruanas. Seguidamente, la tarea fue organizar administrativamente los nuevos territorios, asignándoles una nueva demarcación, a semejanza del resto de Chile, tal cual lo establecía la Constitución Política de 1833. En consecuencia, en Octubre de 1884 se crea la provincia de Tacna, constituida por los Departamentos de Tacna y Arica y posteriormente, en Noviembre de 1885, la recién creada provincia se dividirá en subdelegaciones y distritos (Palacios, 1974; Pizarro y Díaz, 2008). Dentro de estas contextualidades, los territorios del extremo norte pasaron a configurar una nueva frontera político-administrativa, que adquirió un rico dinamismo en los aspectos sociales, culturales e identitarios, que excedieron aquella tradicional marca que imponían los límites políticos con la vecina república del Perú (Cavagnaro, 2016). Bajo esta perspectiva, vemos un Estado que asume un papel transnacional como efecto de la guerra y que por

la extensión del período de ocupación, resulta inédito en la historia Latinoamericana. Como ya se dijo, eran tiempos en que Chile y Perú, se encontraban sin resolución definitiva del problema de Tacna y Arica, sin embargo, para los primeros estas contextualidades no fueron impedimento para desarrollar acciones y tomar decisiones político-administrativas que proyectaran la presencia del nuevo Estado (Cavieres, 2015, p.9-10).

El presente estudio pretende ser un aporte al conocimiento de la historia local y su relación con el devenir histórico nacional. En virtud de lo descrito, el método de investigación empleado es el heurístico-hermenéutico, para un apropiado manejo de las fuentes escritas, sin embargo se propone una mirada deductiva-inductiva, pues no es posible conocer y explicarnos la historia local si no partimos del conocimiento de la historia nacional. En términos más concretos se propone un discurso cronológico que permita conectar eficientemente los acontecimientos locales con el acontecer del país en el período de estudio.

De manera más precisa, se propone rescatar la obra de la Sociedad de Instrucción Popular en pro de la educación de las clases populares de la nueva frontera, particularmente porque dicha tarea fue relevada, avalada y promovida por el Estado chileno, en virtud de la coincidencia de objetivos entre este y dicho colectivo. Sin embargo, al resolverse definitivamente la suerte de los antiguos territorios peruanos anexados como consecuencia de la Guerra del Pacífico, a través del Tratado de 1929 y sin mediar el plebiscito propuesto anteriormente como estrategia que definiera el destino de dichos territorios, las especiales atenciones del Estado hacia la zona comienzan a diluirse, entre ellos el interés por la educación popular. Desde ese momento, la tarea educadora de la Sociedad de Instrucción Popular continuó pero de manera más invisibilizada y sin la alianza explícita que se había establecido con el Estado chileno.

Los estudios históricos de la zona en comento, permanentemente ha sido representada como la llegada del “Progreso “ al extremo norte de Chile, como tarea que el vencedor de la Guerra del Pacífico se definió, tal vez justificando su expansión por la zona (Bustos y Pizarro, 2016). Como consecuencia de dicha representación, el Estado chileno asume como su tarea la imposición del orden y modernidad, y lo ha expresado permanentemente en los textos de historia tradicionalmente empleados en la educación pública nacional (Valdivieso, 2007). El concepto con el que

generalmente se ha conocido este proceso es el nombre de “Chilenización” (González, 2002), dando forma a un mito de superioridad de la nación vencedora (Bustos, 2013), en virtud de su “misión modernizadora” de la zona. El análisis de este período en la historia regional y nacional, ha despertado la curiosidad intelectual desde nuevas perspectivas conceptuales, dando origen a una serie de estudios de interés para la historia social de la educación en la zona. A la clásica y consultada obra “Historia de Arica” (Galdames et. al., 1981), se incorporan a contar de la última década del siglo XX, renovados círculos académicos que comienzan a definir el extremo norte como un “espacio fronterizo” abordable desde los campos de estudio de la Historia Regional, instalando nuevos referentes teóricos y metodológicos para el abordaje de diversas problemáticas históricas. De allí entonces, hoy se incorporan como temáticas de análisis la acción de diferentes agentes educativos, la presencia de políticas modernizadoras pre y post ocupación chilena, instituciones y mecanismos de control social, capítulos de violencia manifiesta y simbólica, delincuencia, imaginarios nacionales y locales, disciplinamiento social, entre otras. Al respecto, es de interés la reciente publicación el libro: “Tiempos Violentos. Fragmentos de Historia Social en Arica” (Díaz, Galdames y Ruz, 2014). A nivel nacional, los trabajos de León (2001) en la frontera araucana en Chile durante el siglo XIX, que sugieren algunas comparaciones sobre los avances del ya mencionado proceso “chilenizador” que buscaba incorporar estas tierras a la soberanía y jurisdicción del Estado chileno, a través del desarrollo de instituciones políticas, administrativas, económicas y sociales existentes en el resto del país.

En particular, en lo relativo al período y región en estudio, la labor del Estado como agente “modernizador” fue explícita. Al respecto, es necesario señalar que el gobierno central de Santiago en reiteradas oportunidades emitió una serie de circulares al personal administrativo chileno de la Provincia de Tacna siendo persistente en recordar que su tarea debe ser inspirada, de acuerdo a los preceptos de la época en estudio, en la más estricta y elevada moralidad y el respeto profundo a las leyes y a la disciplina. Sin embargo, esto no bastaba y era necesario: *que la moralidad pública vaya acompañada de la moralidad privada y sostenida por ella y que cada chileno quiera mostrar en su persona y en su hogar la altura moral que corresponde a las tradiciones de nuestro país* (AHVD 45). Díaz

(2006) logra identificar en la prensa chilena y documentos oficiales de fines del siglo XIX y comienzos del XX, el sentir de la élite nacional, en torno a la responsabilidad y compromiso asumido en la preservación de la nacionalidad.

Las primeras iniciativas del Estado chileno para la ejecución del proyecto descrito y la incorporación efectiva de la zona al Estado, fue la promulgación de la Ley de Colonización, herramienta con la que se buscaba impulsar la inmigración de familias chilenas a la zona recientemente incorporada al territorio, incentivando este desplazamiento con una serie de garantías. Esta iniciativa se consideraba estratégica, especialmente ante la incertidumbre del destino final de la zona, por lo que se requería incrementar el número de ciudadanos chilenos que pudieran votar en el eventual plebiscito que virtualmente establecería la suerte de los territorios en litigio (Tacna y Arica). Por otro lado, se tenía el convencimiento en el Estado de Chile que la llegada de familias chilenas era la mejor alternativa para el logro de los objetivos propuestos: “Sr. Ministro (...) he llegado a la conclusión que no podría haber chilenización sin arraigar familias chilenas a su suelo (...) Ninguna medida llegará a tener buen resultado como la colonización con familias agriculturas chilenas” (AHVD 48).

El fenómeno antes descrito insinúa los profundos desafíos que conlleva la implementación material de la idea dominante de la época. En este contexto, lo que se suele llamar “Chilenización” era interpretado como la implantación en la zona de un modo de vida particular e inspirado en los valores “modernos”. Por otro lado, la tarea modernizadora del estado de Chile se ve reflejada en una serie de medidas tanto políticas como materiales, entre las que se consideraba acciones en las esferas de educativa, de urbanidad, salubridad y servicio público.

Las manifestaciones concretas de las tensiones que emergen de este proceso, han sido profusamente analizadas en obras como las de Díaz y Ruz (2009), y Mondaca (2008), dejando en evidencia los nudos críticos del período en estudio. El centro de estas tensiones se puede hallar en los conflictos simbólicos y materiales emergentes de las actividades de instauración de un modelo de sociedad que prometía el “progreso”, encarnando la “modernidad”. Sin embargo, en el contexto de un conflicto bélico, bajo la figura de todavía presente de los “enemigos”, estas iniciativas se presentaron como la segunda parte de una guerra entre naciones, que a los

ojos de la élite chilena, enfrentaba modos de vida. Este proceso es descrito por McEvoy (2005, p. 205) como *corporizar en territorio extranjero la imagen de Chile*, y es acompañado con una política para relevar la acción del Estado chileno en el territorio anexado como resultado de la Guerra del Pacífico, presentándolo como protagonista central de este proceso. Como contrapartida se busca minimizar la obra modernizadora ejecutada durante el período de dominio peruano de la zona.¹

Como consecuencia de lo arriba descrito, y en virtud de la implementación de las instancias político-administrativas, el gobierno central pensó en mejorar la Instrucción Pública de dichos territorios (López, 1977; González, 2002; Egaña, 2000). Precursoras investigaciones como las de Díaz y Pizarro (1999), Pizarro (2000), Pizarro y Ríos (2000) bajo el auspicio de la Dirección de Investigación y Postgrado de la Universidad de Tarapacá, han permitido hasta la fecha, historiar fenómenos coyunturales y procesos que, a partir de problemas sociales particulares, permitan visualizar las constantes y las variables dentro de la Historia Regional del extremo norte de Chile.

Sociedad Normalizada y Modernidad

La incorporación de la modernidad en las sociedades latinoamericanas, reflejan de manera clara la convivencia de un sistema consensuado de normas, que ha sido interpretado como consecuencia de la racionalización de la realidad y que se conoce como “Sociedad Normalizada” (Romero, 1976). Lo anterior, siguiendo un desarrollo ideológico y estructural que tiende a la homogeneización (Richard, 1989), lo que se expresa en la categorización de la sociedad, resultado de la acción de la racionalidad como camino al progreso y ente regulador y universalizante.

La racionalidad moderna requiere, entre otras cosas, de la tecnificación de la sociedad que lleve a la consecuente eficiencia burocrática y tecnológica. Esta trayectoria es interpretada generalmente como el devenir de la civilización, de la mano del desarrollo del progreso moderno. Foucault, ya planteaba la necesidad de analizar el proceso racionalizador en diferentes esferas de la vida social, asumiéndolo como un proceso anterior a la misma Ilustración (Sauquillo, 1987) y que se vincula a la conformación de estructuras de poder que intentan permanentemente organizar el universo,

para lo que los sistemas educativos cumplen un rol fundamental, en virtud del fin último de esta dinámica, a saber “la producción histórica del hombre útil, uniforme y predecible” (Sauquillo, 1987, p. 190).

Sin embargo, es necesario subrayar que en la perspectiva del autor mencionado, el Estado es un componente más de la estructura de dominación descrita, junto a la familia y la religión, entre otras. Cada una de estas entidades conformarían una estructura de poderes asociados al acceso a los recursos y el control de los razonamientos y las conductas de los individuos (Sauquillo, 1987). Este proceso en la mayoría de las veces obedece a una dialéctica de alternancia o simultaneidad entre fenómenos de inclusión – integración o exclusión (Morales y Molina, 2003).

Escuela Pública en el Extremo Norte de Chile

Michel Foucault (1976) describe como parte constitutiva de la modernidad la presencia de procesos de disciplinamiento, en el que las instituciones educativas se convierten en uno de los actores preponderantes de dichas acciones, que institucionalmente promueve paulatinamente la incorporación del Estado, como agente activo, reemplazando el rol de otras instituciones, como la Iglesia o la familia, en su rol como entidades educadoras. Los Estados latinoamericanos del siglo XIX (o mejor dicho los grupos que los encarnaban), pensaban que a través de imposición de la urbanidad y buenas maneras se avanzaba hacia el progreso y la modernidad (Bustos, 2013). A partir de entonces, emerge el ideal de Educación Pública y Estado Docente, considerado como requisito fundamental para llegar a la modernidad y progreso social, político y económico. Esta concepción positiva del liberalismo decimonónico se traduce en el precepto de “educar al soberano”:

El Ministro de Instrucción Pública se esforzará en conseguir recursos para dotar de escuelas al país, y también por la creación en las actuales escuelas normales de cursos rápidos, de uno o dos años de duración para dar solución al millón 200 mil analfabetos adultos: se es absolutamente urgente transformarlos en ciudadanos útiles (Diario El Ferrocarril, 27 de Junio de 1918, p. 3.)

Como se puede leer en la anterior cita, el rol del ciudadano como parte de la sociedad moderna requiere de la educación del mismo y de la incorporación de los ideales y efectos materiales del progreso, transformando la actividad educadora del Estado como una misión trascendente que legitima acciones como la incorporación militar del territorio, transformando esta representación, en el principal eslogan ante un eventual plebiscito. El concepto “ciudadanos útiles”, es por sí solo indicador de la tarea civilizadora que el Estado chileno alega como propia y como razón inapelable de la legitimación de su dominio en la zona, la que se vería confirmada mediante una virtual consulta plebiscitaria. Es por esta razón que la administración del Estado chileno promueve de variadas facilidades para que cada vez más estudiantes pudieran ser atendidos e incorporados a la labor educativa, incentivando el nacimiento de organismos colaboradores en esta tarea, como por ejemplo:

la Liga Protectora de Estudiantes Pobres en conformidad a acuerdos tomados por la Sociedad de Instrucción Popular (...) institución muy requerida en Arica que presta ayuda moral y pecuniaria a jóvenes dotados de capacidad (...) estas corporaciones existen en todos los pueblos, aún en los menos importantes que Arica²

Es necesario reiterar que además de entregar las condiciones para la implementación del modelo modernizador, lo que el Estado de Chile pretendía era supervalorar su acción, minimizando los avances que en este sentido había iniciado al Estado peruano (Mondaca, 2008). Al respecto, es necesario señalar que, desde el punto de vista educacional, durante la administración peruana desde mediados del siglo XIX, solamente existían en la zona algunas escuelas elementales financiadas por el Municipio. En forma reiterada, las fuentes históricas dejan al descubierto las peticiones de los vecinos de Arica y sus distritos rurales (Lluta, Codpa, Belén, Putre y Socoroma) a las autoridades políticas pertinentes, donde manifiestan la necesidad de creación de nuevas escuelas. Hacia 1878, Arica y las zonas rurales presentaban un total de 9 escuelas (Díaz et. al., 2012, p.179). Las primeras escuelas chilenas aparecen en Arica a mediados de 1880, en un comienzo como iniciativas de particulares y luego bajo la responsabilidad estatal, como una respuesta a las condiciones deplorable de las escuelas

públicas peruanas. Así, por ejemplo, el 22 de enero de 1886 la vecina Matilde Bello, solicitaba autorización “para que se le permita abrir una escuela particular de instrucción para niños, permiso que fue concedido con el mérito de las firmas que abonan la moralidad i buenas costumbres de la solicitante” (AHVD, 289). Parece ser que instruir a la población local era una necesidad imperiosa, meses más tarde don Fernando Ramírez solicitaba a las autoridades respectivas *que se le permita abrir en este puerto una escuela particular de hombres* dicha autorización fue concedida con fecha 17 de mayo de 1886.² (AHVD, 289). En 1907, se crea la Escuela Superior de Hombres y en 1908 la Escuela Superior de Mujeres. En la misma década se sumarán una escuela elemental urbana y ocho rurales, las cuales hacían en conjunto a comienzos de 1920, una matrícula de 950 alumnos (Varas, 1922, p.101).

La enseñanza secundaria, tendrá una postergación en el tiempo, principalmente por causa de la pobreza y escasa población del Departamento (Galdames et. al., 1981; Becerra et. al., 2000).³ Recién, por Decreto del 13 de Abril de 1909, que creaba el Instituto Comercial de Arica, el cual empezó sus clases el 15 de marzo de 1910 (Vera, 1924) y el Liceo de Niñas en 1915. A comienzos de la década de 1920, funcionaban con una matrícula de 200 alumnas y 180 alumnos respectivamente (Varas, 1922: 101). Toda la acción educativa era cautelada por el Ministerio de Justicia e Instrucción Pública que a través de los Visitadores de Escuelas, subordinados al Intendente, debían conocer el estado de la enseñanza y los problemas que aquejaban a las escuelas dentro de la provincia. (Pizarro y Díaz, 2006; González, 2002, 2004; Figueroa y Silva, 2011).

Las escuelas peruanas que habían sido permitidas, sufrirán los efectos de una dura medida a partir de mayo de 1900, cuando el Estado chileno ordena la clausura de 16 centros educativos en los departamentos de Tacna y Arica. Frente a tan grave medida, la población peruana iniciará interesantes procesos de resistencia desde los espacios domésticos y escuelas clandestinas que funcionarán secretamente en el Departamento (Choque, 2015, p. 128).

A partir de 1914, las instituciones educativas administradas por el Estado chileno en los territorios ocupados, van a contar con la estrecha colaboración de la “Sociedad de Instrucción Popular” la cual nace como una corporación

de beneficencia pública que “tendría como finalidad fomentar la educación del pueblo por todos los medios posibles.”⁴

En el Club de la Unión

Era la noche del día Sábado 6 de junio de 1914 y en los salones del Club de la Unión se escuchaban las voces de algunos entusiastas vecinos de la sociedad ariqueña que decidían echar las bases de una Sociedad de Instrucción Popular que tendría por objeto difundir la educación y la instrucción de las clases populares (*Diario “El Ferrocarril, Junio de 1914*). Los responsables de esta reunión estaban ligados a la Logia Masónica “Morro de Arica” que funcionaba reglamentariamente en la ciudad desde 1916, creando y promoviendo iniciativas de bien público en la ciudad, tal cual, lo venía realizando la Masonería en el resto del país (Velez y Castex, 1972, p. 257; Veritas, 1920, p.36-40). Se procedió también a designar el directorio que estuvo compuesto en esa oportunidad por: Julio Lagos de la Fuente (Presidente), Abraham Vera Y. (Vice-presidente), Manuel Araya (Secretario), Jorge Finlayson (Tesorero) y los directores Conrado Ríos, Manuel Ballivián, Víctor Reyes, Guillermo Garay y Antonio Torres, algunos meses después se le concedía la Personalidad Jurídica a la Sociedad por Decreto Supremo núm.7 99 del 13 de Abril de 1915 (Vera, 1924).

Comprometidos con los acuerdos tomados y consecuentemente con los preceptos teóricos modernos, se comenzó la inmediata tarea de fundar una escuela nocturna para obreros que debía comenzar sus labores a la brevedad. Igualmente por esos días se intercambiaron interesantes cartas con el gobernador de Arica, don Luis Arteaga, con el propósito de lograr de este último algunas facilidades.

Escuela Nocturna para Hombres “Diego Barros Arana”

El 22 de Junio de 1914 comenzaba su funcionamiento la primera escuela nocturna para hombres “Diego Barros Arana”, que ocupa en ese entonces un local de una escuela fiscal que quedaba en la calle Ayacucho (Yungay) núm. 66. Posteriormente, en el año 1916 se trasladó a otro edificio, ubicado en la calle 28 de Julio (Sotomayor) números 456 a 464. Para el año 1927 este establecimiento funcionaba en Sotomayor núm. 321 (AHVD, 243).

Esta escuela obedecía a la necesidad de instruir a los gremios obreros de la ciudad. Al respecto, es importante destacar que el llamamiento inicial que se hace a la comunidad con el propósito de poder matricular a los alumnos tuvo tal éxito, que la matrícula tuvo que cerrarse ante la estrechez del local que no daba cabida para más de 40 alumnos (Diario “El Ferrocarril”, Junio 23 de 1914). Los exámenes preliminares hicieron que en la escuela funcionaran dos secciones, una superior y otra inferior, quedando ambas a cargo de competentes profesores normalistas.⁵ La sección inferior para analfabetos entregaba los conocimientos elementales de aritmética, lectura, escritura y deberes cívicos. La segunda sección daba mayor complejidad en los mismos ramos y además comprendía una clase especial de dibujo, e incluso se dictó un curso de inglés práctico para los obreros adultos. Notoria importancia le fue concedida a la Historia y Geografía de Chile, pues se recordaban las grandes gestas nacionales a través de conferencias especiales, que *tenían en vista fines superiores de civismo y de cultivo del amor a la tierra natal* (Diario “El Ferrocarril”, junio 23 de 1914; Vera, 1924, p.183-4). El 29 de enero de 1915, por iniciativa de la Sociedad de Instrucción Popular se aprobó el Reglamento Interno y los Planes de Estudio para esta escuela nocturna (Diario “El Ferrocarril”, enero 30 de 1915; Vera, 1924, p.191 y ss.).

Escuela Nocturna para Mujeres “José Victorino Lastarria”

En Septiembre de 1916 a petición de uno de los directores, Sr. Ríos, se acordó el ingreso de las señoras a la Sociedad de Instrucción Popular (Diario “El Ferrocarril”, Septiembre 26 de 1914). Igualmente se procedió a abrir la Escuela Nocturna para Mujeres, que llevó por nombre “José Victorino Lastarria”, porque en esos días se honraba en Santiago la memoria de aquel gran literato y ciudadano (Vera, 1924, p.185). Esta escuela admitía niñas y adultas de 12 a 25 años, aunque también asistieron mujeres de hasta 40 años y que en su mayoría no sabían leer ni escribir. Comenzó a funcionar en el primer local de la escuela nocturna Diego Barros Arana, para trasladarse más tarde a calle General Lagos núm. 429 en los altos y hacia 1927 estaba funcionando en calle Colón núm. 430 (AHVD, 243). Las alumnas eran atendidas como su similar de hombres por destacadas profesoras

normalistas ⁶ que impartían los conocimientos de lectura, escritura, aritmética, costura, tejidos y bordados, la enseñanza era enteramente gratuita y se daba durante una hora todas las noches (*Diario “El Ferrocarril”, Octubre 12 de 1917*).

Escuela para Proletarios “Pedro Bannen”

En Febrero de 1917 y después de una amplia discusión entre los miembros de la Sociedad de Instrucción Popular quedó establecido que era indispensable fundar pronto una escuela para “proletarios”⁷ (*Diario “El Ferrocarril”, Febrero 10 de 1917*). El compromiso con esta tarea llevó a que finalmente se acordara para el Lunes 2 de abril de 1917 la apertura de clases en dicha escuela que iba a ser mixta y admitía niñas y niños menores de 12 años, analfabetos y como decía la prensa local era para niños que carecen de todo recurso para asistir a las escuelas fiscales,...se va sin ninguna de las exigencias que tienen las escuelas diurnas, con esto se quiere llamar la atención de las familias desvalidas que ahora no tienen pretexto alguno para educar a sus hijos. Este establecimiento ocuparía el mismo local de la escuela Diego Barros Arana pero en la jornada diurna (*Diario “El Ferrocarril”, Marzo 29 de 1917*). Algunas de las maestras que se desempeñaron en este establecimiento eran las señoras Teresa Ramírez de Molina, Blanca Astudillo Lemonier, Emilia A. de Maldonado y Teresa Quiroz.

Revisando algunos datos estadísticos de las escuelas sostenidas por la Sociedad de Instrucción Popular en Septiembre de 1917, se observa que la escuela nocturna de mujeres tenía una asistencia superior a 20 alumnas, la nocturna de hombres una asistencia en el curso de analfabetos de 18 alumnos, el inferior de 13 alumnos y el superior de 15 alumnos. La escuela de proletarios con una matrícula de 20 niños y 10 niñas (*Diario “El Ferrocarril”, Septiembre 15 de 1917*). No obstante, en 1923 la matrícula subió a más de 60 en cada una de las escuelas nocturnas y a más de 25 en la escuela de proletarios “educando la Sociedad un total de 150 alumnos” (*Vera, 1924, p. 189*).

Las Conferencias Públicas

La Sociedad de Instrucción Popular también puso énfasis en la “Extensión Secundaria”, considerada como otra forma de difundir la cultura, de llevar las letras y el conocimiento a las masas populares, y en el fondo, otra forma de educar al pueblo. Durante toda su labor, se realizaron una serie de interesantes conferencias y disertaciones públicas sobre los más variados temas: efemérides patrias, ahorro, temperancia, enfermedades de trascendencia social, sobre el paludismo, etc. Realizaban estas exposiciones públicas los integrantes de la Sociedad, importantes vecinos de la ciudad y algunas visitas ilustres que por aquellos años se encontraban en la ciudad. Se hacía la difusión de las conferencias por medio de la prensa invitando a la comunidad y a los alumnos y se utilizaban los mismos recintos que poseía la Sociedad. En particular, todas las conferencias que se ofrecían, eran dictadas en horario nocturno. Por ejemplo entre Julio y Agosto de 1914, dictaron conferencias: el profesor Abraham Vera⁸ sobre “las ventajas del ahorro”, el Dr. Conrado Ríos sobre “el Paludismo(tercianas), modo de evitarlo y curarlo”, el diputado Guillermo Bañados H. se refirió a la “Importancia de las escuelas nocturnas y educación de la voluntad” y el capitán don Daniel Valenzuela basó su tema en los “deberes cívicos en general” (cariño por la tierra natal ,la patria, obediencia a la leyes, etc.).

Otras Realizaciones

La labor de la Sociedad de Instrucción Popular fue muy extensa, y si bien no podemos desarrollar in extenso otros aportes de esta institución, tampoco podemos dejar de mencionar la creación de la “Biblioteca Pública”, que era una de las mejores del norte (1917), la Liga Protectora de Estudiantes (1919), la Brigada de Boy Scouts (1912), y la formación de un pequeño Museo Regional (1922), “el cual serviría para turistas que deseen informarse sobre la cultura y tradiciones pasadas de nuestra ciudad” ([Diario “El Ferrocarril”, Abril 27 de 1922](#)).

