

**DOMESTICATION AND FOREIGNIZATION: AN
ANALYSIS OF CULTURE-SPECIFIC ITEMS IN OFFICIAL
AND NON-OFFICIAL SUBTITLES OF
THE TV SERIES *HEROES*¹**

Rafael Matielo
Universidade Federal de Santa Catarina/CNPq
rafaelmatielo@yahoo.com.br

Elaine B. Espindola
Universidade Federal de Santa Catarina
elaespindola@yahoo.com

Abstract: This study is inserted within the Audiovisual Translation (AVT) area and it takes up where Espindola (2005) left off. The present study draws on the analysis of the same translational product from two different perspectives: Official Subtitles (OS), rendered by Drei Marc Company in Brazil, and Non-Official Subtitles (NS), rendered by the Internet group 9th *Wonders*. This study analyzes the Culture-Specific Items (CSIs) and the treatment given to them in the light of the concepts of Domestication and Foreignization. The analyzed episode presented a total of 42 CSIs that were identified and categorized. The OS presented 33 foreignized items, 07 domesticated items, and 02 omissions, whereas the NS presented 32 foreignized items, 08 domesticated items, and 02 omissions. During the translational process for the subtitles of *Heroes*, the subtitler was faced with cultural diversity and had to deal with it. The few moments when domestication was used, the strategy used was that of adjustment, diminishing the strangeness towards the cultural elements. When the opposite occurred, the implication was that, by foreignizing, a feeling of strangeness or foreignness might have been created, possibly impacting the processing or acceptance towards these elements.

Keywords: translation studies, subtitling, culture-specific items, domestication, foreignization.

Resumo: O presente estudo se insere no campo de Tradução Audiovisual (TAV) e parte do estudo de Espindola (2005). Esta pesquisa analisa o mesmo produto tradutório sob duas perspectivas diferentes: Legendas Oficiais (LO), traduzidas no Brasil pela empresa Drei Marc e Legendas Não-Oficiais (LNO), traduzidas pelo grupo de internautas chamado 9th *Wonders*. Esta pesquisa analisa os chamados Itens de Especificidade Cultural (IECs) e o tratamento dado a eles durante o processo de legendagem à luz dos conceitos de Domesticação e Estrangeirização. O episódio analisado apresentou 42 IECs que foram identificados e categorizados. As LOs apresentaram 33 IECs estrangeirizados, 07 IECs domesticados e 02 omissões. Em relação às LNOs, 32 IECs foram estrangeirizados, 08 IECs foram domesticados e 02 IECs omitidos. Durante a legendagem de *Heroes*, o legendador deparou-se com diversidade cultural e precisou lidar com ela e, nos poucos momentos onde houve domesticação, a estratégia empregada foi a de ajuste, ocasionando a diminuição do impacto dos elementos culturais. Quando o oposto ocorreu, a implicação foi que, ao estrangeirizar, uma sensação de ‘estrangeiro’ pode ter sido criada, possivelmente impactando o processamento ou aceitação desses elementos.

Palavras-chave: estudos da tradução, legendagem, itens de especificidade cultural, domesticação, estrangeirização.

1 Introduction

The field of Translation Studies (TS) is concerned with the investigation of translation and translating, encompassing not only linguistic, but also political and cultural implications. Multimedia Translation stands out as one of the twelve areas of research in TS presented in the mapping proposed by Williams & Chesterman (2002). As Catrysse (1998) states, “the study of subtitling and dubbing seems to have launched the concept of audio-visual translation for good” and “further efforts will have to be made to integrate a traditional notion of translation—which is often too exclusively linguistic—into a more global audio-visual and communicational approach to translation” (p. 8).

Subtitling has more important implications than it is originally perceived due to the fact that translation is a political act. According to Álvarez & Vidal (1996):

From the eagerness to consider translation as a science or the obsession to give a definite, prescriptive and sole version of a text, we have moved on to a descriptive outlook which likewise, whether we like it or not, is political (p. 1).

In interlingual translation² or one involving two different languages, an inevitable power relationship between the languages involved in the translational task might give rise to a power relationship between the Source Culture (SC) and the Target Culture (TC). What and how the text will be rendered from the SC might determine significant traits in the TC. However, it is necessary to bear in mind that subtitling is a very unique and specific translation mode, with its own peculiarities, restrictions, challenges, and implications.

In relation to constraints, the subtitler needs to deal with space restrictions, influencing the compression of information s/he needs to make. According to Carvalho (2005), the number of characters per line in a subtitle depends on some factors, such as the means (cinema, VHS, or television), the target audience, and preferences established by clients. A subtitle ranges from 32 to 40 characters³ per line (cinema) and 30 to 35 per line (VHS and cable TV). The duration of the subtitles on the screen may last up to 6 seconds only. Consequently, criticism may occur on the part of people who have reasonable knowledge of the linguistic pair involved. Other issues represent challenges for the subtitler, such as the synchronicity, small period of time for rendering, and demands from censorship.