Conclusiones

A lo largo de esta contribución se ha podido describir desde una perspectiva histórica, un fragmento particular de lo que fue la presencia de la escuela chilena en los espacios fronterizos del extremo norte de Chile entre 1914-1924. Especialmente se ha ejemplificado lo descrito a través de la Sociedad de Instrucción Popular y todas sus contribuciones, lo que la transformó en un agente más que colabora al Estado Chileno en la misión de consolidar la Instrucción Pública en los territorios ocupados.

El presente trabajo historiográfico asume la misión de insertar lo regional, en los tiempos y los espacios de la historia nacional, pero cuidando de no caer en narrativas regionalistas que han acabado “reproduciendo en muchos casos a escala local los ejes centrales de las historias nacionales que decían combatir” (Pérez, 2014, p.12).

Desde esta perspectiva, el período comprendido entre 1880 y 1929 despierta profundo interés para la historiografía regional, y asume singularidad particularmente en razón de que representa uno de los hitos fundacionales del carácter asumido por la frontera norte de Chile durante el siglo XX. La incorporación de los territorios anexados como consecuencia de la Guerra del Pacífico a la geografía política nacional, da forma a uno de los más relevantes desafíos a los que ha sido sometido la vocación homogeneizadora de la modernidad como modelo de acción del Estado del Chile de fines del siglo XIX y comienzos del XX.

En síntesis, la llegada del estado de Chile a la zona en estudio, se conforma como una misión “civilizadora”, imponiendo el “progreso” como credencial promotora de la deseada aceptación de la población local para incorporarse y formar parte de la nación triunfante, en virtud de la virtual decisión del destino de la zona, que inicialmente dependería de un plebiscito que nunca finalmente nunca se realizó. Es así como, de alguna manera, la “Chilenización” se presenta como un proyecto identificado con la naturaleza universalista del paradigma moderno. En este contexto, la labor educativa fue considerada estratégica y tarea fundamental del Estado chileno, para lo que contó con aliados en la sociedad civil, gracias a la coincidencia de principios orientadores, como lo fue la Sociedad de Instrucción Popular.

Sin embargo, desde el análisis histórico contemporáneo, podemos ensayar distintas aproximaciones al momento de visitar nuestro pasado;

distintas formas de producir historiografía reconociendo la existencia de una historia nacional que permite la identificación con la nación, sin excluir identificaciones regionales o supranacionales paralelas. En estos múltiples anclajes de trabajos históricos regionales, Cavieres (2006, p.14) señala que: “Podemos ser de Arica-Tacna, o podemos ser americanos, sin dejar de ser chilenos o peruanos. Para la historia nacional, lo más importante, siguiendo a Ferro, es tener claridad sobre cuál debe ser la función que le cabe a la historia”.

Esta contribución es resultado del Proyecto Mayor de Investigación Científica y Tecnológica de la Universidad de Tarapacá 2017: “Estado, Fiscalidad y Escuela Pública: Control político-social en una región de frontera, 1884-1910” *Código* 5751-17. Se agradece el apoyo del Convenio Marco, Formación Inicial Docente, UTA1756.

Notas

¹ Sobre este tema existe abundante producción historiográfica, entre las que destacamos las siguientes: Palacios (1974); Calderón (2000); Pons (1999).

² 1919, Agosto 11. El Ferrocarril, p. 4.

³ El censo levantado el 26 de noviembre de 1885, le asignaba al Departamento de Arica, una población de 9208 habitantes. El Censo de 1895, contabiliza al Departamento de Arica, con 7641 habitantes, siendo la población urbana un total de 3.027. El censo levantado el 28 de noviembre de 1907, entregada al Departamento de Arica, una cantidad de 2927 habitantes (Díaz, 2000; Dagnino, 1925).

⁴ Según Artículo Primero de los Estatutos de la “Sociedad de Instrucción Popular” (Vera, 1924, p. 179).

⁵ Algunos de estos profesores fueron Adolfo Rojas S., Diego Ormazábal, Arturo Valenzuela, Adrián Zuñiga, Miguel Ahumada, Carlos Grebe y Horacio Villalobos.

⁶ Figuraron entre las maestras: Julia Cerda de Drake, Jovina Naranjo de Zuñiga, Eloisa Contreras de Ahumada y Berta Cabello.

⁷ Concepto muy recurrente al contexto histórico vinculado a la “cuestión social” que vive el país. Mayores detalles en Debes, 1999, p. 66 y ss.

⁸ Puede considerarse el más destacado miembro de la Sociedad de Instrucción Popular, reelegido presidente en muchas oportunidades a partir de 1915. Chileno, nacido en San Felipe el 25 de junio de 1881, bachiller en Filosofía y Humanidades y Profesor de Estado Historia y Geografía (1900) fue además director del Instituto Comercial de Arica (1918-1925). Datos

biográficos del referenciado pueden encontrarse en su mismo libro: Labor educacional Chilena en Arica (1924, p. 78-79).

Bibliografía

- Aguirre C., y Mondaca C. (2011). Estado Nacional y Comunidad Andina. Disciplinamiento y articulación social en Arica, 1880-1929. *Historia*, I(4), 5-50. Doi: <http://dx.doi.org/10.4067/S0717-71942011000100001>
- Becerra J., Álvarez, R., y Olivares, A. (2000). *Antecedentes educacionales en el Departamento de Arica durante los años 1880 a 1923*. (Tesis inédita para optar al Título de profesor de Historia y Geografía). Universidad de Tarapacá, Arica.
- Bustos, R. (2013). El Concepto “Chilenización” y Las Relaciones Chileno-Peruanas. *Nueva Corónica*, 2, 421-438.
- Bustos, R. y Pizarro, E. (2016). “Chilenizando” chilenos: Notas para el estudio de la Normalización de Arica (1880-1929). *Revista Tiempo y Espacio*, XXXV(66), 217-233.
- Calderón, F. (2000). *El Tratado De 1929. La Otra Historia*. Lima: Fondo Editorial Del Congreso De Perú.
- Cavagnaro, L. (2016). Arica y Tacna: Una sociedad fronteriza. En E. Cavieres (comp) *La historia y la Escuela: Integración en la triple frontera: Bolivia, Chile y Perú*. Arica: Ediciones Universidad de Tarapacá.
- Cavieres, E. (2006). *Chile-Perú, La historia y la escuela. Conflictos nacionales, percepciones sociales*. Valparaíso: Ediciones Universitarias de Valparaíso.
- Cavieres, E. (2015). Ni vencedores ni vencidos. La Guerra del Pacífico como análisis de conflicto y no del conflicto en sí mismo (Prólogo) En E. Cavieres, J. Chaupis, (edits). *La Guerra del Pacífico en perspectiva histórica. Reflexiones y proyecciones en pasado y en el presente*. Arica: Ediciones Universidad de Tarapacá.
- Choque, E. (2015). *Historia de Tacna. Una síntesis histórica de sus pueblos*. Tacna: Instituto de Ciencias Sociales del Perú.
- Dagnino, V. (1925). El Departamento de Tacna. s/e.

- Devés, E. (1999). Pensadores chilenos en el debate de fin de siglo. *Universum*, 14, 65-80. Recuperado de <http://universum.utralca.cl/contenido/index-99/deves.pdf>
- Díaz Aguad, A. (2006). Los Consulados Chilenos en Oriente y su participación en el proceso de Inmigración China al Norte de Chile (1910-1929). *Diálogo Andino*, 27, 61-74.
- Díaz Aguad, A. (2000). *Presencia italiana en la ciudad de Arica. 1885-1950*. Arica: Ediciones Universidad de Tarapacá.
- Díaz Aguad, A. y Pizarro, E. (1999). *La Inmigración italiana al Norte Grande de Chile. (1880-1950)* (Informe Final de Investigación. Dirección de Investigación y Postgrado). Arica: Universidad de Tarapacá
- Díaz Araya, A., y Ruz, R. (2009). Estado, Escuela Chilena y Población Andina en la Ex Subdelegación De Putre: Acciones y Reacciones Durante El Período Post Guerra Del Pacífico (1883 - 1929). *Polis (Santiago)*, 8(24), 311-340. Doi: <http://dx.doi.org/10.4067/S0718-65682009000300015>
- Díaz Araya, A., Ruz, R., Galdames, L. y Tapia, A. (2012). El Arica Peruano de ayer. Siglo XIX. *Atenea*, 505(I),159-184. Doi: <http://dx.doi.org/10.4067/S0718-04622012000100008>
- Díaz Araya, A., Galdames, L. y Ruz, R. (2014). *Tiempos Violentos. Fragmentos de Historia Social en Arica*. Arica: Ediciones Universidad de Tarapacá.
- Diccionario Biográfico de Chile (1944). Santiago: Empresa Periodística de Chile.
- Egña B., M. (2000). *La educación popular en el siglo XIX en Chile: Una práctica de política estatal*. Santiago: Editorial LOM.
- Figueroa, C., Silva C. y Silva B. (2011). La demanda política de un actor educativo: el visitador de escuelas primarias Ramón López Pinto (Tarapacá, norte de Chile 1889-1907). *Cuadernos de Historia*, 34, 53-81.
- Foucault, M. (1976). *Vigilar y Castigar: Nacimiento de la prisión*. México: Siglo XXI Editores.
- Galdames, L. et. al. (1981). *Historia de Arica*. Santiago: Editorial Renacimiento.
- González, S. (2002). *Chilenizando a Tunupa. La escuela publica en el Tarapacá Andino 1880-1990*. Santiago: Dibam.

- González, S. (2004). El aymara chileno y la escuela pública. *Revista de Educación*, 315. Recuperado de http://bibliorepo.umce.cl/revista_educacion/2004/315/30_37.pdf
- Mc Evoy, C. (2005). Chile En El Perú: Guerra Y Construcción Estatal En Sudamérica, 1881-1884. *Revista de Indias, LXVI* (236), 195-216. Doi: <https://doi.org/10.3989/revindias.2006.i236.366>
- Mondaca, C. (2008) Identidades Sociales y Representaciones Políticas en Conflicto: El Sistema Educativo Chileno en Los Andes de Arica, 1884-1929. *Antropológica. XVI*(26), 33-62. Recuperado de <http://revistas.pucp.edu.pe/index.php/antropologica/article/view/1612>
- Morales, V. y Molina, C. (2003). Reasentamiento Involuntario: Integración Y Civilización. *Revista Bitácora Urbano Territorial, 1*(7) 19-25. Doi: [10.15446/bitacora](https://doi.org/10.15446/bitacora)
- León, M. (2001). Criminalidad y prisión en la Araucanía chilena, 1852-1911. *Revista de Historia Indígena, 5*, 135-160.
- López, I. (1977). *La Cultura Chilena a través de los agentes y colaboradores del Estado Docente 1880-1929*. Arica: Universidad de Chile.
- Palacios, R. (1974). *La Chilenización de Tacna y Arica 1883-1929*. Lima: Editorial Arica S. A.
- Pérez, P. (2014). Reflexiones para comenzar un debate. En Perez P (coord.) *Universalización e historia* (9-24). Madrid: Instituto de Estudios Latinoamericanos. Universidad de Alcalá.
- Pizarro, E. (2000). *La chilenización de Tacna y Arica en tiempos del Centenario* (1910). (Informe Final de Investigación. Dirección de Investigación y Postgrado). Arica: Universidad de Tarapacá.
- Pizarro, E. (2006). Los visitadores de escuelas: Agentes del Estado Docente en el extremo norte de Chile. (1884-1897). *Diálogo Andino, 27*, 75-84. Recuperado de <http://www.redalyc.org/html/3713/371336237005/>
- Pizarro, E., y Díaz, A. (2008). El reloj del tiempo marcaba cien años: Arica y Tacna en las Fiestas del Centenario. En Cáceres, J (edit) *Experiencias de Historia Regional en Chile* (361-369). Valparaíso: Instituto de Historia. PUCV.
- Pizarro, E., y Ríos, W. (2000) Archivo urbanístico, arquitectónico y visual de Arica. (1953-1973). (Informe Final de Investigación. Dirección de Investigación y Postgrado). Arica: Universidad de Tarapacá, Arica.

- Pons, G. (1999). *Del Tratado De Ancón A La Convención De Lima*. Tacna: Fondo Editorial De La Universidad Nacional Jorge Basadre Grohmann.
- Richard, N. (1989). La Desidentidad Latinoamericana, En Zegers, F. (Ed.), *La Estratificación de los Márgenes. Sobre Arte, Cultura Y Políticas* (39-58). Santiago De Chile: Art And Criticism Monograph Series Art & Text Publications.
- Romero, J. L. (1976). *Latinoamérica: Las Ciudades y Las Ideas*. Buenos Aires: Siglo XXI Editores. 2ª edición, 2004.
- Sauquillo, J. (1987). Poder Político Y Sociedad Normalizada en Michael Foucault. *Revista de Estudios Políticos (Nueva Época)*, 56, 181-203.
- Valdivieso, P. (2007). A Propósito De Las Relaciones Chile-Bolivia-Perú: Percepciones, Experiencias y Propuestas. Bicentenario. *Revista de Historia de Chile y América*, 6(2), 99-123.
- Varas, C. (1922). *Tacna y Arica bajo la soberanía chilena*. Santiago: Imp. de “La Nación”.
- Velez, J., y Castex, L. (1972). *Enciclopedia de Arica. Ensayo de información general del Departamento*. Santiago: Editorial de Enciclopedias Regionales.
- Vera, A. (1924). *Labor Educacional Chilena en Arica*. Santiago: Sociedad Imprenta y Litografía Universo.
- Veritas (1920) *La Francmasonería y sus obras en Chile*. Santiago de Chile: Imprenta San José.

Fuentes De Archivo

AHVD volumen 289. Gobernación de Arica. Informes i Anotaciones, desde el 4 de febrero de 1885 al 25 de septiembre de 1886. Archivo Histórico Vicente Dagnino Oliveri. Departamento de Ciencias Históricas y Geográficas. Universidad de Tarapacá. Arica. Chile.

AHDV volumen 243. Instrucción Pública. Visitación de Escuelas y Oficios varios. Tacna, 29 de diciembre de 1927. Archivo Histórico Vicente Dagnino Oliveri. Departamento de Ciencias Históricas y Geográficas. Universidad de Tarapacá. Arica. Chile.

AHDV volumen 48. Oficios diversos de la Intendencia de Tacna 1915. Archivo Histórico Vicente Dagnino Oliveri. Departamento de Ciencias Históricas y Geográficas. Universidad de Tarapacá. Arica. Chile.

AHDV volumen 45. Oficios remitidos a ambas gobernaciones de varios 1914. Archivo Histórico Vicente Dagnino Oliveri. Departamento de Ciencias Históricas y Geográficas. Universidad de Tarapacá. Arica. Chile.

Diario “El Ferrocarril” de Arica. (Números desde 1914 a 1923). Biblioteca Central. Universidad de Tarapacá. Arica. Chile.

Elías Pizarro: Profesor del Departamento de Ciencias Históricas y Geográficas. Facultad de Educación y Humanidades de la Universidad de Tarapacá (Arica-Chile)

Raúl Bustos González: Profesor del Departamento de Educación de la Universidad de Tarapacá (Arica-Chile)

Contact Address: rbgonzalez@academicos.uta.cl

Instructions for authors, subscriptions and further details:

<http://hse.hipatiapress.com>

Memorias Adaptables para la Construcción de Identidades Colectivas

Lucas Bietti¹

1) University of Neuchâtel, Switzerland

Date of publication: June 23th, 2018

Edition period: June 2018-October 2018

To cite this article: Bietti, L. (2018). Memorias Adaptables para la Construcción de Identidades. *Social and Education History*, 7(2), 125-150. doi:10.17583/hse.2018.2820

To link this article: <http://dx.doi.org/10.17583/hse.2018.2820>

PLEASE SCROLL DOWN FOR ARTICLE

The terms and conditions of use are related to the Open Journal System and to [Creative Commons Attribution License](#) (CC-BY).

Memorias Adaptables para la Construcción de Identidades Colectivas

Lucas Bietti
University of Neuchatel (Switzerland)

Resumen

La investigación sobre la maleabilidad de la memoria humana ha mostrado los diferentes modos en los que podemos incorporar información errónea dadas ciertas condiciones sociales. Esta línea de investigación ha llevado a psicólogos cognitivos a centrarse en los errores de la memoria y la desinformación que pueden ser causados por el contagio social. Estudios recientes han comenzado a analizar los posibles beneficios que conllevan el contagio social de la memoria. Dicha línea de investigación se ha centrado en las características potencialmente adaptables de la memoria. Estos estudios sugieren que la adaptabilidad de la memoria ayuda a promover la cooperación en grupos sociales y desempeña un papel central en el desarrollo de la confianza entre miembros de grupos sociales. La adaptabilidad de la memoria crea las condiciones necesarias para la formación de comunidades de memoria, que son la base para la construcción y la transmisión de memorias colectivas. La memoria colectiva puede ser definida como memorias individuales compartidas en una comunidad, que le confieren identidad a la comunidad. Las memorias colectivas pueden pertenecer a un proyecto identitario que los miembros de grupos sociales emplean para conservar su historia y mantener cohesión. El objetivo de nuestro artículo es investigar cuáles son los factores sociales y cognitivos que promueven la formación de memorias colectivas en interacciones sociales. Para esto discutimos numerosos estudios en psicología social, cultural y cognitiva que se han centrado en explicar los beneficios y costos de formar memorias colectivas. La evidencia empírica sugiere que la adaptabilidad de la memoria humana, y en consecuencia la capacidad que grupos sociales tienen para formar memorias colectivas sobre las cuales basar sus identidades sociales, parece ser bastante independiente de la veracidad y precisión de tales memorias.

Palabras clave: Memoria, adaptabilidad, evolución, artefactos, identidad

Adaptive Memories for the Construction of Collective Identities

Lucas Bietti
University of Neuchâtel (Switzerland)

Abstract

Research on the malleability of human memory has shown how we can incorporate misinformation under certain social and cognitive conditions. This line of inquiry has led cognitive psychologists to focus on memory errors and misinformation effects caused by social contagion. Based on the same social contagion effect, recent studies have focused on its potentially adaptive features, as a trust-based mode for promoting cultural learning and cooperation among in-group members and enabling the formation and maintenance of mnemonic communities, which are the basis for the emergence, formation and transmission of collective memories. We may consider that collective memories can be operationalized as individual memories shared across a community that bear on the community's identity. These collective memories may belong to an identity project that members of groups often use to preserve an established group history and maintain group cohesion. The aim of this article is to investigate which are the social and cognitive resources that promote the formation of collective memories in social interactions. In order to do so, we discuss several studies in social, cultural and cognitive psychology that have focused on studying the benefits and costs of having collective memories. The empirical evidence suggests that the adaptability of human memory, and therefore, the ability of social groups to create collective memories upon which to base their collective identities, seems to be quite independent of the veracity and accuracy of such memories.

Keywords: Memory, adaptability, evolution, identity

La memoria colaborativa implica situaciones en las que dos o más personas recuerdan de manera conjunta experiencias pasadas que pueden haber sido compartidas (Mario y Liliana recuerdan sus últimas vacaciones en París). También podemos recordar conjuntamente experiencias similares (ej. visitar el Centro George-Pompidou) que atravesamos de manera independiente (ej. Mario lo había visitado años antes en su primera visita a París mientras que Liliana lo visitó por primera vez en sus últimas vacaciones con Mario). En consecuencia, la información que Liliana y Mario recuerdan acerca de su visita al Centro George-Pompidou de forma colaborativa puede ser el resultado de haber codificado una misma o similar experiencia de forma compartida o separada (Barber, Rajaram, & Aron, 2010; Barnier, Sutton, Harris, & Wilson, 2008; Harris, Barnier, & Sutton, 2013; Pereira-Pasarin & Rajaram, 2011). Por supuesto que nuestras memorias individuales y colaborativas no siempre representan de forma acertada los acontecimientos que ocurrieron en el pasado, más bien funcionan como representaciones individuales y compartidas de ese pasado (Sutton, 2008). Tal re-evocación de experiencias individuales y/o compartidas se basa en la capacidad humana de poder viajar mentalmente en el tiempo: “esta facultad permite a los seres humanos proyectarse mentalmente en el pasado para revivir etapas de la vida o hacia el futuro para anticipar posibles eventos y sus consecuencias” (Suddendorf & Corballis, 2007, p. 299).

Numerosos estudios se han dedicado a medir los beneficios y costos de la memoria colaborativa (ej. Meade et al., 2009; Weldon & Bellinger, 1997). Estas investigaciones han demostrado que el recuerdo colaborativo puede tanto inhibir o facilitar la capacidad individual de recordar tales experiencias (ej. Rajaram, 2011). Las actividades colaborativas (ej. conversaciones) en las que recordamos hechos compartidos se basan en continuas interacciones entre recursos cognitivos internos (nuestra memoria a nivel biológico) y recursos cognitivos externos (como otras personas y la tecnología) (Donald, 1993; Michaelian & Sutton, 2013; Sterelny, 2012; Sutton et al., 2010). Estas constantes y repetidas interacciones conducen a una acumulación de conocimientos y habilidades a través del tiempo. Tal acumulación de conocimientos y habilidades transforma los contextos sociales y culturales

en los que nuevas generaciones habitan, afectando de ese modo, su desarrollo ontogenético (Sterelny, 2012). La transmisión de conocimientos y habilidades a lo largo del tiempo permite la formación de memorias colectivas (Wertsch, 2002, 2009) dentro de comunidades mnemotécnicas específicas (Zerubavel, 2003).

El objetivo de nuestro artículo es investigar cuáles son los factores sociales y cognitivos que promueven la formación de memorias colectivas en interacciones sociales. Para esto discutimos numerosos estudios experimentales en psicología social, cultural y cognitiva que se han centrado en explicar los beneficios y costos de formar memorias colectivas. La evidencia empírica sugiere que la adaptabilidad de la memoria humana, y en consecuencia la capacidad que grupos sociales tienen para formar memorias colectivas sobre las cuales basar sus identidades sociales, parece ser bastante independiente de la veracidad y precisión de tales recuerdos.

En la primera parte del artículo analizamos estudios experimentales en psicología cognitiva que han demostrado que recordar de manera colaborativa (ej. conversaciones) en grupos sociales tiende más a afectar que a facilitar la capacidad individual de recordar. Es decir, estos estudios observaron que solemos recordar más información con relación a una experiencia pasada cuando lo hacemos de manera individual que cuando lo realizamos en grupo. En otras palabras, rara vez recordar experiencias pasadas con otras personas nos lleva a recordar más información en comparación de cuando lo hacemos de forma individual.

En la segunda parte discutimos numerosos trabajos que han analizado cómo las memorias son transmitidas a través de cadenas complejas de comunicación a lo largo tiempo. Del mismo modo, examinamos los costos que estas prácticas conllevan y los efectos del contagio social para la memoria. En la tercera parte sostenemos que los costos para la memoria individual relacionados a recordar de manera colaborativa en interacciones sociales están determinados, en gran medida, por la maleabilidad y la adaptabilidad de la memoria humana. En la cuarta parte indicamos que la maleabilidad y la adaptabilidad de la memoria humana, en continua interacción con recursos cognitivos externos, han permitido el surgimiento de redes híbridas, que incorporan aspectos culturales y cognitivos a través de nuestra historia cultural y evolutiva (Donald, 1991). Estas redes de naturaleza híbrida contienen elementos culturales y cognitivos creando las

condiciones para el surgimiento de memorias colectivas a gran escala. En la última parte del artículo discutimos las razones por las que contar con memorias adaptables permite la construcción de identidades colectivas.

La Memoria en Grupos Pequeños

Hablar de un pasado compartido en compañía de otras personas es uno de los modos más frecuentes para construir memorias colectivas (Bietti, 2012, 2014; Middleton & Brown, 2005; Hirst & Echterhoff, 2012). En estas conversaciones acerca de un pasado compartido solemos coordinar recursos lingüísticos (ej. estructuras sintácticas) y corporales (ej. gestos, miradas, postura corporal y expresiones faciales) con el fin de lograr objetivos comunes (ej. tratar de recordar conjuntamente dónde dejamos el auto estacionado). Tales conversaciones son actividades colaborativas (Clark, 1996; Clark & Brennan, 1991) en las que los participantes tienen que "compartir y sincronizar aspectos de sus estados mentales para actuar juntos en el mundo" (Brennan, Galati & Kuhlen, 2010, p 304).

Coordinar aspectos cognitivos, lingüísticos y corporales con las personas con las que recordamos un pasado compartido de forma colaborativa en conversaciones suele ocurrir con poco esfuerzo y de modo natural (Cienki, Bietti & Kok, 2014). Sin embargo, recordar con otras personas no sólo tiene que ver con la coordinación de estos recursos a través del tiempo. Los participantes, en algún momento de la actividad colaborativa, tienen que crear una versión compartida del pasado, a diferencia de lo que ocurre mientras interactuamos para resolver un problema, imaginarnos situaciones contrafácticas o proyectarnos hacia el futuro (Bietti & Sutton, 2015). En el proceso de crear una versión compartida del pasado factores como el estilo de comunicación (Harris et al., 2011; Meade et al., 2009), grado de familiaridad de los participantes (Harris, Barnier & Sutton, 2012; Rajaram & Pereira-Pasarin, 2010) así como el hecho de haber codificado esa experiencia de forma conjunta (Harris et al., 2013) tienen un papel central en qué y cómo recordamos en interacción con otras personas.

En la próxima sección presentamos el concepto de memoria transactiva (Wegner, 1986) y nos centramos en discutir los resultados obtenidos de

manera experimental dentro del campo de la psicología cognitiva (Rajaram, 2011; Weldon & Bellinger, 1997).

La Memoria Transactiva

Numerosos estudios en psicología organizacional, psicología del aprendizaje, psicología cognitiva y filosofía de la mente mostraron que equipos de expertos, grupos de estudiantes y parejas que han pasado mucho tiempo juntos pueden formar sistemas de memorias transactivas (Hollingshead, 1998; Jackson & Moreland 2009; Lewis, Lange, & Gillis, 2005; Ren & Argote, 2011; Sparrow, Liu, & Wegner, 2011; Theiner, 2013; Wegner, 1986). Un sistema de memoria transactiva se rige por “el funcionamiento de los sistemas de memoria de las personas y los procesos de comunicación que se producen dentro del grupo” (Wegner, 1986, p. 191). La composición y el desarrollo de un sistema de memoria transactiva necesita que: i) la información a recordar se encuentre distribuida entre los integrantes del grupo; y ii) que cada miembro del grupo sepa que otro de los miembros posee información específica que el primero no posee y que puede contar con su colaboración cuando sea necesario. Si estos dos requisitos se cumplen, las personas dentro de un sistema de memoria transactiva cuentan con la posibilidad de distribuir su trabajo cognitivo de tal manera que cada miembro sólo asume la responsabilidad de aprender y recordar la información dentro de su propio dominio de conocimiento - sabiendo (explícita o implícitamente) que otro de los miembros del sistema de memoria transactiva es responsable de otra área de especialización. De este modo, las personas que forman parte de un sistema de memoria transactiva no desperdician recursos cognitivos intentando recordar información que otro miembro del sistema debe recordar y es experto. Esto lleva a que los grupos que son capaces de desarrollar sistemas de memoria transactiva se encuentren en mejores condiciones en tareas de memoria, en comparación de aquellos en los que esta distribución del trabajo cognitivo no sucede (Wegner, Erber, & Raymond, 1991).

Beneficios y Costes de la Colaboración

La investigación en memoria transactiva en psicología organizacional, por ejemplo, ha tendido a satisfacerse con el criterio según el cual el grupo inevitablemente supera al individuo en el momento de recordar información (Ren & Argote, 2011). De este modo, si un grupo supera a uno de sus miembros en tareas de memoria, se entiende que esto ocurrió por la capacidad del grupo de desarrollar y poner en funcionamiento un sistema de memoria transactiva.

Sin embargo, en psicología cognitiva, los estudios experimentales que han analizado los modos en los que miembros de grupos recuerdan en forma colaborativa no se han satisfecho con el anterior criterio. En psicología cognitiva el rendimiento del grupo no sólo debe ser superior al de uno de sus miembros, sino también a la suma de los rendimientos de cada uno de sus miembros recordando de manera individual. Estos estudios encontraron que recordar en grupo frecuentemente perjudica el rendimiento individual de cada uno de sus miembros (Basden et al., 1997; Rajaram & Pereira-Pasarin, 2010; Weldon & Bellinger, 1997). En otras palabras, recordar en grupo, en muchas ocasiones, inhibe más que mejora la capacidad de recordar a nivel individual. Basden y colaboradores han explicado este fenómeno por medio de “la hipótesis de la interrupción en la recuperación de información” (Basden, Basden & Henry, 2001). Esta hipótesis sostiene que escuchar las respuestas de otras personas altera la forma en que cada individuo organiza su secuencia de recuerdo y estrategias de recuperación de la información. Esto le impide a cada miembro alcanzar su más alto potencial cuando recuerda en grupo (Barber et al., 2010; Barber & Rajaram, 2011; Basden et al., 1997; Rajaram, 2011).

No obstante, dentro de esta línea de investigación estudios recientes sugieren que recordar con otras personas puede ser al menos no perjudicial para la memoria individual y hasta incluso beneficioso, en ciertos grupos y bajo ciertas circunstancias (Harris et al., 2011; Meade et al., 2009). Por ejemplo, en un estudio que comparó el rendimiento en tareas de memoria colaborativa en grupos de pilotos expertos y no expertos, se encontraron beneficios en los primeros (Meade et al., 2009). Es decir, el rendimiento en los grupos de pilotos expertos fue mejor que la suma de los rendimientos de cada uno de sus miembros recordando por separado. Dicho efecto no se

encontró en los grupos de no expertos donde se observó inhibición de la memoria individual como resultado de la colaboración. Meade y sus colegas analizaron las conversaciones en ambos tipos de grupos (pilotos expertos y no expertos), y descubrieron que en los grupos de expertos uno de los factores clave para tener mejor rendimiento fue el hecho de contar con estrategias comunicativas más elaboradas. Un ejemplo de las tales estrategias era el constante y recíproco monitoreo de la comprensión por medio de repeticiones y reformulaciones que actuaban para explicitar el conocimiento compartido. Estas estrategias comunicativas estuvieron ausentes en los grupos de no expertos que mostraron inhibición de la memoria individual como consecuencia de la colaboración. Meade y sus colegas sostienen que las estrategias comunicativas encontradas en los grupos de expertos fueron el resultado de su formación y experiencia profesional, en la que el intercambio de información es crucial.

En otra serie estudios focalizados en los beneficios y costos de la colaboración en tareas de memoria, Harris y sus colegas (2011) encontraron que, bajo ciertas condiciones, parejas mayores (que han compartido gran parte de su vida) pudieron recordar información que ambos individuos parecieron haber olvidado si intentaban recordarla de forma individual. No obstante, las condiciones y la clase de material que se les pidió a las parejas recordar de modo conjunto e individual desempeñó un papel central facilitando o inhibiendo su rendimiento. Los factores que llevaron a tales beneficios incluyeron estrategias comunicativas para recuperar información y repeticiones para establecer acuerdos y hacer explícito el conocimiento compartido (Harris et al., 2011). Es decir, los resultados obtenidos por Harris y sus colegas estuvieron en concordancia con los reportados en el estudio de pilotos expertos y no expertos (Meade et al., 2009). A saber, en ambos estudios, el estilo de la interacción verbal y la comunicación jugaron un papel central en la mejora del rendimiento en tareas de memoria.

Sumado al papel de las estrategias comunicativas en la aparición de efectos de facilitación en tareas de memoria colaborativa, Harris y sus colegas (2013) examinaron si las condiciones (individuales vs. compartidas) en las que los participantes codificaron la información para luego ser recordada también influyó en su posterior rendimiento. Los resultados de dicho estudio mostraron una correlación positiva entre el hecho de haber codificado de manera conjunta la información para luego

ser recordada y la eliminación de fenómenos de inhibición en la memoria individual en las tareas colaborativas (Harris et al., 2013). Estos resultados fueron encontrados en grupos de participantes que se conocían anteriormente al estudio como así también en desconocidos. Tales resultados sugieren que las estrategias comunicativas y el hecho de haber codificado de forma conjunta la información se relacionan con una colaboración efectiva cuando los participantes de ambos estudios tuvieron que recordar en grupo.

La Transmisión Social de la Memoria

En esta sección discutimos cómo se transmiten las memorias a lo largo de cadenas de comunicación en grupos sociales. Luego nos centramos en explorar los diferentes modos en que distintos factores sociales pueden contaminar estas memorias con información falsa. Esto ocurre por su alta capacidad de adaptación.

Transmisión en Cadenas de Comunicación

Los estudios del psicólogo Frederic Bartlett (1932) sirven de marco general para entender los modos en que la memoria es susceptible de transformación como resultado de su simple reproducción y transmisión en grupos sociales. Bartlett (1932) empleo dos técnicas para investigar tales fenómenos: i) la reproducción repetida; y ii) la reproducción en serie. En la reproducción repetida los participantes de su estudio debían primero aprender un material nuevo y luego recordarlo en múltiples ocasiones a lo largo del tiempo, sin estar expuestos al material original. Por otro lado, en la reproducción en serie, se le pedía a un participante (A1) que aprendiera un material nuevo (ej. una serie de imágenes e historias) y luego que tuviera que escribir o dibujar de memoria, dependiendo del estímulo original, el material recientemente aprendido. A continuación, A1 debía abandonar la sala donde el experimento se llevaba a cabo, y un nuevo participante (A2) tenía que ver el dibujo o leer la historia generada previamente por A1. Inmediatamente, el experimentador le pedía a A2 que dibujara o escribiera de memoria el nuevo material recientemente aprendido. En los experimentos originales, las cadenas de

transmisión se encontraban conformadas por diez participantes (Bartlett, 1932). Al comparar el rendimiento de los participantes en ambas condiciones (reproducción repetida y reproducción en serie), en la reproducción repetida fue cuando más información se había conservado a lo largo del tiempo (Bartlett, 1932; Bergman & Roediger, 1999; Roediger, Meade & Bergman, 2001; Roediger, Meade, Gallo & Olson, 2014). El mejor rendimiento en la reproducción repetida se basó en que reproducir múltiples veces la misma historia o dibujo por un mismo participante funcionó consolidando la memoria del estímulo y mejorando su recuerdo futuro (Roediger et al., 2014). Este fenómeno estuvo ausente en la reproducción en serie, en la que las memorias fueron transmitidas a través de cadenas de comunicación que involucraban múltiples participantes. Esto dio como resultado que la reconstrucción final de la memoria por parte de A10 resultara considerablemente diferente al estímulo originalmente presentado a A1. Semejante variación hacía difícil rastrear las transformaciones que aparecían cada vez que el mismo material era aprendido y reproducido por diferentes participantes. No obstante, si lo que intentamos hacer es entender cómo la transmisión de memorias ocurre a lo largo del tiempo, dentro y a través de grupos sociales y comunidades diversas, nuestro foco de interés no se tendría que centrar tanto en la reproducción repetida, sino más bien en la reproducción en serie. Es decir, para analizar cómo las memorias, los conocimientos y las habilidades se transmiten a través del tiempo no interesaría tanto saber cómo un mismo individuo recuerda una misma historia en múltiples ocasiones, sino como lo hacen múltiples individuos y la forma en cómo dichas memorias se transforman como consecuencia de ello. De ahí que la reproducción en serie sea más relevante para investigar las dinámicas sociales que llevan a la transmisión y reproducción de memorias a lo largo del tiempo.

La Reproducción en Serie

El método de reproducción en serie basado en el uso de imágenes e historias como estímulos para luego ser recordados y transmitidos por otros individuos ha sido utilizado en numerosos estudios experimentales que se centraron en analizar los modos en que las memorias cambiaban a lo largo

del tiempo (Bietti, Mayor & Bangerter, 2017; Mesoudi & Whiten, 2008; Roediger et al., 2014; Xu & Griffiths, 2010). En consonancia con los primeros resultados obtenidos por Bartlett (1932), los nuevos estudios observaron que las memorias de los participantes se modificaban significativamente a medida que más se alejaban del estímulo original y la primera transmisión dentro de la cadena de comunicación. Es decir, se observaron mayores transformaciones del estímulo original a medida que las reproducciones se alejaban de la primera transmisión (ej. Mesoudi & Whitten, 2004). Entre la clase de transformaciones que fueron encontradas, aparecieron generalizaciones y abstracciones del contenido del estímulo original (Mesoudi & Whitten, 2004), distorsiones motivadas por sesgos de la memoria, tales como la selección comprensiva y efectos contextuales (Xu & Griffiths, 2010) y estereotipos culturales (Bangerter, 2000; Kashima, 2000).

Un estudio reciente examinó si la interacción social podía afectar las cadenas de comunicación donde las memorias eran transmitidas (Tan & Fay, 2011). Tan y Fay (2011) compararon los resultados en términos de cantidad de información preservada a lo largo del tiempo en dos condiciones: i) en cadenas de comunicación en las que los participantes primero tuvieron que escuchar grabaciones de audio de narraciones generadas por una generación anterior de participantes y luego grabar sus propias narraciones de estas historias para que una nueva generación las pudiera escuchar; y ii) en cadenas de comunicación en las que la transmisión involucraba participantes localizados de modo adyacente e interactuando libremente. Los resultados del estudio experimental mostraron que, en la segunda condición, es decir cuando los participantes tuvieron que transmitir sus memorias cara a cara a una nueva generación de participantes, se observaron un menor número de abstracciones y no se encontraron generalizaciones. En otras palabras, más información fue preservada como consecuencia de la interacción social (Tan & Fay, 2011). Una de las razones que Tan y Fay propusieron para explicar estos resultados fue que el *feedback* de los oyentes de la nueva generación desempeñó un papel central en el momento de recuperar la información (ej. en términos de exactitud) por parte de la generación anterior.

El Contagio Social de las Memorias

Las investigaciones centradas en examinar la maleabilidad de la memoria humana (Loftus, 1979, 2005) ha mostrado cómo, bajo ciertas condiciones sociales y cognitivas, podemos fácilmente incorporar información errónea en nuestros recuerdos. Esta línea de investigación ha llevado a psicólogos cognitivos y forenses a estudiar los errores de la memoria causados por el contagio social de los recuerdos (Numbers, Meade & Perge, 2014; Meade & Roediger, 2002; Roediger et al., 2001). En varios estudios experimentales se emplearon confederados para insertar información incorrecta en los participantes. En estos estudios se encontró que los participantes recordaron más información incorrecta insertada por confederados que nuevos elementos incorrectos insertados por ellos mismos a causa de sesgos de memoria (ej. Roediger et al., 2001). Otras investigaciones han corroborado estos resultados: las memorias falsas de los confederados insertadas en situaciones interaccionales fueron altamente contagiosas y afectaron negativamente las memorias de los participantes (Echterhoff, Groll, & Hirst, 2007; Hirst & Echterhoff, 2012). Recientemente estudios en esta línea de investigación han comenzado a explorar los aspectos positivos de contar con memorias adaptables y fácilmente ‘contaminables’ (Fagin, Yamashiro & Hirst, 2013; Wheeler, Allan, Tsivilis, Martin & Gabbert, 2013). Wheeler y sus colegas sostienen que tener memorias adaptables juega un papel central para la promoción de la confianza entre los miembros de grupos sociales. Esto facilita la transmisión de conocimientos y la cooperación. Tener memorias adaptables y fácilmente ‘contaminables’ parece ser también de vital importancia en la formación y conservación de comunidades de memoria (Zerubavel, 2003) que son la base para el surgimiento, la formación y la transmisión de la memoria colectiva (Fagin, Yamashiro & Hirst, 2013).

La Memoria Colectiva

La formación de la memoria colectiva resulta de mayor complejidad que la transmisión de la memoria en cadenas de comunicación o de los posibles

efectos causados por el contagio social de los recuerdos. Las memorias colectivas se basan en redes cognitivas distribuidas que incluyen individuos con sus mentes corporizadas en interacción con estructuras institucionales (ej. bibliotecas) y la tecnología (Donald, 1991). Un ejemplo bien conocido de cómo estas redes cognitivas distribuidas operan de sustento para la formación de recuerdos socialmente distribuidos se puede encontrar en los procesos a través de los cuales se enseña y se aprende la historia nacional en las escuelas. Cuando los niños comienzan a aprender la historia de sus países dentro del entorno institucional de la escuela primaria obtienen información proveniente de múltiples fuentes y recursos. Estos incluyen sus recuerdos, libros de texto y rituales institucionales (ej. conmemoraciones de fechas importantes para la historia nacional). Los alumnos de escuela primaria también se hallan expuestos a los recuerdos y las historias de sus padres y familia cercana, así como a la información y valoraciones que puedan venir de productos culturales, tales como la televisión, el cine y el Internet. En el tiempo ontogenético del desarrollo de los niños, las historias nacionales pueden ser sometidas a revisión, y en consecuencia las opiniones de los maestros, así como las versiones presentadas en los libros de texto también pueden cambiar. Los amigos, las propias lecturas e intereses personales también pueden influir moldeando los conocimientos acerca del pasado nacional. Las tecnologías empleadas para transmitir este tipo de historias también lo pueden hacer, desde el Internet y el desarrollo de las redes sociales hasta el uso de la realidad virtual y la tecnología interactiva de tipo tangible. Asimismo, estos elementos formadores de redes cognitivas distribuidas también co-evolucionan con los mismos niños lo largo del tiempo.

En este apartado discutimos la línea de investigación en psicología social y cognitiva que se han centrado en analizar los modos en que las memorias colectivas se forman y transmiten en conversaciones. Luego, relacionamos tales procesos colaborativos con la creación de redes cognitivas distribuidas. Estas generan las condiciones para que podamos aprender, recordar, transmitir y acumular conocimientos, memorias y habilidades a nivel ontogenético.

La Formación de la Memoria Colectiva

Si nos distanciamos un momento del debate filosófico acerca de si los grupos pueden tener una mente y por consiguiente ser capaces de formar memorias colectivas (Bietti, 2012; Sutton, 2008; Theiner, 2013; Wilson, 2005), en términos prácticos podemos definir a la memoria colectiva como memorias individuales compartidas en una comunidad que le confieren identidad a esa comunidad (Coman, Brown, Koppel, & Hirst, 2009). Las memorias colectivas pueden pertenecer a un proyecto de identidad compartido empleándose para conservar la historia del grupo y mantener su cohesión a través del tiempo (Wertsch, 2002). Varios estudios en psicología social y cognitiva han investigado la influencia de factores sociales, cognitivos y lingüísticos en la formación de memorias colectivas en conversaciones. Estos factores incluyen roles conversacionales (Hirst & Manier, 1996), la experiencia (Hirst & Manier, 2008), y el silencio conversacional (Stone, Coman, Brown, Koppel & Hirst, 2012). Estos estudios demostraron que las formas en las que los miembros de una comunidad comparten sus memorias desempeñan un papel central en la formación y transmisión de las memorias colectivas (Coman et al., 2009; Hirst & Manier, 2008; Hirst & Echterhoff, 2012; Muller & Hirst, 2014).

Los estudios que se centraron en explorar los roles conversacionales en la formación de memorias colectivas en grupos pequeños han identificado tres funciones sociales complementarias que pueden adoptar los participantes: narradores, mentores y supervisores (Hirst & Manier, 1996; Hirst, Manier & Apetroaia, 1997). Los participantes que tomaron la iniciativa en las conversaciones sobre experiencias pasadas asumieron el rol de narradores. Estos no solamente hablaron de las experiencias pasadas compartidas con los otros miembros del grupo sino también de experiencias que no fueron compartidas. Luego, los participantes que apoyaron a los narradores proporcionándoles detalles e información adicional para mejorar sus narraciones actuaron como mentores. Y, por último, los que asumieron el rol de supervisores cumplieron la tarea de monitorear y evaluar si las narraciones eran correctas y si no le fueran se encargaban de marcar sus inexactitudes (Hirst & Manier, 1996). Los tres roles que los participantes en las conversaciones acerca de un pasado compartido pueden asumir son

flexibles y dinámicos en gran medida y también dependen de las identidades de los interlocutores, de sus objetivos y propósitos específicos (Bietti, 2010).

Otros estudios (ej. Cuc, Ozuru, Manier & Hirst, 2006) han llevado esta línea de investigación a condiciones más controladas en el laboratorio. Cuc y sus colegas encontraron que en los grupos en los que los interlocutores asumieron el rol de narradores dominantes hubo mayores probabilidades de que se formaran memorias colectivas. Brown, Coman y Hirst (2009) también estudiaron si existían diferencias importantes entre ser un narrador dominante y un experto para la formación de una memoria colectiva. Los autores encontraron que ambas características pueden ser independientes entre sí, es decir, ser un experto no llevó necesariamente a ser un narrador dominante. No obstante, ambas características (ser experto y ser narrador dominante) facilitaron la formación de una memoria colectiva. En relación a los modos en que el silencio conversacional afecta la formación de una memoria colectiva en conversaciones, Stone y sus colegas (Stone et al., 2012) han demostrado que el silencio selectivo acerca de un tópico no sólo induce a que estos tópicos sean menos accesibles, es decir, al olvido, sino que también proporciona un mecanismo funcional para crear una memoria colectiva.

Un estudio reciente investigó cómo el rol de la colaboración influía en la formación de memorias colectivas (Barber, Rajaram, & Fox, 2012). Barber y sus colegas observaron que incluso cuando la colaboración era negativa para el rendimiento individual en tareas de memoria, ésta fue lo que fomentó la creación de memorias colectivas. Es decir, los autores no encontraron una correlación positiva entre rendimiento individual y la formación de memorias colectivas. Otros estudios han empleado el modelado basado en agentes (MBA) para investigar la transmisión y la propagación de memorias colectivas en grupos sociales artificiales con mayor número de participantes (Luhmann & Rajaram, 2015). Luhmann y Rajaram (2015) usaron MBA para investigar los efectos de la inhibición de la memoria individual a causa de la colaboración en grupos sociales artificiales de mayor tamaño y complejidad que los analizados anteriormente en el laboratorio. Los autores encontraron efectos similares. Los resultados obtenidos por medio de simulaciones computacionales estuvieron en consonancia con algunos efectos observados en el laboratorio: a medida que los grupos incrementan su número de miembros, se hacen más complejos y se complejiza su colaboración, y

aunque la inhibición de la memoria a nivel individual aumenta, también se incrementan significativamente las posibilidades de formar memorias colectivas. Estos resultados están de acuerdo con los hallazgos obtenidos en los estudios que analizaron la transmisión de memorias en cadenas de comunicación (Tan & Fay, 2011) y las ventajas evolutivas y culturales del contagio social de los recuerdos (ej. Wheeler, 2013). En su conjunto, esta evidencia sugiere que cuestiones de rendimiento en tareas de memoria, inhibición individual de la memoria a causa de la colaboración, el contagio social y la veracidad de las memorias, parecen ser cuestiones bastante independientes cuando se tienen en cuenta los beneficios sociales y evolutivos de recordar en compañía de otras personas (ej. cooperación y la posibilidad de formar una memoria colectiva). Werstch (2009) sostiene que la memoria colectiva se compone de representaciones del pasado distribuidas entre individuos y artefactos culturales. La interacción entre individuos y artefactos culturales ocurre dentro de contextos sociales, históricos y tecnológicos específicos. Es decir, la formación y la transmisión de las memorias colectivas se ve condicionada por recursos biológicos, socio-culturales y tecnológicos así como por las prácticas culturales donde estos elementos interactúan. Un contexto social puede suministrar prácticas culturales que se distinguen de otras en lo que respecta a cómo y qué recordar (Wang, 2013). Esto nos lleva a considerar los modos en que las redes cognitivas distribuidas constituyen contextos enriquecidos para recordar, solos o en compañía de otros, eventos relevantes formadores de identidades individuales y colectivas.

Redes Cognitivas Distribuidas

Varios autores (Donald, 1991, 1993; Malafouris, 2013; Sterelny, 2012) afirman que el comportamiento humano inteligente tiene sus raíces en interacciones entre las personas, con sus cuerpos adaptables y cerebros plásticos, y los contextos sociales y materiales donde habitan, es decir, no solamente en modelos abstractos o representaciones de conducta humana en nuestros cerebros. La creación de redes cognitivas distribuidas en nuestra historia evolutiva nos permitió aprender, recordar, transmitir y acumular conocimientos y habilidades a lo largo del tiempo. Las redes cognitivas

distribuidas sirven de andamiaje para construcción de la memoria colectiva en el ámbito de la comunidad. Estas se encuentran conformadas por interfaces entre recursos cognitivos internos y externos. Recursos cognitivos internos incluyen: i) planes motores; ii) respuestas automáticas a un estímulo o señal que hemos aprendido en experiencias pasadas; iii) familiaridad en la forma de exposición repetida a un estímulo perceptual; iv) memorias semánticas (conocimientos generales del mundo); y v) memorias episódicas (recuerdos concretos y detallados) de experiencias que hemos vivido. Por otro lado, recursos cognitivos externos incluyen: i) nuestros contextos sociales y culturales; ii) dispositivos mnemotécnicos; iii) instrumentos de medición; iv) registros escritos (ej. libros); v) notaciones matemáticas; vi) bibliotecas y archivos; así como vii) medios de comunicación electrónicos. Donald (1993) mantiene que, debido a la plasticidad del cerebro, la interacción entre recursos cognitivos internos y externos llevó a continuas adaptaciones de nuestro aparato neuronal. Un ejemplo de tales adaptaciones se puede encontrar en las formas en que la memoria se encuentra adaptando al uso de Internet (ej. Google), en el sentido de que hoy en día solemos recordar mejor donde encontrar la información que ya aprendimos más que la información misma (Sparrow et al., 2011).