Other studies have focused on the issue of technical constraints and priorities, but only a few of them have addressed cultural specificities in relation to subtitling. An example of the latter is Espindola (2005), who investigated the treatment given to

culture-bound terms in the subtitles of the language pair–Brazilian Portuguese (BP)/English–in both directions, in the films “Cidade de Deus” (2001) and “Boys ‘N the Hood” (1991).

This study is not aimed judging any subtitlers’ work. It is rather aimed at describing the same translational product from two different perspectives: Official Subtitles (OS), rendered by professionals responsible for rendering the DVD box of the series *Heroes* in Brazil (Drei Marc Company), and Non-official Subtitles (NS), rendered by a ‘non-professional’ group composed by fans of the TV series *Heroes* who subtitled the episodes as they were released weekly on the Internet (Legendas.tv⁴) called *9th Wonders*⁵. This study analyzes Culture-Specific Items (CSIs) and the treatment given to them in the light of the concepts of Domestication and Foreignization postulated by Venuti (1995) in the subtitles of the TV Series *Heroes*.

The following research questions guide this study:

(RQ1) What CSIs are found in the TV Series *Heroes*?

(RQ2) What treatment–domestication or foreignization–is given to the CSIs in the two types of subtitles? What are the possible implications of the treatment given to CSIs in the subtitled film?

(RQ3) Does a pattern emerge in terms of the treatment given to CSIs in the official and non-official subtitles as regards domesticating and foreignizing procedures? If a pattern emerges, may a difference be perceived in the rendering of CSIs comparing the two types of subtitles?

2. Theoretical framework

2.1 Translation as a Political Act

Subtitling implies approximating two cultures, two sometimes distinct worlds. In doing so, the subtitler might be able to corroborate the diminishing of barriers between the cultural realms involved. “The translator can be the authority who manipulates

culture, politics, literature and their acceptance” (Álvarez & Vidal, 1996, p. 02). The subtitler may be in charge of ‘manipulating’ the culture to be rendered, and therefore, s/he may be responsible for modifying the way which the TC audience receives the SC, determining the audience’s perception, acceptance, and response to the subtitled product.

If subtitling deals with cultural relationships, when dealing with two unequal languages in terms of their social status or prestige and global relevance, one might assume that the language from the Source-Text (ST) that occupies a more advantaged social position is more likely to become more explicit in the Translated Text (TT) (Espindola, 2005).

In the article entitled “Translation in the global cultural economy: asymmetries, difference and identity”, Vasconcellos (2004) discusses issues concerning translation and globalization. She questions “to what extent globalization exhibits the effects of domination by the power centers of global culture” (p. 1). There is at least one point that merits attention: The position of prestige and dominance that English absorbs in the world scenario. Vasconcellos insists on “the need for training in sensitivity to (i) the historical and ongoing effects of imperial power and to (ii) the political weight and the hegemonic position of English, the language which comes to embody transnational culture” (p. 9). Hence, subtitling may not only involve language, but the total asymmetrical and political contexts that surround translation. Cultural specificities may then be one aspect of the total picture which is inherent to translation, which the next section addresses.

2.2 Culture-Specific Items (CSIs)

According to Aixelá (1996), Culture-Specific Items (CISs) are:

Those actually actualized items whose function and connotation in a source text involve a translation problem in their transference to a target text, whenever this problem

is a product of the nonexistence of the referred item or of its different intertextual status in the cultural system of the readers of the target text (p. 58).

CSIs are context-oriented and context-dependent. According to Álvarez and Vidal (1996), there is no longer textual translation, but a contextual translation, so that the correspondence of CSIs in linguistic and cultural pairs involved in the translational/subtitling processes may depend on the degree of (dis)similarities between the languages involved. In more similar cultures, CSIs might not pose as many rendering problems as in more distant cultures, depending on the differences of cultural reality or referential universe of the SC and the TC (Aubert, 1994).

2.3 Domestication and Foreignization

In the work *The Translator's Invisibility*, Venuti (1995) approaches issues concerning the translational task from the seventeenth century until the present time, in linguistic and political terms. The author problematizes some translation theories and translated texts throughout history, proposing two possible procedures to handle cultural elements: Domestication or Foreignization. According to Friedrich Schleiermacher (1813, in Venuti, 1995, p. 19), “either the translator leaves the author in peace, as much as possible, and moves the reader towards him; or he leaves the reader in peace, as much as possible, and moves the author towards him”. The act of “leaving the author in peace” may be equated to foreignizing the text ‘as much as possible’ and the act of “leaving the reader in peace” may be equated to domesticating it.