Malafouris (2013) reconoce el papel central de la cultura material en la evolución y desarrollo de la cognición humana. Este autor sostiene que el cerebro puede ser concebido como una entidad biológica y un artefacto cultural al mismo tiempo, debido a su continua re-configuración, re-cableado y re-modelado como consecuencia de su interacción con recursos cognitivos externos. Esto nos lleva a pensar que tal vez el costo de tener memorias adaptables y maleables, justamente en lo que reside la ‘imperfección’ de la memoria humana, pudo haber sido el precio que tuvimos que pagar por su alta capacidad de adaptación a nuestros cambiantes ecosistemas culturales (Hutchins, 2014).

Conclusión

En este artículo discutimos los resultados encontrados en numerosos estudios, muchos de ellos experimentales, en psicología social, cognitiva y cultural que han investigado los modos en que la memoria humana se adapta

a contextos materiales, grupos sociales y las comunidades de las que somos parte. La memoria es uno de los recursos más importantes sosteniendo nuestras historias, acciones y experiencias presentes. Esto la convierte en un ingrediente fundamental de la identidad. La mayoría de estos estudios se han centrado en la vulnerabilidad de nuestras memorias, las cuales se ha comprobado pueden ser fácilmente ‘contaminables’ con información falsa. Recientemente nuevas líneas de investigación se focalizaron en analizar los beneficios sociales, culturales y evolutivos de contar con memorias adaptables. La adaptabilidad y maleabilidad de la memoria humana es una de las claves para construir y ser parte de grupos sociales. Comunicar nuestras experiencias pasadas es uno de los modos más generalizados de crear nuevas relaciones humanas, fortalecer nuestros grupos de pertenencia, aprender y transmitir nuevos conocimientos y habilidades, y en última instancia afianzar la confianza. La comunicación y transmisión de nuestras memorias raramente ocurre en el vacío. Ocurre en redes y ecosistemas de naturaleza híbrida que incluyen elementos culturales, sociales y cognitivos. Todo esto crea las condiciones para el surgimiento de memorias colectivas, permitiéndonos así construir narrativas de grupo que nos diferencien de otros grupos. La adaptabilidad y maleabilidad de nuestras memorias, lo que justamente las hace imperfectas y fácilmente ‘contaminables’, es uno de los factores que hacen que esto pueda ocurrir.

Agradecimientos

Agradecemos el apoyo del *Fonds Nationale de la Recherche Suisse* (Subsidio Ambizone P200P1-154968).

Referencias

Bangerter, A. (2000). Identifying individual and collective acts of remembering in task-related communication. *Discourse Processes*, 30, 237-264. Doi: https://doi.org/10.1207/S15326950dp3003_2

- Barber, S. J., Rajaram, S., & Aron, A. (2010). When two is too many: Collaborative encoding impairs memory. *Memory & Cognition*, 38, 255-264. Doi: <https://doi.org/10.3758/MC.38.3.255>
- Barber, S. J., & Rajaram, S. (2011). Collaborative memory and part-set cueing impairments: The role of executive depletion in modulating retrieval disruption. *Memory*, 19, 378-397. Doi: [10.1080/09658211.2011.575787](https://doi.org/10.1080/09658211.2011.575787)
- Barber, S. J., Rajaram, S., & Fox, E. B. (2012). Learning and remembering with others: The key role of retrieval in shaping group recall and collective memory. *Social Cognition*, 30, 121-132. Doi: [10.1521/soco.2012.30.1.121](https://doi.org/10.1521/soco.2012.30.1.121)
- Barnier, A.J., Sutton, J., Harris, C.B., & Wilson, R.A. (2008). A conceptual and empirical framework for the social distribution of cognition: The case of memory. *Cognitive Systems Research*, 9(1-2), 33–51. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.cogsys.2007.07.002>
- Bartlett, F. (1932). *Remembering*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Basden, B. H., Basden, D. R., & Henry, S. (2001). Costs and benefits of collaborative remembering. *Applied Cognitive Psychology*, 14, 497-507. [https://doi.org/10.1002/1099-0720\(200011/12\)14:6<497::AID-ACP665>3.0.CO;2-4](https://doi.org/10.1002/1099-0720(200011/12)14:6<497::AID-ACP665>3.0.CO;2-4)
- Bergman, E., & Roediger, H. L. (1999). Can Bartlett's repeated reproduction experiments be replicated? *Memory & Cognition*, 27, 937-947.
- Bietti, L.M. (2010). Sharing memories, family conversation and interaction. *Discourse & Society*, 21 (5), 499-523. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0957926510373973>
- Bietti, L. M. (2012). Towards a cognitive pragmatics of collective remembering. *Pragmatics & Cognition*, 20(1), 32-61. Doi: [10.1075/pc.20.1.02bie](https://doi.org/10.1075/pc.20.1.02bie)
- Bietti, L.M. (2014). *Discursive Remembering: Individual and Collective Remembering as a Discursive, Cognitive and Historical Process*. Berlin: Walter de Gruyter.
- Bietti L.M & Sutton, J. (2015). Interacting to remember at multiple timescales: Coordination, collaboration, cooperation and culture in joint remembering. *Interaction Studies*, 16(3), 419-450. Doi: [10.1075/is.16.3.04bie](https://doi.org/10.1075/is.16.3.04bie)

- Bietti, L.M, Bangertter, A., Mayor, E. (2017). The interactive shaping of social learning in transmission chains. In G. Gunzelmann, A. Howes, T. Tenbrink. & E. Davelaar (Eds.), *Proceedings of the 39th Annual Conference of the Cognitive Science Society*. Austin, TX: Cognitive Science Society, pp. 1641-1646.
- Blumen, H., & Rajaram, S. (2008). Effects of group collaboration and repeated retrieval on individual recall. *Memory*, 16, 231-244.
- Brennan, S. E., Galati, A., & Kuhlen, A. (2010). Two minds, one dialog: Coordinating speaking and understanding. In B. Ross (Ed.), *Psychology of Learning and Motivation*, vol. 53. (pp. 301-345). Academic Press/Elsevier.
- Brown, A., Coman, A. & Hirst, W. (2009). Expertise and the formation of collective memory. *Social Psychology*, 40, 118–128.
- Cienki, A., Bietti, L.M., & Kok, K. (2014). Multimodal alignment during collaborative remembering. *Memory Studies*, 7(3), 354-369.
<https://doi.org/10.1177/1750698014530624>
- Clark, H. H. (1996). *Using Language*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press
- Clark, H. H., & Brennan, S. A. (1991). Grounding in communication. In L.B. Resnick, J.M. Levine, & S.D. Teasley (Eds.). *Perspectives on Socially Shared Cognition* (pp.127-148). Washington: APA Books.
- Coman, A., Brown, A.D., Koppel, J., & Hirst, W. (2009). Collective memory from a psychological perspective. *International Journal of Politics, Culture and Society*, 22(2), 125-141. Doi: [10.1007/s10767-009-9057-9](https://doi.org/10.1007/s10767-009-9057-9)
- Congleton, A. R., & Rajaram, S. (2011). The influence of learning methods on collaboration: Prior repeated retrieval enhances retrieval organization, abolishes collaborative inhibition, and promotes post-collaborative memory. *Journal of Experimental Psychology: General*, 140, 535–551. Doi: [10.1037/a0024308](https://doi.org/10.1037/a0024308)
- Cuc, A., Ozuru, Y., Manier, D., & Hirst, W. (2006). The transformation of collective memories: studies of family recounting. *Memory & Cognition*, 34, 752–762.
- Cuc, A., Koppel, J., & Hirst, W. (2007). Silence is not golden: a case for socially-shared retrieval-induced forgetting. *Psychological Science*, 18, 727–737. Doi: [10.1111/j.1467-9280.2007.01967.x](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-9280.2007.01967.x)

- Dixon, R.A. (2011) Evaluating everyday competence in older adult couples: epidemiological considerations. *Gerontology*, 57, 173–179. <https://doi.org/10.1159/000320325>
- Dixon, R.A. (2013). Collaborative memory research in aging: Perspectives on application. *Journal of Applied Research in Memory and Cognition*, 2(2), 128-130. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jarmac.2013.05.001>
- Donald, M. (1991). *Origins of the Modern Mind: Three Stages in the Evolution of Culture and Cognition*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press. <https://doi.org/10.1002/ana.410320432>
- Donald, M. (1993). Précis of Origins of the modern mind. *Behavioral and Brain Sciences*, 16, 737-791. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0140525X00032647>
- Echterhoff, G., Groll, S., & Hirst, W. (2007). Tainted truth: Overcorrection for misinformation influence on eyewitness memory. *Social Cognition*, 25, 367-409. <https://doi.org/10.1521/soco.2007.25.3.367>
- Fagin, M.M., Yamashiro, J.K. & Hirst, W. (2013). The adaptive function of distributed remembering: Contributions to the formation of collective memory. *Review of Philosophy and Psychology*, 4(1), 91-106. Doi: [10.1007/s13164-012-0127-y](https://doi.org/10.1007/s13164-012-0127-y)
- Gauld, A., & Stephenson, G.M. (1967). Some experiments related to Bartlett's theory of remembering. *British Journal of Psychology*, 58, 39–49. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.2044-8295.1967.tb01054.x>
- Harris, C.B., Paterson, H.M. & Kemp, R.I. (2008). Collaborative recall and collective memory: what happens when we remember together? *Memory*, 16, 213–230. Doi: [10.1080/09658210701811862](https://doi.org/10.1080/09658210701811862)
- Harris, C.B., Keil, P.G., Sutton, J., Barnier, A., & McIlwain, D. (2011). We remember, we forget: Collaborative remembering in older couples. *Discourse Processes*, 48, 267-303. Doi: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/0163853X.2010.541854>
- Harris, C.B., Barnier, A.J., & Sutton, J. (2012). Consensus collaboration enhances group and individual recall accuracy. *Quarterly Journal of Experimental Psychology*, 65, 179-194. Doi: [10.1080/17470218.2011.608590](https://doi.org/10.1080/17470218.2011.608590)
- Harris, C.B., Barnier, A.J., & Sutton, J. (2013). Shared encoding and the costs and benefits of collaborative recall. *Journal of Experimental*

Psychology: Learning, Memory, and Cognition, 39, 183–195. Doi: [10.1037/a0028906](https://doi.org/10.1037/a0028906)

- Hirst, W., & Manier, D. (1996). Social influences on remembering. In D. Rubin (Ed.), *Remembering The Past* (pp.271-290). New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Hirst, W., Manier, D., & Apetroaia, I. (1997). The social construction of the remembered self: Family recounting. *Annals of the New York Academy of Sciences*, 818, 163-188.
- Hirst, W. & Manier, D. (2008). Towards a psychology of collective memory. *Memory*, 16(3), 183-20. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09658210701811912>
- Hirst, W. & Echterhoff, G. (2012). Remembering in conversations: The social sharing and reshaping of memories. *Annual Review of Psychology*, 63, 55–69. Doi: [10.1146/annurev-psych-120710-100340](https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev-psych-120710-100340)
- Hollingshead, A.B. (1998). Communication, learning and retrieval in transactive memory systems. *Journal of Experimental Social Psychology*, 34, 423-442. <https://doi.org/10.1006/jesp.1998.1358>
- Hutchins, E. (2014). The cultural ecosystem of human cognition. *Philosophical Psychology*, 27 (1), 34-49. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09515089.2013.830548>
- Hyman, I. E., Cardwell, B. A., & Roy, R. A. (2013). Multiple causes of collaborative inhibition in memory for categorised word lists. *Memory*, 21(7), 875-890. Doi: [10.1080/09658211.2013.769058](https://doi.org/10.1080/09658211.2013.769058)
- Jackson, M., & Moreland, R.L. (2009). Transactive memory in the classroom. *Small Group Research*, 40(5), 508-534. Doi: <https://doi.org/10.1177/1046496409340703>
- Kashima, Y. (2000). Maintaining cultural stereotypes in the serial reproduction of narratives. *Personality and Social Psychology Bulletin*, 26(5), 594–604. Doi: <https://doi.org/10.1177/0146167200267007>
- Lewis, K., Lange, D., & Gillis, L. (2005). Transactive memory systems, learning, and learning transfer. *Organization Science*, 16(6), 581–598. Doi: [10.1287/orsc.1050.0143](https://doi.org/10.1287/orsc.1050.0143)
- Loftus, E.F. (1979). The malleability of human memory. *American Scientist*, 67, 312– 320.

- Loftus, E.F. (2005). Planting misinformation in the human mind: a 30-year investigation of the malleability of memory. *Learning and Memory*, 12(4), 361-366. Doi: [10.1101/lm.94705](https://doi.org/10.1101/lm.94705).
- Luhmann, C.C. & Rajaram, S. (2015). Memory transmission in small groups and large networks: An agent based model. *Psychological Science*, 26, 1909-1917. Doi: [10.1177/0956797615605798](https://doi.org/10.1177/0956797615605798)
- Malafouris, L (2013). *How Things Shape the Mind: A Theory of Material Engagement*. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.
<https://doi.org/10.1111/etho.12074>
- Meade, M. L., & Roediger, H. L., III. (2002). Explorations in the social contagion of memory. *Memory & Cognition*, 30, 995-1009.
<https://doi.org/10.3758/BF03194318>
- Meade, M.L., Nokes, T.J. & Morrow, D.G. (2009). Expertise promotes facilitation on a collaborative memory task. *Memory*, 17, 39–48. Doi: [10.1080/09658210802524240](https://doi.org/10.1080/09658210802524240)
- Mesoudi, A. & Whiten, A. (2004). The hierarchical transformation of event knowledge in human cultural transmission. *Journal of Cognition and Culture*, 4(1), 1-24. Doi: [10.1163/156853704323074732](https://doi.org/10.1163/156853704323074732)
- Mesoudi, A. & Whiten, A. (2008). The multiple roles of cultural transmission experiments in understanding human cultural evolution. *Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society B*, 363, 3489-3501. Doi: [10.1098/rstb.2008.0129](https://doi.org/10.1098/rstb.2008.0129)
- Michaelian, K. & Sutton, J. (2013). Distributed cognition and memory research: History and current directions. *Review of Philosophy and Psychology*, 4(1), 1-24. Doi: [10.1007/s13164-013-0131-x](https://doi.org/10.1007/s13164-013-0131-x)
- Middleton, D. & Brown, S.D. (2005) *The Social Psychology of Experience: Studies in Remembering and Forgetting*. London: Sage.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.4135/9781446221808>
- Muller, F. & Hirst, W. (2014). Remembering stories together: Social contagion and the moderating influence of disagreements in conversations. *Journal of Applied Research in Memory and Cognition*, 3, 7-11. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jarmac.2013.12.002>
- Numbers, K.T., Meade, M.L., & Perga, V.A. (2014). The influences of partner accuracy and partner memory ability on social false memories. *Memory & Cognition*. doi:10.3758/s13421-014-0443-9.
<http://dx.doi.org/10.3758/s13421-014-0443-9>

- Pereira-Pasarin, L. & Rajaram, S. (2011). Study repetition and divided attention: Effects of encoding manipulations on collaborative inhibition in group recall. *Memory & Cognition*, 39, 968-97. <https://doi.org/10.3758/s13421-011-0087-y>
- Rajaram, S. (2011). Collaboration both hurts and helps memory: A cognitive perspective. *Current Directions in Psychological Science*, 20, 76-81. Doi: [10.1177/0963721411403251](https://doi.org/10.1177/0963721411403251)
- Rajaram, S. & Pereira-Pasarin, L.P. (2010). Collaborative memory: Cognitive research and theory. *Perspectives on Psychological Science*, 5, 649–663. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1745691610388763>
- Ren, Y. & Argote, A. (2011). Transactive memory systems 1985–2010: An integrative framework of key dimensions, antecedents and consequences. *The Academy of Management Annals*, 5(1), 189–229. <https://doi.org/10.1080/19416520.2011.590300>
- Roediger, H. L. III, Meade, M. L., & Bergman, E. (2001). Social contagion of memory. *Psychonomic Bulletin & Review*, 8, 365-371. <https://doi.org/10.3758/BF03196174>
- Roediger H. L. III, Meade, M. L., Gallo, D. A., & Olson, K. R. (2014). Bartlett revisited: Direct comparison of repeated reproduction and serial reproduction techniques. *Journal of Applied Research in Memory and Cognition*. Doi: [10.1016/j.jarmac.2014.05.004](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jarmac.2014.05.004).
- Sparrow, B., Liu, J., & Wegner, D. M. (2011). Google effects on memory: Cognitive consequences of having information at our fingertips. *Science*, 333, 776-778. Doi: [10.1126/science.1207745](https://doi.org/10.1126/science.1207745)
- Sterelny, K. (2012). *The Evolved Apprentice: How Evolution Made Humans Unique*. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.
- Stone, C., Coman, A., Brown, A.D., Koppel, J., & Hirst, W. (2012). Toward a science of silence: The consequences of leaving a memory unsaid. *Perspectives in Psychological Science*, 7 (1), 39-53. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1745691611427303>
- Suddendorf, T. & Corballis, M.C. (2007). The evolution of foresight: What is mental time travel and is it unique to humans? *Behavioral and Brain Sciences*, 30, 299-313. Doi: [10.1017/S0140525X07001975](https://doi.org/10.1017/S0140525X07001975)
- Sutton, J. (2008). Between Individual and Collective Memory: interaction, coordination, distribution. *Social Research*, 75(1), 23-48.

- Sutton J., Harris, C.B., Keil, P.G., & Barnier, A. J. (2010). The psychology of memory, extended cognition, and socially distributed remembering. *Phenomenology and the Cognitive Sciences*, 9, 521–560. Doi: [10.1007/s11097-010-9182-y](https://doi.org/10.1007/s11097-010-9182-y)
- Tan, R., & Fay, N. (2011). Cultural transmission in the laboratory: Agent interaction improves the intergenerational transfer of information. *Evolution & Human Behavior*, 32(6), 399-406.
- Theiner G. (2013). Transactive memory systems: A mechanistic analysis of emergent group memory. *Review of Philosophy and Psychology*, 4(1), 65–89. Doi: [10.1007/s13164-012-0128-x](https://doi.org/10.1007/s13164-012-0128-x)
- Wagoner, B & Gillespie, A. (2013). Sociocultural mediators of remembering: An extension of Bartlett’s method of repeated reproduction. *British Journal of Social Psychology*, doi: 10.1111/bjso.12059. Doi: [10.1111/bjso.12059](https://doi.org/10.1111/bjso.12059)
- Wang, Q. (2013). *The Autobiographical Self in Time and Culture*. New York: Oxford University Press. Doi: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1093/acprof:oso/9780199737833.001.0001>
- Wegner, D.M. (1986). Transactive memory: A contemporary analysis of the group mind. In B. Mullen & G.R. Goethals (Eds.), *Theories of Group Behavior* (pp.185-208). New York: Springer.
- Wegner, D. M., Erber, R., & Raymond, P. (1991). Transactive memory in close relationships. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 61, 923-929. Doi: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1037/0022-3514.61.6.923>
- Weldon, M. S., & Bellinger, K. D. (1997). Collective memory: Collaborative and individual processes in remembering. *Journal of Experimental Psychology: Learning, Memory, and Cognition*, 23, 1160–1175. Doi: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1037/0278-7393.23.5.1160>
- Wertsch, J.V. (2002). *Voices of Collective Remembering*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Wertsch, J. V (2009). Collective memory. In P. Boyer & J.V. Wertsch (Eds.), *Memory in Mind and Culture* (pp. 117-137). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. Recuperado de <https://doi.org/10.1017/CBO9780511626999.008>
- Wheeler, M. A., & Roediger III, H. L. (1992). Disparate effects of repeated testing: Reconciling Ballard’s (1913) and Bartlett’s (1932) results.

Psychological Science, 3, 240-24. Doi: <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-9280.1992.tb00036.x>

Wheeler, R., Allan, K., Tsivilis, D., Martin, D. & Gabbert, F. (2013). Explicit mentalizing mechanisms and their adaptive role in memory conformity. *PLoS ONE* 48 8(4): e62106. Doi: [10.1371/journal.pone.0062106](https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0062106).

Wilson, R. A. (2005). Collective memory, group minds, and the extended mind thesis. *Cognitive Processing*, 6, 227–236. Doi: [10.1007/s10339-005-0012-z](https://doi.org/10.1007/s10339-005-0012-z)

Xu, J. & Griffiths, T. L. (2010). A rational analysis of the effects of memory biases on serial reproduction. *Cognitive Psychology*, 60(2), 107-126. Doi: [10.1016/j.cogpsych.2009.09.002](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cogpsych.2009.09.002)

Zerubavel, E. (2003). *Time Maps: Collective Memory and the Social Shape of the Past*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Lucas Bietti: Investigador de la Universidad de Neuchâtel, Suiza.

<http://orcid.org/0000-0002-4380-2615>

Contact Address: lucbietti@gmail.com

Instructions for authors, subscriptions and further details:

<http://hse.hipatiapress.com>

Slavery in a Remote but Global Place: the British East India Company and Bencoolen, 1685-1825

Richard B. Allen¹

1) Editor of the Indian Ocean Studies Series, Ohio University Press

Date of publication: June 23th, 2018

Edition period: June 2018-October 2018

To cite this article: Allen, R.B. (2018). Slavery in a Remote but Global Place: the British East India Company and Bencoolen, 1685-1825. *Social and Education History*, 7(2), 151-176. doi:10.17583/hse.2018.3374

To link this article: <http://dx.doi.org/10.17583/hse.2018.3374>

PLEASE SCROLL DOWN FOR ARTICLE

The terms and conditions of use are related to the Open Journal System and to [Creative Commons Attribution License](#) (CC-BY).

Slavery in a Remote but Global Place: the British East India Company and Bencoolen, 1685-1825

Richard B. Allen

Editor of the Indian Ocean Studies Series, Ohio University Press

Abstract

Histories of the British East India Company usually ignore the company's use of slave labor. Records from its factory at Bencoolen in Sumatra provide an opportunity to examine company attitudes and policies toward its chattel work force in greater detail. These sources reveal that the company drew slaves from a global catchment area to satisfy the demand for labor in its far-flung commercial empire, shed light on policies and practices regarding the treatment of company slaves, and illustrate the company's role in the development of increasingly interconnected free and forced labor trades during the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries. The Bencoolen case study also highlights the need to study colonial migrant labor systems in larger regional and global contexts.

Key words: Bencoolen, British East India Company, Indian Ocean, slave trading, slavery, Southeast Asia.



Esclavitud en un Lugar Remoto pero Global: la Compañía Británica de las Indias Orientales y Bencoolen, 1685-1825

Richard B. Allen

Editor of the Indian Ocean Studies Series, Ohio University Press

Resumen

Las historias de la Compañía Británica de las Indias Orientales generalmente ignoran el uso de esclavos por parte de la compañía. Los registros de su fábrica en Bencoolen, Sumatra, brindan la oportunidad de examinar en mayor detalle las actitudes y políticas de la empresa hacia su fuerza de trabajo. Estas fuentes revelan que la compañía obtuvo esclavos de un área de captación global para satisfacer la demanda de mano de obra en su extenso imperio comercial, arrojan luz sobre las políticas y prácticas con respecto al tratamiento de esclavos de la compañía e ilustran el papel de la compañía en el desarrollo de un creciente número de intercambios de trabajo libre y forzoso cada vez más interconectados a finales del siglo XVIII y principios del XIX. El estudio de caso de Bencoolen también destaca la necesidad de estudiar los sistemas coloniales de migración laboral en contextos regionales y globales más amplios.

Palabras Clave: Bencoolen, Compañía Británica de las Indias Orientales, Océano Índico, tráfico de esclavos, esclavitud, Sudeste Asiático.

2018 Hipatia Press

ISSN: 2014-3567

DOI: 10.17583/hse.2018.3374

Hipatia Press

www.hipatiapress.com



In July 1685, the Governor and Company of Merchants of London Trading into the East Indies, commonly known as the English East India Company (EIC) before 1708 and thereafter as the British East India Company, established a factory at Bencoolen (Benkulen, Bengkulu) on Sumatra's west coast as part of its plan to secure supplies of Sumatran pepper. The settlement, also known initially as York Fort and subsequently as Fort Marlborough, was not the first company establishment on the island. The EIC had already set up a factory further north along the coast at Priaman (Pariaman) which was expected to be the center of its pepper trade on the island, an expectation underscored by the issuance of orders in January 1685 for the *Pryaman* to sail to Madagascar to purchase slaves and carry them to Priaman where they were to be trained as craftsmen capable of building and repairing all kinds of ships.¹ However, the existence of a Dutch East India Company (*Vereenigde Oostindische Compagnie*, or VOC) factory at Priaman and concern about Dutch plans to monopolize the pepper trade to India prompted the EIC's directors to decide in August 1687 to concentrate their Sumatran operations at Bencoolen. At the same time, they ordered 10 slaves on St. Helena, their colony in the South Atlantic, to be sent to York Fort to care for sick soldiers and possibly be used as armed guards.² The directors authorized officials on St. Helena to increase this number to 14 or 16 if they had any additional slaves to spare, but added that none of those to be sent to Bencoolen could come from among the 30 slaves that the island had received earlier from Madras, all of whom, the directors reported, were greatly prejudiced against Bencoolen because of the suffering they had endured during the course of an earlier voyage from Madras to Sumatra.³

This correspondence illustrates that the EIC not only made use of chattel labor, but also shipped slaves thousands of miles to satisfy the demand for such labor at its various establishments (Allen, 2014a, pp. 27-62). The widely scattered and often brief references to slaves in the company's archives (Geber, 1998, p. 101) make it difficult to determine the volume of this traffic with any precision. Available evidence suggests that the company acquired at least 10,000 and perhaps as many as 15,000 to 20,000 African, Indian, Malagasy, and Southeast Asian slaves between the 1620s and late

eighteenth century, mostly between the 1690s and early 1770s. These numbers pale in comparison to the hundreds of thousands of slaves traded by the Dutch, French, Portuguese, and others in the Indian Ocean during the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries, and the more than 2.97 million African slaves estimated to have been shipped across the Atlantic on British vessels during the same period. To assess the company's experience with chattel labor only in terms of the numbers of slaves it acquired, however, is to ignore the larger context within which this traffic occurred, including the need to view European slave trading between 1500 and the mid-nineteenth century as a truly global phenomenon rather than one confined largely to the Atlantic (Allen, 2014a, pp. 2, 19, 47).

Although a handful of scholars have explored aspects of the EIC's experience with chattel labor (Logan, 1956; Platt, 1969; Young, 1989; Harfield, 1995; Jayasuriya, 2009; Winterbottom, 2011; Fox, 2017), histories of the company (e.g., Bowen, 2006; Robins, 2006; Stern, 2009) rarely mention this activity because archival references to slavery at Bombay (Mumbai), Calcutta (Kolkata), and Madras (Chennai), the company's major centers in India, are scarce. However, the records of the "consultations" or managerial meetings at Bencoolen and the factory's correspondence with India and London between its establishment in 1685 and its transfer to the Dutch in 1825 provide an opportunity to examine the company's experience with slave labor in greater detail and situate this activity in more fully developed contexts. The Bencoolen case study is particularly important because it highlights that company policies and practices towards its slaves were shaped, at least in part, by humanitarian considerations, and illustrates the ways in which free and forced migrant labor systems in the European colonial world became increasingly intertwined during the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries (Allen, 2014a, p. 3).

A Global Trade in Microcosm

As elsewhere in the colonial world, the demand for slaves at Bencoolen was driven by a combination of economic, environmental, and other factors, the most salient of which was the unavailability and high cost of local free labor. As early as February 1686, officials at York Fort informed London of their "absolute need" for 50 or 60 slaves because local "Malay" laborers were

expensive to hire, lazy, and difficult to control. Slaves, on the other hand, the fort's managers asserted, could be made to work at all hours and cost little or nothing to maintain since they could be employed in ways that ultimately allowed them to feed themselves.⁴

This belief in the cost-effectiveness of slave labor remained a regular refrain throughout much of the eighteenth century. In February 1704, Richard Watts and his colleagues supported their request for an additional 200 slaves on the grounds that such laborers could do twice the work of Malay "coolies" and cost no more than \$14 a year each to maintain.⁵ Factory officials made similar assertions in 1719 and 1758.⁶ Following its brief occupation by the French in 1760 during the Seven Years' War, officials at a resettled Fort Marlborough likewise justified a request to increase their slave population to 1,000 or 1,200 on the grounds that it cost much less to maintain slaves than to hire local Malays, an argument they repeated two and a half years later.⁷ The further passage of time did little to alter such observations.⁸

Environmental factors also played a role in shaping the local demand for chattel labor. Bencoolen quickly developed a reputation for being unhealthy, and frequent references to the death or infirmity of company employees attest to the impact that disease had on the settlement's inhabitants.⁹ Data on slave morbidity and mortality rates are limited, but scattered reports suggest that the factory's slaves suffered no less than its European residents. In 1705, for example, the settlement's hospital was unable to accommodate all of the slaves suffering from diarrhea.¹⁰ In 1722, the fort's doctor reported that the hospital housed an "abundance" of sick slaves whose recovery was being compromised by the poor quality of their rations.¹¹ Forty years later, 65 of the factory's 354 slaves were reported to be sick in hospital.¹²

Epidemic disease, especially smallpox, posed a particularly serious threat. A smallpox epidemic in 1704 killed a majority of the factory's slaves.¹³ The death of a large number of slaves, including many of the settlement's most skilled workmen, from smallpox in 1748 prompted the company's directors to order the *Swallow* to Madagascar to purchase 250 slaves to replace those who had died.¹⁴ In July 1776, local officials reported a "considerable" reduction in the number of slaves due to an unnamed illness.¹⁵ Eleven years later, despite precautions to prevent the disease from spreading, another serious outbreak of smallpox prompted local officials to

authorize the fort's surgeon to vaccinate the families and servants of the fort's European residents.¹⁶

The company drew slaves from a global catchment area to satisfy this demand for chattel labor. Slave censuses and other sources record the presence of "Coffrees" from eastern Africa and Madagascar, "Malabars" from southern India, and "Malays" from Southeast Asia, as well as men, women, and children identified specifically as coming from Angola, Bali, Bengal, Java, Madagascar, Mozambique, Nias, and Siam. However, as available data on slave ethnicity indicate (Table 1), company personnel preferred Malagasy slaves, a partiality that reflected well-developed beliefs about the purported attributes of the African and Asian peoples with whom they dealt. Malays were almost invariably regarded as lazy and untrustworthy, if not treacherous, while Indians supposedly lacked physical strength and stamina. Malagasies, on the other hand, had a reputation for being more intelligent and harder working than their Asian counterparts. In 1684, the company's directors observed that Malagasy slaves on Barbados were the "most ingenious" of that island's blacks in learning trades such as blacksmithing, bricklaying, carpentry, cooperage, and masonry,¹⁷ a belief that undoubtedly underpinned their 1685 instructions that the Malagasies ordered for Priaman should be trained as craftsmen and artisans. Bencoolen received similar instructions no later than 1713,¹⁸ and continued to do so as the century progressed.¹⁹ As a result, local officials occasionally dispatched small numbers of young Coffree or Malagasy slaves to Madras to be trained as armorers, blacksmiths, bookbinders, bricklayers, and carpenters, as well as training such craftsmen locally.²⁰ Early eighteenth-century assertions that one Malagasy slave was worth two or three from India, three or four from Nias, and three Malays, and that six good Coffrees were capable of doing the work of 20 Asian coolies echoed into the 1760s.²¹ Company-sponsored slaving voyages reflected this preference; Madagascar supplied the cargoes for 48 of the 75 known or authorized/probable company slaving voyages between 1622 and 1772.²²

Table 1

Slave ethnicity at Bencoolen and dependencies, 1713-1781

<u>Ethnicity/Place of Origin</u>	<u>1713</u>	<u>1730^a</u>	<u>1742</u>	<u>1748^a</u>	<u>1755</u>	<u>1766</u>	<u>1781</u>
Angola	---	---	---	---	---	140	49
Bencoolen ^b	---	---	---	---	---	---	221
Coffree	64	---	---	---	67	---	---
Malabar	60	12	18	12	---	---	12
Malagasy	---	108	226	134	245	491	444
Malay	19	---	---	1	---	---	1
Mozambique	---	---	---	---	---	105	146
Nias	45	20	14	15	23	83	41
Other ^c	22	---	---	---	---	---	---
Total	210	140	258	162	335	819	914

Notes: ^a Adults only; ethnicity of children not specified.

^b Locally-born.

^c Includes slaves identified as Batta [*sic*], “Transport,” or “Malefactor.”

Sources: G/35/8, fols. 225, 438r-439v; G/35/9, fols. 131r-133v, 177r-180r; G/35/10, fols. 121r-124v; G/35/14, fols. 87r-98r; G/35/23, [No. 32], List of the Honble Companies Slaves at Fort Marlbro and its Dependencies.

It is difficult to determine how many slaves reached Bencoolen. Slave censuses did not always report the number of slaves at the factory’s substations and are silent about slave births and deaths (Table 2). Information about the number of slaves shipped to the settlement exists for only nine of the known company-sanctioned slaving voyages destined for Sumatra between the 1690s and early 1770s. These ships delivered a total of 873 slaves, mostly Malagasies, between 1714 and 1765 in groups that ranged in size from fewer than 20 to as many as 199.²³ Slaves also reached the settlement in other ways. Officials bought slaves individually or in small groups from persons who called at or lived near the settlement. Such was the case in 1712, when they purchased a twenty-five-year-old Malabar man named January for \$50;²⁴ in 1731, when they secured the services of

158 *Allen – Slavery in a Remote but Global Place*

Andrew, a Malabar boatman, for \$60;²⁵ in 1739, when they paid \$50 each for 12 “able stout men” from a group of 25 Nias slaves offered to them;²⁶ in 1762, when they acquired a Coffree woman and six Coffree men from various parties for \$660;²⁷ and in 1772, when they purchased 29 Balinese men, women, and children for \$1,190, perhaps from one of the Chinese merchants who traded slaves in the region.²⁸

Table 2

Slave population at Bencoolen and dependencies, 1709-1794

<u>Year</u>	<u>Men</u>	<u>Women</u>	<u>Boys</u>	<u>Girls</u>	<u>Total</u>
1709	---	---	---	---	235
1712	81	64	----- 45 -----	-----	190
1713	79	65	14	30	188
c. 1716	---	---	---	---	394
1718	170 ^a	126 ^a	----- 4 -----	-----	300
1725	-----237-----	-----	-----30-----	-----	267
1727	---	---	---	---	217
1730	77	63	17	9	166
1733	85	57	12	15	169
1737	104	61	13	14	192
1742	85	104	38	31	258
1748 ^b	75/82	83/87	26/32	30/36	214/237
1755	146	210	39	37	432
1756	141	179	48	36	404
1758	182	196	49	31	458
1759	187	199	40	34	460
1766	481	217	121	43	862
1767	482	248	128	44	902
1768	467	256	103	53	879
1770	439	274	96	53	862
1778	497	398	125	101	1,121
1782	371	334	112	93	910
1785	302	266	63	76	707
1786	285	261	66	74	686
1794	123	147	49	42	361

Notes: ^a Includes “lusty” boys/girls, i.e., probably adolescents or late adolescents.

^b Two sets of census figures for this year.

Source: Allen, 2014a, pp. 224-25; G/35/9, fols. 131r-133v.

The fort’s chattel population also included men, women, and children transferred to Sumatra from other company establishments. The first transfer from St. Helena may have occurred as early as 1687 following the directors’ order that 10 English-speaking blacks from the island were to be sent to Sumatra.²⁹ The first such transfer from India may have occurred *circa* 1700 when the company’s Court of Directors ordered that any spare Coffrees at Fort St. David (Tegnapatam) on the Coromandel Coast be sent to Bencoolen.³⁰ The 25 confirmed slave transfers from Banjarmasin (Borneo), Bombay, Calcutta, Madras, St. Helena, and Tegnapatam to Bencoolen delivered at least 600 men, women, and children to the settlement (Allen, 2014a, p. 58). Fort Marlborough also sent small numbers of slaves to other company establishments, often to be trained as craftsmen and artisans and as a punishment for serious crimes. The largest such transfer occurred in 1787 when 129 slaves were shipped to the recently-established company settlement at Penang to meet the demand for labor there, 125 of whom reached their destination alive.³¹

“They are Humane Creatures”

In January 1713, the Court of Directors dispatched a letter to Bencoolen on the *Arabella* whose captain was also charged with acquiring 200 Malagasy slaves for the settlement.³² In their letter, the directors admonished local officials to house, feed, and clothe the men, women, and children in their charge properly because, they asserted, “they are humane [*sic*] Creatures.”³³ Four years later, the directors likewise enjoined officials on St. Helena to use their slaves “humanely” because, they noted, “they are Men.”³⁴ Subsequent letters to Fort Marlborough, Fort St. David, and Bombay during the 1730s and 1750s included similar language and admonitions.³⁵

The January 1713 letter was not the first time that officials at Bencoolen received instructions about how to treat their chattel laborers. In August 1687, the company's directors had observed that dry and comfortable lodgings needed to be erected for York Fort's slaves "if you think to keep them serviceable and in health."³⁶ Three years later, the directors advised factory officials that in addition to employing their slaves "prudently," they wanted them used leniently and to have full bellies and adequate lodging. Such practices, the directors continued, would not only help to preserve their lives and health, but also encourage them to increase and multiply, to which end adult males were to be allowed a wife of "their own Cast [*sic*]."³⁷ Bencoolen's managers probably had these instructions in mind when, in 1695, they debated regulations governing slaves' use and care, one consequence of which was to order that the food, clothing, and cash allowances allocated to most slaves would henceforth be given to all slaves, while particularly ingenious and industrious slaves were to be eligible for cash rewards.³⁸ Fourteen years later, the directors admonished York Fort's managers to take care that all of the settlement's inhabitants, including its slaves, had fit food and lodging, and that they were well looked after when they became sick.³⁹

Implicit in these regulations was an understanding, subsequently articulated in the Court's January 1713 letter, that treating company slaves well was economically advantageous: "they are likely to be more beneficial to our Affairs the longer they live."⁴⁰ Later correspondence reflected similar attitudes. The Court's instructions in March 1740 that Bencoolen's slaves were to be employed constantly to the company's benefit were clearly premised on the belief that only fairly treated and properly fed, clothed, and housed men and women would be able to work full time.⁴¹ What is known about the structure and organization of the factory's chattel work force provides additional, albeit circumstantial, evidence that economic self-interest influenced such attitudes. Craftsmen comprised at least 25 percent and sometimes as much as 42 percent of "effective" adult male slaves between 1730 and 1786,⁴² and company officials, who the Court admonished regularly to control costs, were undoubtedly loath to risk the time, effort, and money invested in training these much needed skilled workers.

This concern is all that much more striking given that these sentiments were expressed at a time when Europeans rarely openly acknowledged their

slaves' humanity. That the Court expressed these sentiments explicitly in the 1710s and then again during the 1730s and 1750s comes, however, as no surprise. Michael Fisher (2004, 2006) has detailed the company's efforts during the eighteenth century to alleviate the condition of the Indian and other Asian sailors stranded in England by their captains and return them to their homelands, while various sources attest to the company's long-term commitment to having the slaves transported on its ships reach their destination in good health (Allen, 2014a, pp. 50-54). This humanitarianism continued to manifest itself after Bencoolen's cession to the Dutch in 1825, when company officials sought to intercede on behalf of the freed slaves who had elected to remain at the settlement but then changed their minds and sought repatriation to company settlements at Penang and Singapore.⁴³

Evidence of the extent to which local officials heeded these admonitions is limited mostly to the 1710s. Late in 1714, the factory's managers not only assured their corporate masters that they took "all possible care" of the slaves in their charge, but also hastened to report that the fort's doctor tended to them when they were sick and that only their overseers were permitted to strike them.⁴⁴ Four years later, Stephen Newcome and his council averred that no slaves were "more kindly treated," that they received their full allowances of food, clothing, and incidental spending money, and that they were treated mercifully even for crimes such as murder.⁴⁵ Scattered references to slaves' treatment after the 1710s adopt the same general tone, as in 1753, when the Court received news that the number of buffaloes given to slaves each month for food had been increased to eight.⁴⁶

Instructions to treat the factory's slaves humanely did not, of course, guarantee that they experienced a better quality of life than elsewhere in the European slave-owning world. The archival record includes references to slave quarters being dilapidated and slaves being inadequately clothed and poorly fed because supplies had not arrived from India. The same sources also indicate that local officials often attempted to rectify these problems in a timely, albeit not necessarily long-lasting, manner. A 1695 report that slave huts were "irregularly built" and intermingled among the dwellings of the settlement's resident Portuguese prompted a proposal to tear the huts down and construct new ones within an enclosed *paggar*, or compound, near the waterfront.⁴⁷ Sixteen years later, however, the Coffree *paggar* had become so ramshackle that it needed to be relocated.⁴⁸ In August 1714, the fort's

paymaster received an advance of \$450 to build 30 huts to house the 167 Malagasy slaves who had just arrived on the *Clapham*;⁴⁹ later that year local officials informed London that they were building 60 huts to accommodate the 199 slaves brought by the *Arabella*.⁵⁰ However, these structures' durability apparently left something to be desired; early in 1719, the Court noted that the few houses in the slave compound in good condition had been repaired or rebuilt by slaves themselves with materials they had stolen.⁵¹

Other sources likewise attest to a willingness to take steps to ensure this population's well-being. A 1709 report that the factory's slaves were poorly clothed because suitable cloth had not arrived from India prompted the purchase locally of a small quantity of ordinary gingham as a temporary solution to the problem.⁵² Similar problems in 1711, 1715, 1726, 1727, and 1755 elicited comparable responses.⁵³ In other instances, however, slaves paid the price of the settlement's dependence on supplies from India. In 1745, the possibility that much needed supplies would not arrive from India led to a reduction in slaves' monthly rice allowance.⁵⁴ Twelve years later, both the factory's garrison and slaves faced reduced rations because the surrounding countryside could not furnish sufficient rice to compensate for the supplies that had failed to arrive from India, a problem compounded by the fort's lacking adequate quantities of salt to trade for whatever rice might be had locally.⁵⁵

If company officials sought, at least in principle, to treat factory slaves in a humane manner, these men, women, and children nevertheless remained subject to exploitation and abuse. In 1721, the widespread sexual exploitation of women slaves, often under the guise of having them cook, clean, sew, and wash clothing for the settlement's European residents, spurred official attempts to squelch such "public debauchery."⁵⁶ Slaves were also clearly subject to violence, as in 1711, when Flyamango, a Coffree slave who had been regularly abused and beaten severely, was beaten to death after a failed attempt to escape, and in 1765, when a British sailor killed a Coffree man during an unsuccessful attempt to rape a Coffree woman.⁵⁷ Slaves retaliated in kind, as in 1735, when a slave woman named Hannah was found guilty of poisoning the fort's armorer, a crime for which she was sentenced to be flogged 39 times at each of three places and then kept in irons until she could be transported to Madras.⁵⁸ Slaves also inflicted violence on fellow slaves, as in 1755, when Nias slaves murdered two slave

boys belonging to Reverend Neil,⁵⁹ in 1770, when a Coffree slave named Jack murdered the Coffree woman Nanny,⁶⁰ and in 1780 when a Coffree man seriously wounded a Coffree woman after she refused his advances.⁶¹

Bencoolen's slaves resisted their captivity in various ways that included smoking *bhang* (marijuana) cultivated by the local Chinese community when they could obtain it.⁶² The most public manifestation of slave resistance, however, was maroonage, often toward Dutch-controlled territory.⁶³ In 1711, officials asserted that the slave paggar's decrepit condition and the ready access that slaves had to local Malays facilitated desertions.⁶⁴ The consternation that such activity could arouse is revealed by a 1745 report in which Edward Hurlock noted not only that four of the slaves in his charge (two men and two women) at Moco Moco were missing, but also that an Italian priest had told him of a village near Palembang inhabited by runaway Coffrees. The maroon village's existence prompted Hurlock to express his concern that Sampson and Lymar, the two male escapees in question, both of whom had frequently run away before, might reach this settlement from which they could subsequently "return and encourage others to follow their Example, which he cannot guard against, as the Mallays [*sic*] are afraid to attempt the seizing of them."⁶⁵ While most slaves apparently fled individually or in small groups of two to four persons, they also did so in much larger numbers. In February 1715, at least 19 and perhaps as many as 30 men and women escaped together toward Moosee [*sic*], 90 miles away across the mountains, in the hope of reaching "their own country."⁶⁶ Other larger-scale escapes may also have occurred in 1727, 1737, 1739, 1762, and 1767.⁶⁷ While fugitive slaves were often recovered, some, such as the eight Malabars who escaped from the fort's hospital in 1737, apparently eluded capture.

The activities of a group of fugitives in 1776 offer a rare glimpse into the dynamics of slave society at Bencoolen. These maroons seized a prau which they sailed to Lenow [*sic*] where they set fire to the guard house and pepper warehouse in an attempt to rescue three of their comrades who had been arrested by the station's manager.⁶⁸ Isolated reports of slaves purchasing the freedom of family members provide additional evidence of such social cohesion. In 1714, Congalo, a Bengali slave, petitioned successfully to purchase the freedom of his three-year-old and six-month-old granddaughters for \$20 and then of his twenty-four-year-old daughter, Jenny

Kitty, for \$45.⁶⁹ Four years later, an “old” company slave, Sreelaugah, paid \$40 to free his seven-year-old daughter Goongah even though she was valued at only \$20.⁷⁰ Other sources suggest that slaves and freedmen of the same ethnicity or place of origin maintained a sense of community identity. Such seems to have been particularly true of those from Nias. “Nias people” purchased the freedom of Aneckee, an aged and infirm countryman, in 1732 for \$50; of Peenore, an aged and infirm countrywoman, in 1735 for \$25; and of an unnamed four-year-old child in 1741 for \$15.⁷¹ The sense of community implicit in these acts remained intact more than 40 years later when officials observed that Nias slave women rarely reported the birth of their newborn children who they gave to manumitted relatives and friends to be nursed and raised.⁷²

The Winds of Abolitionism

Although slavery remained an integral part of life at Bencoolen throughout the eighteenth century, the mid-1780s found the factory beginning to be buffeted by the abolitionist sentiments that became part of company discourse until Act V of 1843 formally abolished slavery in the Indian territories under the company’s control (Major, 2012; Allen, 2014a, pp. 179-220). On 20 March 1786, Acting Governor-General John Macpherson and his council proposed emancipating those of the settlement’s slaves capable of supporting themselves,⁷³ the first such proposal of its kind anywhere in the company’s possessions. The proposal elicited the Court of Directors’ approval; in doing so, the Court included instructions that, once manumitted, the settlement’s new freedmen, who were expected to provide their labor for the company when needed or grow pepper, were to be paid at the “usual rate,” while aged and infirm slaves were to receive a small annual pension so they would not want for the necessities of life.⁷⁴ The Court’s letter had, moreover, been approved by the Board of Commissioners for the Affairs of India, commonly-known as the Board of Control or the India Board, before being dispatched to Sumatra. The board, established by the India Act of 1784 to bring the company’s civil, financial, and military affairs under direct governmental supervision, was composed of cabinet ministers and privy councilors who reviewed and amended, if necessary, the Court’s draft correspondence. The board members who sanctioned the emancipation

proposal at Bencoolen included Prime Minister William Pitt the Younger, Henry Dundas, who would play an important role in killing the parliamentary bill of 1792 to abolish the British slave trade, and William Grenville, on whose watch as prime minister (1806-07) Parliament ultimately abolished the British slave trade.⁷⁵

The reasons for this growing humanitarian concern in the company about slavery and slave trading beginning in the mid-1780s remain less clear. Recent scholarship on the connections between calls to reform the British establishment in India and an imperially-inspired evangelical abolitionism suggests that the proposal to emancipate Bencoolen's slaves may reflect, at least in part, a desire to improve the company's image in Britain (Wyman-McCarthy, 2014). There can be little doubt that the proposal to emancipate Bencoolen's slaves was closely linked to at least two practical concerns: the cost of maintaining slaves at a time when the company sought to reduce expenses, and changing perceptions about the cost-effectiveness and efficiency of slave labor. In the first instance, the minutes of the meeting at which slave emancipation at Bencoolen was first proposed noted that doing so would spare the company the substantial expense of caring for this work force; in 1785, those expenses had totaled \$26,000, or more than 11 percent of the factory's annual budget.⁷⁶ Isolated reports from the late 1750s suggest that such costs could easily be higher. The \$520 spent to maintain slaves each month in 1757, for example, accounted for 22 percent of total monthly expenditures;⁷⁷ the following year, the \$544 spent on slaves each month equaled 14.6 percent of all monthly expenditures.⁷⁸ The magnitude of these expenses is revealed in other ways. In 1779, Philip Mannington called for an end to the practice, which cost \$3,800 a year, of giving slaves a buffalo twice a month for food. It would be much less expensive, as well as much more agreeable to the slaves themselves, he opined, to give them a cash grant each month to meet their needs. Doing so, he asserted, would save \$2,000 a year, while clothing slaves with textiles imported from Madras rather than locally purchased cloth would save another \$1,200 to \$1,400 each year.⁷⁹ Eight years later, the dispatch of 129 of Bencoolen's slaves to Penang was calculated to save the settlement \$9,288.⁸⁰

The structure and composition of the fort's slave population and its attendant inability to meet the demand for laborers made these expenses even more burdensome. In 1758, almost 25 percent of the settlement's 237

adult slaves were described as “superannuated.”⁸¹ Twenty-eight years later, more than 18 percent of the factory’s 658 slaves were either superannuated or children too young to work.⁸² A request by the manager of the settlement’s sugar plantation at Benteerin several months later for 30 Coffrees emphasized that the estate lacked an adequate number of workers because most of the 49 slaves who had died or been disabled during the preceding three years had never been replaced.⁸³ Census data confirm that the settlement’s slave population declined dramatically in size between 1778 and 1786 (Table 2).