Whether CSIs tend to be domesticated or foreignized might give rise to a political discussion: What about the values of the SC? Will they ‘impinge the TC? What about the power that the SC exerts upon the TC? These aspects need to be taken into account when manipulation of cultural identities is at stake, leaving space even for the creation of stereotyping or misrepresentation of the Other.

3. Methodology

3.1 Data Source

A set of three texts was used: the source-text, containing the original English speeches from the dialogues, and the translated texts, the Official Subtitles (OS) and the Non-official Subtitles (NS).

Heroes is a North American science fiction television drama series created by Tim Kring, which premiered on NBC on September 25, 2006. The disparate and ordinary individuals from around the world inexplicably develop superhuman abilities and try to prevent catastrophes and save humanity.

3.2 Analytical Procedures

For the analysis, Season One (2006)–Episode Four (*Collision*) was selected. It is important to mention that the subtitles for this episode were the first ones the group *9th Wonders* rendered. The group is composed by non-professional subtitlers, fans of the series, who decided to launch a website to exchange information about the series and subtitles. Regarding the official subtitles, the only company that rendered the DVD box in Brazil was Drei Marc.

The following analytical procedures were taken in the present study:

- Transcription of the original English speech of the episode from the DVD;
- Download of the non-official subtitles from the website www.legendas.tv;
- Analysis regarding the occurrences of the CSIs in the transcription;
- Classification of the CSIs, using Espindola's (2005) categories of analysis;

- Examination of the treatment given to the CSIs regarding the procedures of domestication/foreignization in each of set of subtitles and comparatively among them.

The CSIs were categorized as follows, based on Espindola (2005):

- *Toponyms*: a place name, a geographical name, a proper name of locality, region, or some other part of the Earth's surface or its natural or artificial feature (<http://www.wisegeek.com/what-is-a-toponym.htm>);
- *Anthroponyms*: ordinary and famous people's names and nicknames and names referring to regional background which acquire identification status;
- *Forms of entertainment*: amusement or diversion including public performances or shows, it also encompasses hospitality provided, such as dinners, parties, business lunches, etc (Cambridge Advanced Learner's Dictionary, 2003);
- *Means of transportation*: the facilities used for the movement of people and goods from one place to another; the term is derived from the Latin *trans* meaning across and *portare* meaning to carry, such facilities are, many times, associated with specific cultures;
- *Fictional character*: a person in a novel, play, or a film who is related to fiction, works of imagination;
- *Local Institution*: an organization that helps or serves people in a certain area - health, education, work, political, administrative, religious, artistic;
- *Measuring system*: units used in the determination of the size, weight, speed, length, etc;
- *Food and Drink*: any solid or liquid substance that is used by human beings as a source of nourishment (www.cogsci.princeton.edu/cgi-bin/webwn);
- *Scholastic reference*: related to school or studying;
- *Religious celebration*: something special which marks a religious occasion;

4. Discussion of Findings

4.1 Quantitative Discussion

The findings are partially similar to those of Espindola's (2005), when taking into consideration the analyzed movie in the English-BP direction. From the ten categories, three presented no CSI in the analyzed episode. The occurrences range from 01 instance (Food and Drink and Scholastic Reference) to 25 instances (Anthroponym).

CSIs were mainly foreignized in both OS (32 CSIs were foreignized, 08 CSIs were domesticated, and 02 CSIs were omitted) and NS (31 CSIs were foreignized, 09 CSIs were domesticated, and 02 CSIs were omitted), as Table 1 shows.

Table 1: Occurrences of Cultural-Specific Items

CSI Category	Number of occurrences (Total = 42)
Toponym	07
Anthroponym	25
Forms of Entertainment	04
Means of Transportation	0
Fictional Character	02
Local Institution	02
Measuring System	0
Food and Drink	01
Scholastic Reference	01
Religious Celebration	0

4.2 Qualitative Discussion

Table 2: Toponyms

FILM ORIGINAL SPEECH IN ENGLISH	OFFICIAL SUBTITLES	NON-OFFICIAL SUBTITLES
1. <i>Las Vegas</i>	Para <i>Las Vegas</i>	<i>Las Vegas</i>
2. You're going to die in five weeks... then <i>New York</i> will explode. I'll teach you how to say it phonetically.	Você vai morrer daqui a 5 semanas, e <i>Nova York</i> vai explodir. Vou ensiná-lo a dizer isso.	Você morrerá em 5 semanas e <i>Nova Iorque</i> irá explodir. Eu vou te ensinar a dizer isso foneticamente.
3. Pulled out of <i>Red River Creek</i> at approximately 4:00 a.m. this morning.	Retirada do <i>Rio Red Creek</i> às 4h da manhã de hoje.	...achada <i>no leito de um riacho</i> aproximadamente as 4 da madrugada.
4. Keep an eye on this guy. I don't want this nut job following me to <i>Vegas</i> .	Fique de olho nesse cara, não quero ele me seguindo. (<i>Omission of Vegas</i>)	Não deixem esse doido me seguir até <i>Las Vegas</i> .
5. I'm going home to <i>Madras</i> .	Vou voltar para casa. Para <i>Madras</i> .	Estou indo para casa, para <i>Madras</i> .
6. Hey, can you tele-port us to the craps table in <i>Ceaser's Palace</i> ?	Pode nos teletransportar ao cassino do <i>Ceasar's Palace</i> ?	Você pode nos teleportar para a roleta do <i>Caesar's Palace</i> ?
7. I took a helicopter ride over <i>Red Rocks Park</i> one time...	Fiz um passeio de helicóptero sobre o <i>Parque Red Rocks</i> .	Nós voamos de helicóptero sobre <i>Red Rocks Park</i> uma vez.