The 1786 proposal to turn these potential freedmen into wage laborers and independent pepper planters capable of supporting themselves heralded a significant, albeit subtle, shift in company attitudes about the efficiency of slave labor. Four years later, company directors again signaled their belief in the superiority of free labor when they commended Calcutta’s efforts to ensure that the presidency’s peasant farmers enjoyed “the fruits of their industry,”⁸⁴ sentiments they repeated the following year to Madras.⁸⁵ The company’s chairman espoused similar views in 1796 when he observed that “slaves cannot work so cheap as free men, besides we ought to give all our subjects liberty.”⁸⁶

Despite Calcutta and London’s support, the plan to emancipate Bencoolen’s slaves soon foundered over concern about the deleterious economic and socio-political consequences of such an undertaking. In May 1787, local officials observed that it would be “impolitic and dangerous” to emancipate any of the fort’s slaves, in part because they would be unable to grow pepper or support themselves by “handicraft Trades.”⁸⁷ Five weeks later, the settlement’s chief, while acknowledging that this plan may have been inspired “by Benevolence,” argued against it on the grounds that such freedmen “would from the Indolence they have Contracted as Company’s slaves become a Pest to the Settlement and instead of Supplying Necessities, would more like Rob and Plunder for Subsistence.”⁸⁸ In the face of this continued opposition,⁸⁹ the Court withdrew its support for the plan in May 1790,⁹⁰ as a result of which Bencoolen’s slaves would not taste freedom for many more years to come.

It was in this context of labor shortages and possible slave emancipation that Bencoolen became, in 1787, the site of the first company experiment with Indian convict labor. The VOC had pioneered the use of such labor in

the Indian Ocean world by shipping Ceylonese, Chinese, and Javanese prisoners to the Cape of Good Hope within several years of that colony's establishment in 1652, a practice that continued well into the eighteenth century (Ward, 2009; Armstrong, 2012). The British were also no strangers to using such labor, having transported some 50,000 convicts to their American colonies between 1718 and 1775 (Grubb, 2000; Forster, 2002). Concern about the threat that crime posed to public order and ultimately their authority in India encouraged company officials to view convict transportation as a way both to enhance their political legitimacy by publically demonstrating their commitment to law and order, and to meet the demand for inexpensive labor at company establishments. In 1806, Thomas Parr emphasized the cost-effectiveness of such labor when he informed Calcutta that convict laborers at Bencoolen cost only \$3½ a month to maintain compared to the \$5 to \$6 required to hire free Malays. This lower cost prompted Parr to propose that convicts be used to cultivate coffee and nutmegs as well as laboring on public works. Such an undertaking, Parr continued, would allow the settlement to export large quantities of coffee, nutmeg, and mace, the sale of which, he estimated, would yield the settlement and the company profits of £124,500 and £422,700, respectively.⁹¹

A minimum of 2,000 and perhaps as many as 4,000 to 6,000 Indian convicts reached Bencoolen between 1787 and 1825. A directive in 1800 that convicts working for the fort's engineer would be subject to the same regulations as the settlement's Coffrees underscores the ways in which these two labor systems were intertwined.⁹² Bencoolen's success in using convicts to labor on public works led to large numbers of these individuals being sent to the Straits Settlements (Malacca, Penang, Singapore) as well as the Andaman Islands, Burma, and Mauritius. The total number of convicts transported from India remains a subject of debate, but British authorities dispatched at least 74,800 and perhaps 100,000 or more such prisoners overseas between 1787 and 1943, mostly during the first two-thirds of the nineteenth century (Anderson, 2000, 2007a, 2007b, 2012; Sen, 2000; Yang, 2003; Rediker, Pybus, & Christopher, 2007).

Slavery at Bencoolen in Perspective

More than 35 years ago, Nigel Bolland (1981) noted that some of our best insights into how European colonial empires, and colonial labor systems in particular, functioned come from exploring developments on the periphery of empire rather than in imperial centers. Bolland's astute observation, a product of his research on indentured labor relations in the nineteenth-century British West Indies, is equally relevant to attempts to understand slavery and forced labor in European establishments in the Indian Ocean and East Asia. As the Bencoolen case study demonstrates, it is in such an ostensibly remote place on the fringes of its far-flung commercial empire that the company's experience with slavery and slave labor is revealed in greatest detail. In so doing, the Bencoolen case study highlights the need to examine slavery in other European company establishments in the Indian Ocean world. We know very little about slavery and slave trading in the French *Compagnie des Indes*' comptoirs in India such as Chandernagore, Karikal, Mahé, Pondichéry, and Yanam even though these settlements funneled an estimated 24,000 enslaved Indians towards the Mascarene Islands of Mauritius and Réunion between the late seventeenth century and 1810 (Allen, 2004, p. 41). While the VOC's experience with slavery is a subject of ever greater scholarly interest (e.g., Vink, 2003; Raben, 2008; Van Welie, 2008; Ward, 2009; Jones, 2010), many aspects of this activity remain hidden from view.

If the Bencoolen case study deepens our understanding of the EIC's experience with chattel labor, the picture that emerges from this microcosm remains incomplete not only because of the evidentiary problems noted earlier, but also because of the historiographical propensity to examine migrant labor systems, whether "free" or "unfree," in this and other oceanic worlds in isolation from one another. Clare Anderson's perceptive discussion (2009) of the similar ways in which British officials thought about and processed convict and indentured laborers during the early nineteenth century demonstrates that this "tyranny of the particular" in labor studies is no longer sustainable (Allen, 2017). New insights into the origins of the indentured labor trades that scattered more than 2.2 million Africans, Chinese, Indians, Japanese, Javanese, and Melanesians throughout and

beyond the colonial plantation world between the 1830s and 1920s underscore this point (Allen, 2014b).

As Bencoolen's consultations and correspondence with London and India demonstrate, future discussions about free and unfree migrant labor in the eighteenth- and early nineteenth-century Indian Ocean world must also transcend the current preoccupation with enslaved Africans and indentured Indians to include the tens of thousands of Chinese and other Asians who also participated in these labor trades. Scholarship on Chinese labor migration has hitherto focused largely on the years after *circa* 1850 (McKeown, 2004). However, as Craig Lockard (2013) reminds us, Chinese labor migration to Southeast Asia has a much longer history. The ways in which Chinese participated in the increasingly intertwined slave, convict, and indentured labor trades that are a hallmark of late eighteenth- and early nineteenth-century global history remain largely unexplored. The need to do so is highlighted by tantalizing clues found in the EIC's archives. In 1706, for example, the residents of the company's factory at Banjarmasin in Borneo included 70 Chinese laborers as well as 50 slaves, 37 Javanese workers, and 9 European craftsmen.⁹³ Fifty-seven years later, the Court of Directors "hinted" to Calcutta that the *Admiral Watson*, about to sail from England to Sumatra, could be used to procure Chinese laborers as well as Malagasy or other slaves for Bencoolen.⁹⁴ As the company's subsequent involvement in securing Chinese laborers for Trinidad and Ceylon at the beginning of the nineteenth century demonstrates (Allen, 2014a, pp. 198-201), officials in London and the Indian Ocean, unlike many modern historians, understood that satisfying the need for labor could easily encompass the entire globe and the diverse populations that inhabited

Notes

¹ India Office Records, British Library, London: E/3/91, pp. 4, 25, 27-28, 35. All other archival citations are from these records.

² E/3/91, pp. 352, 356, 385.

³ E/3/91, p. 378.

⁴ G/35/1, pp. 61-62.

⁵ G/35/7, p. 3.

⁶ G/35/7, p. 184; G/35/11, fol. 206v (para. 24).

170 Allen – Slavery in a Remote but Global Place

⁷ G/35/13, fols. 4v, 273v.

⁸ G/35/17, [No. 110], Philip Mannington to Court of Directors, 8 June 1779, section headed “Charges Slaves”; G/35/54, John Crisp, Robert Hamilton, and Phillip Braham to Charles Earl Cornwallis, 24 March 1792; G/35/99, p. 113; G/35/112, Fort Marlborough Consultation [hereafter FMC], 14 December 1807, R.S. Perreau to Tho^s Parr, 12 December 1807.

⁹ E.g., G/35/5, Rich^d Watts, Geo. Shaw & Rob^t Broughton, York Fort, to the Hon^{ble} Gov^r Dep^{ty} Gov^r and Committee for Affaires of the R^t Hon^{ble} English East India Company, 14 April 1701 (para. 14); G/35/162, fols. 53r-54v.

¹⁰ G/35/56, fol. 31, York Fort Consultation [hereafter YFC], February 1705.

¹¹ G/35/58, FMC, 20 December 1722.

¹² G/35/71, [1762 Consultations], fol. 26.

¹³ G/35/6, Richard Skingle *et al.* to Court of Managers, 2 January 1708.

¹⁴ G/35/9, fols. 211-212r (para. 15); E/3/110, p. 340 (para. 5).

¹⁵ G/35/16, [No. 118], Robert Hall *et al.* to Court of Directors, 24 July 1776 (para. 17).

¹⁶ G/35/90, fols. 9-10.

¹⁷ E/3/90, p. 4 (para. 14).

¹⁸ E/3/98, p. 257 (para. 4).

¹⁹ E.g., E/3/102, p. 517 (para. 18); E/3/103, pp. 164-65 (paras. 27-28); E/3/104, p. 37 (para. 10).

²⁰ E.g., G/35/60, FMC, 26 September 1728, 19 November 1728; G/35/61, FMC, 13 July 1734, 8 August 1734; G/35/63, FMC, 11 May 1741, 7 August 1742; P/240/1, Fort St. George Public Consultation, 12 September 1733, 28 October 1734; G/35/14, fol. 17v (para. 73).

²¹ E/3/95, p. 584 (para. 12); E/3/97, p. 184 (para. 104); E/3/102, p. 517 (para. 18); G/35/7, p. 126; G/35/12, fol. 810r, (para. 22).

²² Allen, R.B. Unpublished British East India Company slaving voyage inventory, vers. 26 August 2017.

²³ G/35/7, pp. 126-27 (para. 3), 129 (para. 4); G/35/9, fol. 88r; G/35/13, fols. 331v-332r; G/35/71, p. 13; G/35/73, p. 279, 412; L/MAR/B/385A; L/MAR/B/622B.

²⁴ G/35/57, YFC, 22 May 1712.

²⁵ G/35/61, FMC, 29 September 1731.

²⁶ G/35/62, [1739 section], p. 15.

²⁷ G/35/71, [1762 section], fols. 24-25.

²⁸ G/35/79, FMC, 18 January 1772. On Chinese merchants carrying Balinese slaves to Batavia, see Knaap and Sutherland, 2004, p. 153.

²⁹ E/3/91, p. 352.

³⁰ E/3/93, p. 343 (para. 12).

³¹ G/35/52, Letter from Bengal to Fort Marlborough dated 22^d December 1786; G/34/2, pp. 574-87.

³² E/3/98, pp. 260-62.

³³ E/3/98, p. 257 (para. 3).

³⁴ E/3/99, p. 494 (para. 57).

³⁵ E/3/106, pp. 25-26; E/3/116, [Court of Directors to] Fort Marlborough, 23 November 1733 (para. 8); E/3/111, p. 210; E/3/111, p. 385.

³⁶ E/3/91, p. 385.

- ³⁷ E/3/92, p. 120 (para. 4).
³⁸ G/35/3, pp. 34, 40.
³⁹ E/3/96, p. 761 (para. 19).
⁴⁰ E/3/98, p. 257 (para. 3).
⁴¹ E/3/118, [Court of Directors to] Fort Marlborough, 28 March 1740 (para. 7).
⁴² G/35/8, fols. 438r-439v.; G/35/9, fols. 221r-224r; G/35/10, fols. 121r-124v, 126r; G/35/11, fol. 424; G/35/23, [No. 75], List of Slaves belonging to the Honble Comp^y under the Superintendent [Fort Marlbro, 16th March 1786].
⁴³ F/4/1184/30747, Correspondence with the Governments of the Netherlands Possessions in India and of Prince of Wales Island &^c respecting the removal from Bencoolen of certain Free Bengalees, and others, who were left there at the cession of that Place to the Dutch; F/4/1307/51937, Further Correspondence relative to the removal of emancipated Slaves and Convicts at Bencoolen....
⁴⁴ G/35/7, p. 129 (para. 6).
⁴⁵ G/35/7, p. 184 (para. 92).
⁴⁶ E/4/5 p. 437.
⁴⁷ G/35/3, p. 35.
⁴⁸ G/35/57, YFC, 13 April 1711.
⁴⁹ G/35/57, YFC, 12 August 1714.
⁵⁰ G/35/7, p. 129 (para. 6).
⁵¹ E/3/100, p. 315 (para. 55).
⁵² G/35/56, FMC, 19 November 1709.
⁵³ G/35/57, YFC, 3 July 1711, 27 June 1715; G/35/59, FMC, 20 August 1726; G/35/60, FMC, 3 May 1727; G/35/68, FMC, 1755.
⁵⁴ G/35/64, p. 312.
⁵⁵ G/35/11, fol. 47r.
⁵⁶ G/35/58, Diarys & Consultations att Bencoolen Factory, April 1721; G/35/67, pp. 178-85.
⁵⁷ G/35/57, York Fort Diary, entry after 18 March 1712, Stephen Bailhon to John Hunter, 13 March 1712; G/35/73, p. 4.
⁵⁸ G/35/61, FMC, 21 April 1735, 28 April 1735.
⁵⁹ G/35/10A, p. 78 (para. 48).
⁶⁰ G/35/78, pp. 28-32.
⁶¹ G/35/85, p. 164.
⁶² G/35/62, [1738 section], p. 124; G/35/67, FMC, 8 July 1758.
⁶³ G/35/73, p. 163.
⁶⁴ G/35/57, YFC, 13 April 1711.
⁶⁵ G/35/64, pp. 216-17.
⁶⁶ G/35/7, p. 137 (paras. 79-81).
⁶⁷ G/35/60, FMC, 24 October 1727; G/35/62, [1738 section], p. 118, and [1739 section], p. 15; G/35/75, p. 132.
⁶⁸ G/35/16, [No. 118], para. 9, Robert Hall *et al.* to Court of Directors, 24 July 1776.
⁶⁹ G/35/57, YFC, 18 February 1713/14, 28 April 1714.
⁷⁰ G/35/58, FMC, 12 July 1718.

- ⁷¹ G/35/61, FMC, 13 November 1732, 29 January 1734/5; G/35/63, FMC, 21 February 1740/1.
- ⁷² G/35/89, fol. 402.
- ⁷³ G/35/156, fol. 55v.
- ⁷⁴ F/3/3, p. 108 (para. 5).
- ⁷⁵ F/3/3, p. 108 (para. 5). See also Blackburn, 1988, pp. 146, 150, 306-15, 466.
- ⁷⁶ G/35/156, fol. 42v.
- ⁷⁷ G/35/11, fol. 186v.
- ⁷⁸ G/35/11, fol. 425v.
- ⁷⁹ G/35/17, No. 110, Section head: “Charges slaves,” Philip Mannington to Court of Directors, 8 June 1779.
- ⁸⁰ G/35/90, fol. 491.
- ⁸¹ G/35/11, [No. 535], A List of Slaves & Transports belonging to the Honourable Company at Fort Marlbro & its Dependencies, 21 February 1758.
- ⁸² G/35/23, [No. 75], List of Slaves belonging to the Honble Comp^y under the Superintendent [Fort Marlbro, 16th March 1786].
- ⁸³ G/35/89, fol. 184.
- ⁸⁴ F/3/5, No. 765 (para. 55), Draft Paragraphs...of Fort William in Bengal [before 8 May 1790].
- ⁸⁵ F/3/36, No. 902, Draft Paragraphs...of Fort S^t George [before 2 May 1791].
- ⁸⁶ David Scott to Herbert Harris, Calcutta, 16 May 1796, in Philips, 1951, p. 76.
- ⁸⁷ G/35/90, fols. 219-20.
- ⁸⁸ G/35/157, pp. 21-22.
- ⁸⁹ G/35/52, Letter from Bengal to Fort Marlborough dated 31st March 1788; G/35/158, pp. 170-74.
- ⁹⁰ G/35/43A, p. 126. The Board of Control approved this draft letter three days later.
- ⁹¹ F/4/259/5666, pp. 28-33, 36-37. Calcutta subsequently approved Parr’s proposal (F/4/259/5666, pp. 78-79).
- ⁹² G/35/100, p. 114.
- ⁹³ G/35/7, p. 39.
- ⁹⁴ E/4/617, p. 702.

References

- Allen, R.B. (2004). The Mascarene slave-trade and labour migration in the Indian Ocean during the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries. In G. Campbell (Ed.), *The structure of slavery in Indian Ocean Africa and Asia* (pp. 33-50). London: Frank Cass.
- Allen, R.B. (2014a). *European slave trading in the Indian Ocean, 1500-1850*. Athens, OH: Ohio University Press.

- Allen, R.B. (2014b). Slaves, convicts, abolitionism and the global origins of the post-emancipation indentured labor system. *Slavery and Abolition*, 35(2), 328-48. doi: [10.1080/0144039X.2013.870789](https://doi.org/10.1080/0144039X.2013.870789)
- Allen, R.B. (2017). Ending the history of silence: reconstructing European slave trading in the Indian Ocean. *Revista Tempo* [Brazil], 23(2). doi: [10.1590/TEM-1980542/x2017v230206](https://doi.org/10.1590/TEM-1980542/x2017v230206)
- Anderson, C. (2000). *Convicts in the Indian Ocean: transportation from South Asia to Mauritius, 1815-53*. London: Macmillan Press.
- Anderson, C. (2007a). *The Indian uprising of 1857-8: prisons, prisoners and rebellion*. London: Anthem Press.
- Anderson, C. (2007b). Sepoys, servants and settlers: convict transportation in the Indian Ocean, 1787-1945. In F. Dikötter & I. Brown (Eds.), *Cultures of confinement: a history of the prison in Africa, Asia and Latin America* (pp. 185-220). Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press.
- Anderson, C. (2009). Convicts and coolies: rethinking indentured labour in the nineteenth century. *Slavery and Abolition*, 30(1), 93-109. doi: [10.1080/01440390802673856](https://doi.org/10.1080/01440390802673856)
- Anderson, C. (2012). *Subaltern lives: biographies of colonialism in the Indian Ocean world, 1790-1920*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Armstrong, J.C. (2012). The Chinese Exiles. In N. Worden (Ed.). *Cape Town between east and west: social identities in a Dutch colonial town* (pp. 101-27). Auckland Park, South Africa: Jacana Media.
- Blackburn, R. (1988). *The overthrow of colonial slavery*. London: Verso.
- Bolland, O.N. (1981). Systems of domination after slavery: the control of land and labor in the British West Indies after 1838. *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, 23(4), 591-619. Retrieved from https://www.jstor.org/stable/178395?seq=1-page_scan_tab_contents
- Bowen, H.V. (2006). *The business of empire: the East India Company and imperial Britain, 1756-1833*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Fisher, M.H. (2004). *Counterflows to colonialism: Indian travellers and settlers in Britain, 1600-1857*. Delhi: Permanent Black.
- Fisher, M.H. (2006). Working across the seas: Indian maritime labourers in India, Britain, and in between, 1600-1857. In R.P. Behal & M. van der

- Linden (Eds.), *Coolies, capital, and colonialism: studies in Indian labour history* (pp. 21-45). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Forster, C. (2002). Convicts: unwilling migrants from Britain and France. In D. Eltis (Ed.), *Coerced and free migration: global perspectives* (pp. 259-91). Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press.
- Fox, C. (2017). *A bitter draught: St. Helena and the abolition of slavery, 1792-1840*. Norfolk, UK: Society of Friends of St. Helena.
- Geber, J.L. (1998). *The East India Company and southern Africa: a guide to the archives of the East India Company and the Board of Control, 1600-1858* (unpublished doctoral dissertation). University of London.
- Grubb, F. (2000). The transatlantic market for British convict labor. *Journal of Economic History*, 60(1), 94-122. Retrieved from [https://www.jstor.org/stable/2566798?seq=1 - page_scan_tab_contents](https://www.jstor.org/stable/2566798?seq=1-page_scan_tab_contents)
- Harfield, A. (1995). *Bencoolen: a history of the honourable East India Company's garrison on the west coast of Sumatra (1685-1825)*. Barton-on-Sea, UK: A. and J. Partnership.
- Jayasuriya, S. (2009). East India Company in Sumatra: cross-cultural interactions. *African and Asian Studies*, 8, 204-21.
- Jones, E. (2010). *Wives, slaves, and concubines: a history of the female underclass in Dutch Asia*. DeKalb, IL: Northern Illinois University Press.
- Knaap, G., & Sutherland, H. (2004). *Monsoon traders: ships, skippers and commodities in eighteenth-century Makassar*. Leiden: KITLV Press.
- Lockard, C.A. (2013). Chinese migration and settlement in Southeast Asia before 1850: making fields from the sea. *History Compass*, 11(9), 765-81. Doi: <https://doi.org/10.1111/hic3.12079>
- Logan, F.A. (1956). The British East India Company and African slavery in Benkulen, Sumatra, 1687-1792. *Journal of Negro History*, 41(4), 339-48. Retrieved from <https://www.jstor.org/stable/2715359>
- Major, A. (2012). *Slavery, abolitionism and empire in India, 1772-1843*. Liverpool: Liverpool University Press.
- McKeown, A. (2004). Global migration, 1846–1940. *Journal of World History*, 15(2), 155–89. doi: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/20068611>

- Philips, C.H. (Ed.). (1951). *The correspondence of David Scott, director and chairman of the East India Company, relating to Indian affairs, 1787-1805*, vol. 1. London: The Royal Historical Society.
- Platt, V.B. (1969). The East India Company and the Madagascar slave trade. *William and Mary Quarterly*, 3rd ser., 26, 548-77.
- Raben, R. (2008). Cities and the slave trade in early-modern Southeast Asia. In P. Boomgaard, D. Kooiman, & H.S. Nordholt. *Linking destinies: trade, towns and kin in Asian history* (pp. 119-40). Leiden: KITLV Press.
- Rediker, M., Pybus, C., & Christopher, E. (2007). Introduction. In E. Christopher, C. Pybus & M. Rediker (Eds.), *Many middle passages: forced migration and the making of the modern world* (pp. 1-19). Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Robins, N. (2006). *The corporation that changed the world: how the East India Company shaped the modern multinational*. London: Pluto Press.
- Sen, S. (2000). *Disciplining punishment: colonialism and convict society in the Andaman Islands*. New Delhi: Oxford University Press.
- Stern, P.J. (2011). *The company-state: corporate sovereignty and the early modern foundations of the British empire in India*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Van Welie, R. (2008). Slave trading and slavery in the Dutch colonial empire: a global comparison. *New West Indian Guide/Nieuwe West-Indische Gids*, 82(1 & 2), 47-96. Retrieve from https://www.jstor.org/stable/43390702?seq=1 - page_scan_tab_contents
- Vink, M. (2003). 'The world's oldest trade.' Dutch slavery and slave trade in the Indian Ocean in the seventeenth century. *Journal of World History*, 14(2), 131-77. Retrieved from https://www.jstor.org/stable/20079204?seq=1 - page_scan_tab_contents
- Ward, K. (2009). *Networks of empire: forced migration in the Dutch East India Company*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

- Winterbottom, A. (2011). From hold to foredeck: slave professions in the maritime world of the East India Company, c. 1660-1720. In M. Fusaro & A. Polónia (Eds.), *Maritime history as global history* (pp. 95-124). St. John's, NL: International Maritime Economic History Association.
- Wyman-McCarthy, M. (2014). Rethinking empire in India and the Atlantic: William Cowper, John Newton, and the imperial origins of evangelical abolitionism. *Slavery and Abolition* 35(2), 306-27. doi: <https://doi.org/10.1080/0144039X.2013.800277>
- Yang, A.A. (2003). Indian convict workers in Southeast Asia in the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries. *Journal of World History*, 14(2), 179-208. Retrieved from https://www.jstor.org/stable/20079205?seq=1 - page_scan_tab_contents
- Young, R.J. (1989). Slaves, coolies and bondsmen. A study of assisted migration in response to emerging English shipping networks in the Indian Ocean, 1685-1776. *Indian Ocean Review*, 2(3), 23-26.

Richard B. Allen: Editor of the Indian Ocean Studies Series, Ohio University Press.

Contact Address: rallen1@framingham.edu

Instructions for authors, subscriptions and further details:

<http://hse.hipatiapress.com>

The Historical Effects of Centralization of Egyptian Islamic Higher Education

Mohammed Sabrin¹

1) Taibah University, Saudi Arabia

Date of publication: June 23th, 2018

Edition period: June 2018-October 2018

To cite this article: Sabrin, M. (2018). The Historical Effects of Centralization of Egyptian Islamic Higher Education. *Social and Education History*, 7(2), 177-197. doi:10.17583/hse.2018.3347

To link this article: <http://dx.doi.org/10.17583/hse.2018.3347>

PLEASE SCROLL DOWN FOR ARTICLE

The terms and conditions of use are related to the Open Journal System and to [Creative Commons Attribution License \(CC-BY\)](#).

The Historical Effects of Centralization of Egyptian Islamic Higher Education

Mohammed Sabrin
Taibah University (Saudi Arabia)

Abstract

This study compared how the centralization of Egyptian Islamic Higher Education historically affected educational quality, probity of school management and general levels of and appreciation for Islamic knowledge. This research compared characteristics of Egyptian Islamic Higher Education during four pivotal historical periods: the early medieval period (623-1300s C.E.); the 15th century; the 16th and 17th centuries; and the period of British and French colonization (the 19th and 20th centuries). The logic behind choosing these time periods for comparison was that they represented times of significant centralization/decentralization. Upon analysis of the effects of centralization and de-centralization, it has been found that the centralization of Islamic Higher Education in Egypt has had negative effects. It was identified that the centralization of Islamic Higher Education played a central role in decreasing educational quality, increasing corruption, decreasing general levels of and appreciation for Islamic knowledge, and even supporting Imperial initiatives. Such findings are important given the current geopolitical situation of increasing centralization of Egyptian Islamic higher education.

Key words: centralization, Islamic, Higher Education, Egypt, historical analysis

Los Efectos Históricos de la Centralización de la Educación Superior Islámica Egipcia

Mohammed Sabrin
Taibah University (Saudi Arabia)

Resumen

Este estudio compara cómo la centralización de la educación superior islámica egipcia ha afectado históricamente la calidad educativa, la probidad de la gestión escolar y los niveles generales de apreciación del conocimiento islámico. La investigación ha comparado las características de la educación superior islámica egipcia durante cuatro períodos históricos fundamentales: el período medieval temprano (623-1300s C.E.); el siglo XV; los siglos XVI y XVII; y el período de colonización británica y francesa (siglos XIX y XX). La lógica para la selección de estos períodos se debe a que representan épocas de significativa centralización/descentralización. Tras el análisis de los efectos de la centralización y la descentralización, se ha identificado que la centralización de la educación superior islámica en Egipto ha generado efectos negativos. Esta jugó un papel central en la disminución de la calidad educativa, el aumento de la corrupción, la reducción de los niveles generales y la apreciación del conocimiento islámico, e incluso del apoyo a las iniciativas imperiales. Tales hallazgos son importantes dada la situación geopolítica actual, con una creciente centralización de la educación superior islámica en Egipto.

Palabras Clave: centralización, islámico, educación superior, Egipto, análisis histórico

From the Medieval to the present, Islamic Higher Education in Egypt has witnessed an intense process of centralization. This study compares how, over time, the centralization of Islamic Higher Education affected educational quality, probity of school management and general levels of and appreciation for knowledge. This research involves comparing characteristics of Egyptian Islamic Higher Education at four pivotal points in time: the early medieval period (623-1300s C.E.); the 15th century; the 16th and 17th centuries; and the period of British and French colonization (the 19th and 20th centuries). The logic behind choosing these particular time periods for comparison is that they represent times of significant centralization/ decentralization of Egyptian Islamic Higher Education; upon analysis of the effects of (de) centralization, many useful lessons can be derived for suggestions on improving modern day Egyptian Islamic Higher Education.

Background of Islamic Education in Muslim-majority¹ countries

Seeking knowledge has been of particular interest in Muslim-majority countries for a long time, especially since what is academically² considered the advent of Islam, beginning with the first Qur’anic revelation—“Read/Recite! In the name of your Lord, who has created all that exists...” (Qur’an 96, v1) in the seventh century C.E. In Islam, acquisition of knowledge—the two types being that gained through revelation and that gained through the senses—is justified and directed by the provision that all knowledge gained be used in worship of the creator (defined broadly as any belief, speech, or action that pleases God as outlined in the Qur’an and Sunnah) (Halstead, 2004). Accordingly, the most important type of knowledge in Islam is theological, meaning understanding the will and nature of *Allah* (Arabic for ‘God’) through the Qur’an (the literal word of God) and Sunnah (way of prophet Muhammad, peace be upon him, on how to apply the former) (Uthaymeen, 2004).

Throughout Islamic history, once *ulamaa* (sg: *Alim*, ‘scholars of the theological sciences’) mastered foundational texts in theology, they would utilize this knowledge as lenses to support and guide the development of entire sciences (thereby fulfilling a communal obligation in knowledge production). There was never an artificial barrier constructed between

empirical sciences and revelation because Islam legislates that two Truths cannot contradict each other—and that Tawheed (the oneness of God and that none has the right to be worshipped except Him) implies a certain unity and intrinsic harmony in the universe due to the oneness of the creator. Seeking knowledge was for the purpose of increasing 'God consciousness' among people (Iqbal, 2007; Progler, 2001).

Unfortunately, much of modern (19th century onward) research done in the West on the Middle Eastern educational systems of the Middle Ages has glossed over most *non-theological* education that occurred in fields ranging from Medicine to Architecture; the result has been the confection of a revisionist history where the religious sphere of society was somehow divorced from the rest (Iqbal, 2007; Kincheloe & Steinberg, 2004, p.130), a political initiative probably highly motivated by modern debates on the role of 'religion'³ ('deen') in Muslim-majority societies (Turner, 2007). Such selective memory leads to an easily consumed myth for a progressive-minded audience: that such people, who supposedly have nothing but theological knowledge, would either be particularly unsuitable for the modern world, or—an even more extreme presumption—that maybe Medieval Muslim-majority countries were even secular all along. This imagined history came into play later when colonialists needed to create a perceived inferiority in the 'native' cultures of those they conquered to justify their promotion of the Secular Humanist ideal, secularism (Kincheloe & Steinberg, 2004, p. 128)—not without parallels in our own age of neo-colonialistic endeavors.

De-centralized Islamic Education In The Early Middle Ages

During the early Middle Ages, roughly the first 400 years of Islam (7th century-11th century), education in Muslim-majority societies revolved around the mosque, which is actually the center of most social activity in Islam. By the 14th century, Alexandria alone would have approximately 14,000 mosques (Szyliowicz, 1973, p. 53). Not only a place for ritual worship, the mosque was where Muslims irrespective of ethnicity, origin, age, or gender gathered to learn Islamic knowledge of various types—proper recitation of Qur'an, *Tafseer* (exegesis of the Qur'an), *Hadeeth* (the narrations of the Sunnah and their sub sciences), *Fiqh* (jurisprudence,

meaning the various rulings derived from the Qur'an and Sunnah), Arabic language and poetry, History, Medicine, and many others (theological and empirical). It would not be uncommon to find a 'student' population of a very sundry composition, from students who were ulama themselves to laymen, in the hundreds in one gathering called a *halaqa* (a circle of people around a alim giving a lecture). Islamic education in a mosque was very informal with most decision-making regarding everything from curriculum to schedules carried out by the individual ulama offering the lectures. Understandably, such an egalitarian method of education forged a strong Islamic identity and reinforced social cohesion (Berkey, 1992, pp. 7, 20; Gunther, 2006).

Specifically for children, a system of elementary education schools also existed, which were fairly indistinguishable from the *Kuttabs* (elementary schools with a little more focus on memorization of Qur'an). Both socialized students into a Muslim identity by memorizing the Qur'an by the time they were 8-9 years old, and taught them general skills like learning how to read and write, basic Geography, and Math. Teachers at these schools were expected to maintain high moral character as role models, have memorized the Qur'an, and know the basics of non-theological subjects (Szyliowicz, 1973, pp. 54, 57). Quality of education seems to have been praiseworthy at these schools given the high appreciation for Islamic knowledge that the above-mentioned principles promoted (Gunther, 2006). Upon finishing elementary schools/kuttabs, students could either enter directly into various trades and professions or continue onto *madaaris* for higher education which consisted of a base of one or more *Sharia* based—theological—sciences. Thereafter, students could choose to either specialize within this general theological base or build upon it and delve into other forms of positivistic natural or social sciences (Gesink, 2006, p. 327).

The *Madrassa* (pl. *madaaris*, lit: 'a place of study') was the central formal educational institution throughout roughly the second half of Medieval Egypt (11th century to 16th century). *Madaaris* were places of higher education usually attached to a mosque, and were funded by *awqaaf* (sg. *Waqf*)—theological endowments from charity contributions, usually in the form of a building or piece of land preserved to be used for theological purposes. *Awqaaf* were protected from taxes and state seizure (Gesink, 2006, p. 326). The term 'madrassa' was used interchangeably with 'mosque' since in reality a formal location was irrelevant to the learning process;

hence, madaaris still provided the same de-centralized structure as mosques. Decision-making regarding the structure and components of Islamic Higher Education was still made locally by the (usually unpaid) ulamaa who taught in the Madaaris. Accordingly, madaaris were only as good as their teachers, the ulamaa; ergo, after students had memorized the Qur'an and a certain amount of hadeeth they would start studying various treatises/books with their *Shaykh* (more or less a synonym for *Alim*). Ideally, texts were memorized as they were learned in depth—for example a hadeeth might be explained in regard to its place in *seerah* (the prophet's history), jurisprudence rulings, grammar, points of benefit, etc. Also, given that most ulamaa were not paid for their services, usually performing other forms of manual labor to fund themselves, ulamaa were more likely to be learning and teaching Islamic knowledge for metaphysical rewards as opposed to material ones (Gunther, 2006; Hefner & Zaman, 2007, pp. 45-47).

As it has probably been noticed, there was no 'high school' stage of education between elementary school and higher education mentioned here; this is because there was no concept of 'teenage hood' in most pre-modern societies. Therefore, graduates of kuttabs and others around the age of puberty either entered directly into madaaris/mosques or into the 'working world.' This study focuses on the experience of those who went to madaaris to continue a *formal* education (which would probably still be considered somewhat *informal* by current standards); however, even those that entered the formal labor force still participated in Islamic education given its central role in Muslim societies.

Quality Islamic education was a communal activity that hinged less on books or institutions than on whom one actually learned and received an *ijaza* from ('authorization to pass on their knowledge'); education was a very personal experience (Berkey, 1992, pp. 16, 18; Niell, 2006, pp. 484-485). Given the importance of the Alim in Islamic education, a student was expected to take up to two months in choosing a teacher, choosing on the basis of the *Alim's* own teachers' reputation, age, and character. The centrality of the teacher was evident in the fact that biographical dictionaries of medieval scholars listed all the scholars an alim had learned from and usually nothing about where the learning actually took place, except maybe just the region (which you could often just tell from the alim's last name) (Berkey, 1992, pp. 22-24). Needless to say, simply learning from a book was

considered illegitimate knowledge, and books themselves were just used for reference (Gunther, 2006). As guardians of the spiritual well-being of the society, ulamaa constructed intricate measures to preserve Islamic education as seen for example in the details of the ijaza or 'degree' system that was developed. Al Tusi, a medieval Alim, explained how, “memorizing two words is better than hearing two pages, but understanding two words is better than memorizing two pages”, which highlights that scholars differentiated between *riwaya*, the ability to memorize and transmit knowledge, and *diraya*, the ability to critically analyze it and apply it contextually. This differentiation was reflected in what type of authorization one had to teach; ijazas ranged in degrees, from general transmission of knowledge (*tadrees*) to issuing legal fatwas using that knowledge (*iftaa'*), corresponding to the level of comprehension attained (Berkey, 1992, pp. 30-31). A fact often overlooked in discussions of the role of memorization in Islamic education (often politically motivated to portray a zombie-like system with no critical thought).

The ulamaa even had 'teaching assistants' (with varying levels such as *musamli*, *mufid*, and *mu'id*); these were advanced students of the shaykh who would repeat in a loud voice the lecture to others far away in the halaqa, explain various ideas and highlight points of benefit to those he was responsible for (Berkey, 1992, pp. 40, 42). This shows the great concern that ulamaa had as they believed themselves to be 'inheritors of the prophets' (as goes the belief in theological scripture) in maintaining the high standards of Islamic education. Being that so much of the authority in Islamic higher education was decentralized to local ulamaa, the pressure was also on them to uphold the quality, integrity, and spread of Islamic education to the masses (Gunther, 2006).

Centralizing Egyptian Islamic Higher Education

The first madrasa or university in general is famously known as al-Azhar (founded in Egypt by the Fatamids in the late tenth century), but madaaris can actually be traced back as early as ninth century Iran. The most famous madrasa of the early medieval period was that of Nizam al-Mulk, the Persian vizier to the Saljuq, in the late 11th century (Hefner & Zaman, 2007, p. 43). The Egyptian capital's first madrasa was built by Saladin in 1170 during the

Ayyubid dynasty. After the devastation of Baghdad by the Mongol invasion in 1258, Cairo slowly turned into the cultural/educational capital of the Muslim ummah⁴ (Berkey, 1992, p. 9). By the 14th and 15th centuries, madaaris had widely flourished under the Mamlukes and had become much more systematized as the Mamluke ruling class heavily sponsored the building and maintenance of madaaris. Surprisingly, despite this patronage, the Mamlukes left the educational system very decentralized in most decision making like that which concerned curriculum, pedagogy, and structure (Hefner & Zaman, 2007, p. 45). This is even more unexpected since the Mamlukes (lit: 'one who is owned') were a military elite captured as slaves from wars and bred to be the successive rulers (in no way an inherited dynasty), and they married from local ulamaa families (Berkey, 1992, p. 11). Nonetheless, madaaris under the Mamlukes were fairly autonomous; only rarely would a waqf specify issues such as what subjects would be taught or at what times (Berkey, 1992, pp. 79, 87). One of the most famous of these madaaris and which provides an ideal prototype was al-Ashrafiyya in Cairo. It was constructed and endowed as a waqf by Sultan al-Ashraf Barsbay. It had four halls surrounding the central courtyard, provided monthly salaries for the school's instructional staff, stipends for ten to twenty-five students per class, housing accommodations for students, and doubled as a mosque (as most madaaris did) (Berkey, 1992, p. 54).

Throughout the 15th century, madaaris flourished and became the major sector of employment for educational (ulamaa, 'professors', 'teacher's assistants', *qadis*, 'judges', etc.), 'religious' (preachers, *muezzins*, people that announce the calls to prayer, Qur'an recitors, etc.), administrative (financial administrators, controllers, notaries, etc.), and supportive positions (everything from doctors and librarians to gatekeepers, janitors, and incense burners) (Berkey, 1992, pp. 63-66). Madaaris had become so systematic that ulamaa were often given paid leave for visiting family, making hajj, and being ill; there was even a system for substitute teaching (Berkey, 1992, pp. 92, 116). However, such increasing formality in the Mamluke educational system also had its drawbacks; now *appointments* in madaaris were heavily influenced if not selected by the Mamluke elite, giving preference to those who supported their initiatives. Centralizing decision-making under the authority of the ruling elite started to cause corruption and the financial

compensation now given to ulamaa had also begun to negatively affect ulamaa's scholarship and work ethic (Al-Jabartee, 1997).

Given the new material prospects and stability offered by the more bureaucratic educational system spread by the Mamlukes, many ulamaa lost sight of the metaphysical rewards of their efforts and viewing academia as a mere occupation became more prevalent. This also caused educational quality to suffer. Many 'professorships' were assigned in exchange for monetary 'gifts', and ibn Khaldun even lamented that many of the Mamluke elite started endowing schools as awqaaf as a way to manipulate the Islamic system of inheritance in a way that would benefit their heirs (Berkey, 1992, pp. 97, 134). As the scholars grew more and more dependent on the ruling elite, they grew less spiritual and sincere to their expected initial intentions for seeking knowledge—worship.

Numerous scholars (especially those who still taught traditionally, in mosques) themselves complained about the spread of extravagance among many scholars associated with the formal madaaris--their fancy clothes and turbans, lack of studiousness and serious scholarship, and ostentatious manners. One such alim, al-Subki, criticized the lowering of educational standards due to this trend, complaining “they look at *Mashariq al-anwar* of al-Saghani, *Masabih* of al-Baghawi and call themselves *muhadithun* [Hadeeth scholars]... and maybe study *Jami' al-usul* and '*Ulum al-Hadeeth* after that, or its abridgement by al-Nawawi, and they call themselves *muhaddith* of the *muhadithun*” (Berkey, 1992, pp. 184, 187). For someone to actually reach the level of these tomes (most of these are ten to thirty volumes long) would be quite an accomplishment in the present when there are very few major ulamaa left, but during that time period of scholarship, such works entailed a novice level of expertise. Closer ties between the ruling elite and ulamaa made many of the latter take lightly the hadeeth that “Whoever seeks knowledge to compete with the scholars or to debate with the ignorant ones *or so that the people's faces can turn towards him*, then Allah will enter him into the Hellfire” (USC, emphasis added). The negative effects of the centralization of Islamic higher education are even more apparent when sharply contrasted with the brief years of de-centralized madrasa administration under the Ottoman dynasty in the 16th and 17th centuries.

Brief Decentralization

In the 16th century, the Ottoman Empire had taken over control of Egypt, but since the Ottomans' power was on the decline, Egypt retained a certain amount of autonomy. Throughout the 16th and 17th centuries, the Ottoman empire did not have much influence on the culture or daily dealings of Egyptian society mainly because it was involved with many other political crises and wars, trying to maintain its sovereignty and the integrity of its borders as a whole; hence, it did not try to 'Ottomanize' Egypt's educational system or impose its language once it gained control of Egypt (Daly, 1998, pp. 1-26). Even the local Egyptian viceroys did not manipulate or exert authority over madaaris during this time. This autonomy meant that neither the Ottoman elite nor the local Egyptian viceroys tried to impose political influence over the structure and appointments over the madaaris as the Mamlukes did, returning sovereignty and political neutrality to Egyptian madaaris.

The negative consequence to this sovereignty was that the Ottomans hardly sponsored the opening of any new Egyptian madaaris, leaving al-Azhar as the main, if not only, formal institution for Islamic higher education in Egypt by the 18th century (Al Jabartee, 1997). However, quality of Islamic higher education greatly improved during this time as tremendous scholarship was produced (Al Sirjaany, 2005); accordingly, quality proved more important than quantity as students of Islamic knowledge flocked from all over the Muslim world to learn at al-Azhar, making al-Azhar the hub of Islamic higher education as it brought in international talent and expertise (Daly, 1998, pp. 88-91, 96). The quality of Islamic higher education and its importance in societal cohesion had a positive correlation with the decentralization of decision-making and relative economic independence of educators from the ruling elite.

A Glance at Informal Islamic Higher Education for Comparison

Further proof of this correlation between the quality, access, and influence of Islamic higher education on the one hand and its de-centralization on the other may be seen in the fact that there is little or no recorded evidence of a pattern of decreasing educational quality, marginalization of the importance

of Islamic education, or increased corruption in the *informal* sector of Islamic higher education as political regimes rose and fell—they were relatively unaffected due to their distance from royal happenings (Al-Jabartee, 1997). In fact, many great non-madrasa affiliated ulamaa also appeared throughout the medieval period, possibly more than those officially employed by madaaris, like Hasan al-Basri (9th century), Khateeb al-Baghdadi (11th century), Ibn Athir (12th century), Ibn Taymiyya (13th century), Ibn Kathir (14th century), and al-Jabarti (18th century) (Al Salaaby, 2006; Najeebabadi, 2000).

Many such non-madrasa employed scholars had the best libraries in the Muslim world with everything from theological and astronomy related works to poetry and medicine. Even more amazing is that these scholars' libraries were often open for public use (and even borrowing)—people from all levels of the social scale (from incense burners to doctors) travelled to use their libraries (Daly, 1998, pp. 97-10; Iqbal, 2007). This had tremendous benefits in increasing literacy and knowledge acquisition among the masses since most people would not attend madrasas by the 18th century when there was only Al Azhar left (Al Salaaby, 2006; Najeebabadi, 2000). For example, al-Jabarti was an amazing scientist, historian, and theological Alim whose house was always filled with students. Some of them even lived with him and married from his family. Many students would often travel to just come see al-Jabarti's father's medical instruments (Al-Jabartee, 1997). Furthermore, most of the positive empirical sciences in Muslim-majority countries actually developed outside formal madaaris during the Middle Ages (Ali, 2009; Iqbal, 2007). The higher quality of informal Islamic higher education (which was decentralized by its very nature) offers further evidence of the positive correlation between decentralization of authority and better educational quality and access in formal Islamic Higher Education as it existed in the Middle Ages.

Hence, Napoleon would later record that one-third of the population of Cairo were literate, a relatively high figure for 1798. The effect of informal education on literacy was also apparent in the large number of 'vulgar' works, simplified summaries of larger theological works (many about how to be a good overall Muslim) designed for laymen—some even using colloquial Arabic by the 18th century (Daly, 1998, pp. 105, 109).

Looking back, it seems the best Islamic education was provided by ulamaa independent of any expectations from the ruling elite, whether in the formal or informal sector. Similar advice was given by prophet Muhammad when he stated “Whoever approaches the ruler’s gates becomes afflicted. Whenever a servant [Muslim] draws closer to the ruler, he only gains distance from Allah”, and by his companions when they warned “Don’t go, even if they ask you to visit them just to recite *qul huwallaahu ahad* [the first verse of the smallest chapter in the Qur’an]” (USC, 39). These admonitions highlight the concern of prophet Muhammad and his companions with preventing Islamic education from being manipulated by elite rulers for their political ambitions. Underscoring this concept is the general apprehension about wealth’s potential spiritual drawbacks if not used for the pleasure of God (such as charity, etc.) as also expressed by prophet Muhammad when he said the “biggest test/trial for my *Ummah* (nation) is wealth” (USC, 512). Lack of autonomy for educators left Umma more susceptible to the whims of the ruling elite and damaged the state of formal Islamic higher education in Egypt as explicated even by local historians of that era such as Al-Jabartee (1997).

The introduction of increased material benefits that could be earned by madaaris ulamaa if they became supportive appendages to the political regime in the late Middle Ages led to the decrease of educational quality, corruption, and decreased appreciation for the Islamic education they held in general. As al-Azhar became the bastion for Sunni Islam in 18th century Egypt, theological authority became even more centralized, and subsequently easier to manipulate as a mouthpiece for French and British colonizers.

Colonization and Neo-colonization Vis á Vis Centralization

In October 1798 the French colonized Egypt. Al-Azhar was pelted with canons, raided, and desecrated as French soldiers destroyed al-Azhar’s libraries and relieved themselves on the remains, slaughtering anyone they came upon (Dykstra, 1998; Kincehloe & Steinberg, 2004, p. 127). Napoleon tried to find ulamaa to justify his invasion as a rescuer coming to free the Egyptians from the Turks; however, some ulamaa like al-Jabarti stood up to this onslaught (Al Salaaby, 2006; Al Sirjaany, 2005). The French knew the

strongest resistance to their forces would come from the ulamaa and other theological sectors of society; hence, they focused on subverting Islamic education, the roots of Islamic culture. One French author exclaimed, “We, the masters, should seize on our subjects in their early youth. We shall change the tastes and habits of the whole people...after the pattern of our laws” (Kincehloe & Steinberg, 2004, p. 128). Nonetheless, Napoleon would later find those who would 'trade their souls' for power and appointed ulamaa like Shaykh Khalil al-Bakri to promote popular support for the French occupation; those that didn't become 'government scholars' either fled the country or at least left their positions; some were killed in rebellions like those at al-Azhar (Daly, 1998, p. 125). Being that al-Azhar was now the main locus of Islamic education, it left the ulamaa all in one place for easy manipulation (Al-Jabartee, 1997; Hussein, 2008). By 1801, The French had been driven out of Egypt and Muhammad Ali emerged as official viceroy for the Ottoman Empire; now Ali planned to re-educate Egypt with Western military expertise/technology and accelerate Egyptian industrialization to keep European hegemony at bay (Fahmy, 1998). However, in arming Egypt with the previous colonizer's empirical sciences to fend off their canons, he replaced Islamic higher education with Western cannons (Kincehloe & Steinberg, 2004, p. 128).

Muhammad Ali, implemented a Western (French, British, and Italian) model of secular education in Egypt through 'civil schools' which trained students in military skills, engineering, medicine, foreign languages, and agriculture among other things; this process was called *Modernization* (Ofori-Attah, 2008, pp. 15, 18). However, this expansion was done at the expense of Islamic education; most periphery theological institutions were closed and al-Azhar (which Ali took control of through *patronage* of ulamaa) was overburdened with providing Islamic higher education for the entire country (Fahmy, 1998). The integrity of most establishment ulamaa had been severely compromised as will be detailed shortly. The technocratic graduates replaced al-Azhar graduates in the workforce as well. Foreign teachers were brought in to teach at the civil schools, and the student-centered pedagogy that was once symbolic of Islamic education was replaced by a lecturing ('banking') method transplanted from British Lancaster schools (Gesink, 2006, pp. 328-329). These Lancaster civil schools were used to create an obedient labor mentality among the masses,

while reserving intellectual activity for the new secular Western based universities being opened up for the elite--ideal for defending Western interests in the region (Szyliowicz, 1973, p. 127). Accordingly, the quality of Islamic higher education sharply decreased. Any issues that contradicted the Western value system became susceptible to adjustment and now intensity of education *really had* stopped at mere memorization (theological texts and everything else); the importance of Islamic higher education waned (Hussein, 2008). Since al-Azhar was the last institute for Islamic higher education and control of it was centralized under Muhammad Ali, the marginalization of Islamic higher education was decisive and would prove arduous to reverse.

Under de facto British control throughout the early 20th century, various descendents of the Ali dynasty continued this intellectual colonization as most remnants of local history, culture, and *deen* were removed from education (Gesink, 2006, pp. 329-330; Hunter, 1998). The growing civil schools also reduced access to education as a whole due to the new fees and preliminary language tests required for entrance, under Lord Cromer of Britain, which classified many more Egyptians as 'illiterate' (Ofori-Attah, 2008, p. 18). In short, the Modernization of Egyptian education throughout the early 20th century effectively secularized society and marginalized Islamic culture and education to the periphery—neo-colonization through a local but Western educated ruling class, which allowed for a 'semblance of native legitimacy' (Hussein, 2008; Kincheloe & Steinberg, 2004, p. 149). Islamic education's last institution, al-Azhar, was losing what little effect and legitimacy it still had in society.

Ali had also sent many *ulamaa* to France who not only brought back with them military science and technological expertise, but an entire Western liberal value system; *Modernization* came to mean *Westernization* (Hefner & Zaman, 2007, p.114; Tageldin, 2011). Modernism presented 'religion' as irrational (by the European Enlightenment definition) and Secular Humanism as rational and civilized (Moore, 2007, pp. 36, 57-58). At the time that Ali sent them, he simply intended to gain the scientific (as in the empirical based, not the more philosophy related social based sciences) expertise from the West, but those sent abroad did not get a customized curriculum; they also received the 'hidden curriculum' of Western liberal values (Hussein, 2008, pp. 19-20; Tageldin, 2011). These *ulamaa* were

highly affected by the Saint Simonists, believers in the 'religion of social science' to culturally and industrially *develop* Egypt, who tried to effectively replace *deen* with Western philosophy—like that of Voltaire and Maistre—and even more pragmatically with the belief system of nationalism (contrary to the Islamic precept of identity based on *deen* above any territorial/cultural labels) (Hussein, 2008, p. 16, 21; Kincheloe & Steinberg, 2004, pp. 142-144). Hasan al-Attar for example was sent to learn in Paris and later returned as an al-Azhar Alim to teach modernist reformer Tahtawi, who was key in Westernizing Egyptian schools (Imaara, 2011).

Tahtawi was not just impressed by French empirical science, he also tried to apply Western philosophy to theological texts and was one of the earliest Secular Humanist Muslims in the Muslim world calling for a new customized Islam that would agree with the Western value systems that he believed to be the new *deen* for the future. He praised nationalism, mixing of the sexes, and essentially any Western cultural trait as necessary for material progress, deeming practically the importation of any value system or behavior beneficial as long as it developed the economics of the country (Ali, 2009; Imaara, 2011; Sabrin, 2013; Tageldin, 2011). Most *ulamaa* were furious at this total disregard for Islamic culture and priorities to the extent that they labeled such *ulamaa* 'protestant'; however, there was little they could do while they remained employed by al-Azhar. Many scholars (Azhari and non-Azhari) spoke out against this intellectual colonization, but as Muhammad Ali had *de facto* marginalized other madrasas outside of al-Azhar and controlled the official discourse coming from al-Azhar, most views that didn't support the political regime were silenced (Hussein, 2008, pp. 22-24, 106).

Later protégés of Tahtawi throughout the 20th century, like Muhammad Abduh, would continue this cycle of neo-colonization through education, carrying the banner for a new *modern* Islam (Kincheloe & Steinberg, 2004, p. 129). The natural conclusion of the Secular Humanist beliefs Abduh inherited from Tahtawi was argued to be secularism and Islam was slowly pushed out of the public sphere (Hussein, 2008, pp. 91, 142; Sabrin, 2013). Contrary to what some scholars have often posited, that Islamic values themselves would have been somehow in conflict with Western empirical science or technology (Spring, 2006, p. 153), it seems it was rather the liberal value system that posed a problem for the native population as

modern studies of the Egyptian population suggest (Cook, 1999, p. 11). It seems Ali benefitted from Western expertise in the empirical sciences, but participated in his own country's intellectual neo-colonization in the process. Through centralized control of Islamic higher education in Egypt, quality declined, corruption of ulamaa seems to have been unavoidable, and Islamic higher education itself was de facto almost eliminated from society since it was so directly responsive to the political initiatives of one man, the head of state.

By the late 19th century, al-Azhar was the last Madrasa representing Islamic higher education in Egypt. Due to the military weaknesses perceived after French and British colonization, Muhammad Ali had sought to restructure the higher education system in Egypt by pushing Islamic higher education to the periphery and focusing tertiary education on military and industrial expertise he had transplanted from Western Europe. However in doing so, Ali delegitimized the last source of formal Islamic higher education in Egypt (al-Azhar), and placed it at the whims of his political regime. Since control of al-Azhar was completely centralized under Ali, Islamic higher education was manipulated as a source for justifying the political regime's Modernization/ Westernization of Egyptian society. By entrusting all decision making to the ruling elite, al-Azhar was no longer a place for quality Islamic scholarship, but rather an official mouthpiece for the government (Hefner & Zaman, 2007, p.108).

Under Egyptian president Gamal abd al-Nasser in the 1950s, awqaaf were "nationalized" completely (taken over by the ruling dictator) and the Reform Law of 1961 re-centered al-Azhar's "function and religious authority around the military ruling elite" (Hefner & Zaman, 2007, p. 117). The *Shaykh al-Azhar* (highest position in al-Azhar) rank and salary was made that of a regular government minister and the appointed were paid to issue *fatwas* (Islamic legal rulings) at the request of the ruler; non-government ulamaa were forced to resign (Hefner & Zaman, 2007, p. 118). Being that ulamaa were pressured to either comply with political demands or lose their position in the last madrasa representing Islamic education; this compromised the integrity of any ulamaa wishing to have a serious public voice in society. Islam was consequently marginalized from the public sphere and replaced with an intellectual neo-colonization of the mass Egyptian population until the 1970s when an Islamic revival would later

occur (Hussein, 2008). However, al-Azhar the sole *official* institute of Islamic higher education seems to have been effectively re-designed as a government medium. While most Egyptians now look to non-government ulamaa (at mosques and on television) for spiritual guidance, Islam does not seem to be as pervasive a means of identification and fabric of social cohesion as it was before.

Conclusion

From the Medieval to the Modern, the centralization of formal Islamic Higher Education in Egypt seems to have had negative effects. We have illustrated how, over time, the centralization of Islamic Higher Education played a central role in decreasing educational quality, increasing corruption, decreasing general levels of and appreciation for Islamic knowledge, and even supporting Imperial initiatives. In the early Medieval Islamic history of Egypt, Islamic education was highly accessible to the general masses, of high quality, and was pursued as a means to becoming more God conscious. Islamic education was an act of worship with solely metaphysical rewards. Islamic theological education was the primary source of identity and created a culture of knowledge among Egyptians since as far as we know the percentage of Muslims was not much different from the modern day statistics of roughly 93% of the population. Since there were no material benefits to Islamic education and the ulamaa who controlled it locally were autonomous, away from political pressures and influences, the integrity of formal Islamic education was preserved and flourished from the mosque to the madrasa.

However, throughout the 15th century when Islamic higher education become highly centralized, quality, the spiritual essence of formal Islamic education, and its place in society, suffered as madrasas themselves became primarily limited to higher education—realistically limiting the student population to a minority of the population—and became a mere occupation for material gain for many involved.

During the 16th and 17th centuries, numerous examples were given of how although lack of state sponsorship and decentralization often affected the *quantity* of Islamic higher education institutions, *quality* increased. Examples were also provided from informal Islamic higher education as

additional support for the positive effects of decentralized Islamic higher education.

Under the extreme centralization of Muhammad Ali in the 19th and 20th centuries, Islam itself was relatively speaking removed from the public sphere and replaced by Western philosophy and culture since centralization had reduced Islamic higher education to one institute whose credibility had been reduced to a mere mouthpiece for the ruling elite—whether indigenous or colonial in nature. This latter point has been one of the most important contributions of this study—the role that centralizing Islamic higher education in Egypt played in the colonial history of the country—facilitating political and intellectual colonialism.

Today, there has been much demand for Islamically compatible higher education in Egypt despite what little empirical research is allowed on such topics (Cook, 1999, p. 6). It has been seen that if Islamic higher (or pre-collegiate for that matter) education is to be revitalized in Egypt, ulama should be autonomous and independent of the ruling elite as to provide quality Islamic higher education that not only increases intellectual awareness of Islam, but re-positions it as a source of spiritual reinvigoration amidst the rampant socio-economic predicaments that exist. This seems to be a necessary first step to reviving Islamic education—its theological and empirical branches. It would not be a stretch of the imagination to say that more decentralization of Egyptian educational institutions in general would only increase quality of education given the unfortunate autocratic atmosphere even post WWII in Egypt. As much of the South is still struggling for liberation in a supposedly postcolonial era, there seems no escaping from the fact that without truly ‘free’ academic institutions, political and economic freedom will also remain a fantasy.

Note

¹ This term is used to avoid the exclusionary nature of ‘Muslim World’ that seems to portray Muslims living without interaction with non-Muslim controlled territories or that there were no non-Muslims living in Muslim-controlled territories. ‘Islamic World’ is also avoided since it seems to imply an Orientalist image that all happenings in such territories were solely directed by the dictates of theological scripture irrespective of culture, political factors, personal interests, etc.

² This is the perspective prevalent in modern day academic scholarship in contrast to the Islamic theological perspective that God only revealed one religion with initial differences merely in subsidiary issues, and that various peoples' tampered with certain aspects of scripture historically to produce the various 'man-made' variations that exist today as separate 'religions'.

³ In Arabic, the language of the Qur'an and Sunnah, the word religion actually doesn't exist; the closest translation is 'deen' (way of life), one of the points that highlights the tension between Islam and secularism to the present.

⁴ Muslims believe that all the prophets (i.e.: Adam, Abraham, Jesus, Muhammad, etc.) all originally came with the same central message of *Tawheed* (worshipping only God), but different 'branches' or details (how to pray, etc.) contextual to their time period and location; each Prophet had their own 'branches' for their particular ummah (the ummah of the Jews, of the Christians, etc.), but all still technically 'Muslims' as long as they followed whatever legislation (*Sharia*) their Prophets came with at that time. Basically, they chose to do 'istislaam' or 'Islam' (which means submission) to the message their Prophet came with; hence, they were Muslim. Prophet Muhammad is believed to be the final Prophet from his time until judgment day for humanity. The Muslim *ummah* refers to the Islamic belief that all humans born after Prophet Muhammad's prophethood are technically considered from the ummah of Muhammad in a general sense (the *ummat al dawa* or 'invitation'), but those who choose to accept this invitation by believing and following him are the more specific *ummat al ijaaba* (ummah of those who responded), who are called Muslims today.

References

- Ali, S. I. (2009). *A'laam tarbiyya fil hidaara al islaamiyya*. Al Qaahira: Dar Al Salaam.
- Al Jabartee, A.A. (1997). *Ajaa'ib Al Aathaar fil taraajim wal akhbaar*. Al Qaahira: Al Kutub Al Misriyya.
- Al Jabartee, A.A. Translation by Shmuel Moreh. (2001). *Napoleon in Egypt: Al-Jabarti's chronicle of the French occupation, 1798*. Princeton: Markus Wiener Publishers.
- Al Salaaby, A. (2006). *Al Dawlah Al Uthmaaniyya*. Cairo: Dar Al Tawzee' wal Nashr.
- Al Sirjaany, R. (2005). *Al Mawsoo'a al muyassarah fit tareekh al islaamy*. Al Qaahira: Iqra'.

- Berkey, J. P. (1992). *The transmission of knowledge in medieval Cairo: A social history of Islamic education*. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press.
- Cook, B. J. (1999). Islamic versus western conceptions of education: Reflections on Egypt. *International Review of Education*, 45(3), 339-357.
- Daly, M. W., & Petry, C. F. (1998). *The Cambridge history of Egypt*. Cambridge; New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Dykstra, D. (1998). The French occupation of Egypt, 1798-1801. In *The Cambridge history of Egypt*. Cambridge; New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Fahmy, K. (1998). The era of Muhammad 'Ali Pasha, 1805-1848. In *The Cambridge history of Egypt*. Cambridge; New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Gesink, I. F. (2006) Islamic reformation: A history of madrasa reform and legal change in Egypt. *Comparative Education Review*, 50(3).
- Gunther, S. (2006). Be masters in that you teach and continue to learn: Medieval Muslim thinkers on educational theory. *Comparative Education Review*, 50(3).
- Halstead, M. (2004). An Islamic concept of education. *Comparative Education*, 40(4).
- Hefner, R. W., & Zaman, M. Q. (2007). *Schooling Islam: The culture and politics of modern Muslim education*. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press.
- Hunter, R. (1998). Egypt under the successors of Muhammad 'Ali. In *The Cambridge history of Egypt*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Hussein, M.M. (2008). *Al-Isaam wal hidaara al gharbeeya*. Al Qaahira: Maktabat ibn Taymiyya.
- Imaara. M. (2011). *Al A'maal Al Kaamila li Rifaa'a Raafi' Al Tahtaawee*. Cairo. Maktabitnaa.
- Iqbal, M. (2007). *Science and Islam*. Westport, Connecticut: Greenwood Press.
- Kincheloe, J. L., & Steinberg, S. R. (2004). *The miseducation of the west: How schools and the media distort our understanding of the Islamic world*. Westport, Conn.: Praeger Publishers.
- Mitchell, T. (1988). *Colonising Egypt*. Cambridge Cambridgeshire; New York: Cambridge University Press.

- Moore, D. L. (2007). *Overcoming religious illiteracy: A cultural studies approach to the study of religion in secondary education* (1st ed.). New York: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Najeebabadi, A. S. (2000). *The history of Islam*. New York: Darussalam.
- Neill, C. M. (2006). Islam in Egyptian education: Grades K-12. *Religious Education, 101*(4), 23.
- Ofori-Attah, K. (2008). *Going to School in the Middle East and North Africa*. Westport: Greenwood Press.
- Progler, J. (2001). *Encountering Islam*. London: Routledge.
- Sabrin, M. (2013). *Exploring the intellectual foundations of Egyptian National Education*. Dissertation. The University of Georgia.
- Spring, J. H. (2006). *Pedagogies of globalization: The rise of the educational security state*. Mahway, N.J: L. Erlbaum Associates.
- Szyliowicz, J. S. (1973). *Education and modernization in the Middle East*. N.Y.: Cornell University Press.
- Tageldin, S. (2011). *Disarming words: Empire and the seductions of translation in Egypt*. Berkeley: University of California press.
- Turner, B. S. (2007). Islam, religious revival and the sovereign state. *Muslim World: A Journal Devoted to the Study of Islam and Christian-Muslim Relations, 97*, 405-418.
- University of Southern California (2009, Nov. 12). USC-MSA Compendium of Muslim Texts. Retrieved from:
<http://www.usc.edu/dept/MSA/fundamentals/hadithsunnah/muslim/>
- Uthaymeen, M. I. S. (2004). *The Book of Knowledge (Vol. 1)*. (A. A. M. A., Chaudry, Trans.). London: Invitation to Islam.

Mohammed Sabrin: Taibah University

ORCID ID: <https://orcid.org/0000-0002-0602-7517>

Contact Address: msabrin@taibahu.edu.sa

Instructions for authors, subscriptions and further details:

<http://hse.hipatiapress.com>

A History of childhood

Marta Font¹

1) Universitat Rovira i Virgili (Spain)

Date of publication: June 23rd, 2018

Edition period: Edition period: June 2018-October 2018

To cite this article: Font, M. (2018). A history of childhood [Review of the book]. *Social and Education History* 7(2), 198-200. doi: 10.17583/hse.2018.3301

To link this article: <http://dx.doi.org/10.17583/hse.2018.3301>

PLEASE SCROLL DOWN FOR ARTICLE

The terms and conditions of use are related to the Open Journal System and to [Creative Commons Attribution License](#) (CC-BY).

Reviews (I)

Pal Adam, I. (2016). *A history of childhood*. Cambridge, Uk: Polity Press.

As the title of the book exposes, its main goal is to present and describe the changes in the concepts of “children” and “childhood” in the west countries from Medieval to Modern Times, through the analysis of the particular nature of childhood along the ages. The book is structured in three sections and twelve chapters, which address the main characteristics of childhood and their evolution, the discoveries of modernity and the main contributions of the 20th Century, which have set the bases of new conceptions towards a long childhood and adolescence.

The first section “Changing conceptions of childhood” presents the differences and similarities observed when analyzing artistic, religious and scientific approaches of childhood from the middle ages to the 20th century, as well as the main related discoveries, their causes and consequences. The first chapter “Conceptions of childhood in the middle ages” aims to evidence that, despite the existing tendencies that deny the role of children in the middle ages, the current notion of childhood is rooted in this medieval conception.

In the second chapter “The quest for a turning point”, the author provides evidences of how the enlightenment’s discoveries represented a shift in the conception of childhood, promoting general interest in children development and promoting the general prolongation of this stage.

Chapter 3 “Some themes in the cultural history of childhood” is focused on the evolution of certain aspects traditionally associated to childhood, such as innocence, depravity, dependence and nurture.

The second part of the book “Growing up in the Family” provides an in-depth analysis of the role of children within the family, their interactions with other relatives and particularities of their daily life.

Chapter 4 “The start of a new life” is a historical approach to the desire of children and how the reduction in the number of children per family was associated with the higher importance attributed to their wellbeing.

The chapter “A precarious Infancy” presents the main barriers towards the ideal development of childhood through history, centered on some of the causes of children mortality: nourishment, hygiene and child rearing difficulties, infanticide and child abandonment.

The next chapter “Early Childhood, age two to seven” draws a global landscape of the traditional characteristics of this first stage, highlighting the relation between children and their main caregivers, such as mothers, fathers, further relatives and nurses, children’s first education and early training focused in hygiene, walking and talking.

Finally, the chapter “Later Childhood, age seven to fourteen” analyzes further relations with parents, emphasizing domestic labors’ distribution, children’ contribution to family economy, marriage and home leaving.

The last section of the book “Children in a wider world” summarizes children’s role outside their family circle, addressing topics as employment, education and health. The first chapter in this section “Children at work in agricultural societies” exposes the main occupations of children in agrarian and proto-industrial sectors: household for girls, workshop apprentices for boys and fruit gathering and animal feeding for both. In these contexts, children employment was uncontroversial, as it was characterized by helping their parents in light tasks.

The following chapter “Child labour and industrialization” draws a complementary narration of the previous one, as when steel and textile industry reached occidental countries, children exploitation was increased and intensified, with risky jobs in factories that disturbed children’s health and welfare.

Chapter 10, entitled “Children’s Leisure activities” is focused on the influence of socialization and peer-interactions on their further personal development. It also presents the main leisure activities, such as reading, sport, joining youth movements and drama societies.

In the chapter “Children’s health” the improvements in children health and reduction of mortality are deeply analyzed, mainly caused by better nutrition practices and living conditions which derived to the persistence of economic and social inequalities.

Lastly, the chapter “The child and the school” is oriented towards the shift from labor to school world, which represented the cornerstone of the current conception of childhood. In this chapter, the progress from the earlier workshop apprenticeship to national educational systems is considered the main cause of the improvement, not only in children’s cultural level, but also in their physical condition and social welfare.

Summarizing, the book describes the main changes in the lives of children, specially accentuated since the industrialization which led to an increasing on the occidental economy and, consequently to an improvement on the living conditions of most children. Thus, children became healthier and happier, attended school and joined leisure activities with other children, reaching better living conditions and further possibilities of personal success.

Marta Font
Universitat Rovira i Virgili
marta.font@estudiants.urv.cat

Instructions for authors, subscriptions and further details:

<http://hse.hipatiapress.com>

Pedagogy of Oppressed

Nerea Gutiérrez Fernández¹

1) Universidad de Deusto (Spain)

Date of publication: June 23rd, 2018

Edition period: Edition period: June 2018-October 2018

To cite this article: Gutiérrez, N. (2018). Pedagogy of Oppressed [Review of the book]. *Social and Education History* 7(2), 201-203. doi: 10.17583/hse.2018.3578

To link this article: <http://dx.doi.org/10.17583/hse.2018.3578>

PLEASE SCROLL DOWN FOR ARTICLE

The terms and conditions of use are related to the Open Journal System and to [Creative Commons Attribution License](#) (CC-BY).

Reviews (II)

Freire, P. (2018). *Pedagogy of the Oppressed*. Bloomsbury Publishing House, New York.

Este libro, uno de los más citados en los programas de las universidades de impacto internacional y de los más referenciados en las bases de datos, ha influenciado a educadores del mundo entero. Su autor, Paulo Freire habla en él sobre las perspectivas de la educación en el mundo y propone una pedagogía como nueva forma de relación entre el educador y el educando. Sustenta una pedagogía en la que los individuos aprendan a formarse a través de situaciones del día a día, es decir, una pedagogía para el sujeto que debe construir su realidad a través de las circunstancias que generan el devenir cotidiano, pues será así cuando podrán reflexionar y analizar en detalle el mundo en el que viven. Además, Freire habla de una pedagogía liberadora donde el método deja de ser el instrumento con el cual el educador manipula a los educandos y pasa a ser un acto de comprensión y análisis del contenido. Unido a esto, destaca el uso del diálogo como elemento de aprendizaje. Además, resulta que esto es indispensable pues el ser humano no se hace en el silencio sino en la palabra, la acción y la reflexión. Como se explica a través de la siguiente cita la educación se convierte en una relación bidireccional en la que tanto el docente como el discente aprenden mutuamente y contribuyen a la educación de manera integral: “El educador ya no es solo el que educa sino aquel que, en tanto que educa, es educado a través del diálogo con el educando, quien, al ser educado, también educa (p.72)”.

Sin embargo, siendo el 50 aniversario de este libro, considero fundamental resaltar la importancia mantenida de esta obra a lo largo de los años pues el pensamiento pedagógico de Freire continúa vigente hoy en día, y como Flecha menciona, lo que Freire definía como acción dialógica es la tendencia actual en las ciencias sociales. Esta edición cuenta así con una

nueva introducción realizada por Donaldo Macedo y un epígrafe por Ira Shor. Al final, incluye las entrevistas de varios académicos, tales como Noam Chomsky, Gustavo E. Fischman, Peter Mayo o Ramón Flecha, entre otros, quienes aportan una visión más cercana, auténtica, y sin lugar a dudas, especial a este libro. Pues, como se recoge en ellas, muchos tuvieron la fortuna y el honor de trabajar y colaborar con el autor. En las entrevistas se destaca el impacto del trabajo realizado por Freire en el área de la pedagogía. La mayoría de los académicos coinciden en que por medio del trabajo realizado por el pedagogo se ha demostrado que merece la pena perseguir las experiencias democráticas en la educación, pues nos llevan hacia la igualdad y solidaridad. Coincidiendo con esto, Marina Aparicio Barberán menciona que ella elegiría el análisis crítico de distintas realidades como un aspecto fundamental de este libro.

De especial interés resulta la respuesta que da el catedrático Ramón Flecha cuando se le pregunta qué impacto considera que el trabajo de Freire ha tenido en la investigación. Recoge que el efecto ha sido extremadamente positivo y que las perspectivas dialógicas han ayudado a establecer un diálogo con las personas que son objeto de estudio. Sin embargo, destaca que en muchas ocasiones el sentido con el que Freire entendía la palabra diálogo no ha sido adecuadamente utilizada o entendida.

Espero que el trabajo de Freire continúe “to push scholars to consider the complicated ways identities and locations need to be nuanced in discussions about education”, como recoge Valerie Kinloch.

Hace pocas semanas, tuvimos la gran suerte de acudir a un acto de conmemoración por el 50 aniversario de “Pedagogía del Oprimido” en la Universidad de Deusto. Pudimos además contar con la presencia de Ramón Flecha quien nos acercó un poco más a la labor y transformaciones sociales que Freire había realizado a lo largo de su vida y el amor que sentía por todo lo que hacía.

No me gustaría terminar sin mencionar que este libro ha conseguido despertar en mí la conciencia crítica y las conexiones que deberían establecerse entre docentes, estudiantes y el mundo en general. Ojalá consiga

cautivar igual a las futuras generaciones, estaremos ante un mundo mucho más justo combatiendo la opresión, las injusticias y las desigualdades.

Nerea Gutiérrez Fernández
Universidad de Deusto
gutierreznerea@deusto.es