Toponyms represent the second most frequent category. In the case of occurrences 1, 4, and 5 (Table 2), the referents *Las Vegas* and *Madras* are already 'neutralized' in the Brazilian context,

frequently written in the exact same way in BP. In the subtitles, foreignization took place in both OS and NS based on the fact that the names were written without any graphical modification. In some toponyms, such as in *New York*, a feeling of foreignness (*York*) was created in the case of OS. In the case of NS, the toponymic reference was domesticated, translated into *Nova Iorque*. In some cases, such as in *Red River Creek*, a rendering problem was posed to the subtitle: in the episode, the word *Creek* is in capital letter indicating that it is a proper name, a river in Odessa–Texas (http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/List_of_Texas_rivers) and therefore this name could have been kept as in the ST. Such a strategy resulted in a foreignized term, which happened in the OS. However, the word *Creek* also means river (Cambridge Advanced Learner’s Dictionary, 2003), and in the case of the NS, not only a more general translation was adopted (*no leito de um riacho*), but also extra information was added.

Regarding toponym 6, even though both OS and NS foreignized this casino’s name, they eventually used different (mis)spellings of the word, as table 2 shows. *Caesar* would be the correct spelling of the word, according to Cambridge Advanced Learner’s Dictionary (2003).

Table 3: Anthroponyms

FILM ORIGINAL SPEECH IN ENGLISH	OFFICIAL SUBTITLES	NON-OFFICIAL SUBTITLES
<i>Mr. Linderman</i> wants to see you.	O <i>Sr. Linderman</i> quer vê-la.	<i>Sr. Linderman</i> quer vê-la.
<i>Claire?</i>	<i>Claire?</i>	<i>Claire</i>
I think it’s best if <i>Micah</i> waited outside.	Eu acho melhor o <i>Micah</i> esperar lá fora.	Acho melhor que o <i>Micah</i> espere lá fora.
Jane Doe.	<i>Mulher desconhecida.</i>	<i>Indigente.</i>

<i>Mr. Petrelli!</i> Excuse me, <i>Mr. Petrelli</i> .	Com licença, <i>Sr. Petrelli!</i> Preciso falar com o senhor! (<i>omission of Petrelli</i>)	Com licença, <i>Sr. Petrelli!</i> Eu preciso falar com você. (<i>omission of Petrelli</i>)
Does the name <i>Sylar</i> mean anything to you?	O nome <i>Sylar</i> lhe diz alguma coisa?	O nome <i>Sylar</i> significa algo para você?
It's <i>Suresh, Dr. Suresh</i> .	- <i>Suresh! Dr. Suresh!</i>	<i>Suresh, Dr. Suresh</i> .
You and <i>Isaac</i> .	Você e o <i>Isaac</i> você e o <i>Isaac</i> .
You think this is one big joke, don't you, <i>Pete</i> ?	Acha que isso é uma piada, <i>Pete</i> ?	Você pensa que isso é uma brincadeira, não é, <i>Pete</i> ?!?
<i>Chandra Suresh?</i>	<i>Chandra Suresh?</i>	<i>Chandra Suresh?</i>
They're in the cabinet with the water stain that looks like <i>Abraham Lincoln</i> .	No armário com a mancha que parece <i>Abraham Lincoln</i> .	Está na dispensa, debaixo da mancha de água que parece o <i>Abraham Lincoln</i> .
Is <i>Peter Parker</i> cheating... when he sells pictures of Spider-Man?	O <i>Peter Parker</i> erra ao vender fotos do Homem-Aranha?	Por acaso o <i>Peter Parker</i> trapaceia quando vende fotos do Homem-Aranha?
But why don't you ask <i>Tina</i> ?	Por que não chama a <i>Tina</i> ?	Mas por que não chama <i>Tina</i> ?
We'll go see <i>Nathan</i> .	Vamos encontrar o <i>Nathan</i> .	Nós vamos ver o <i>Nathan</i> .
What'd you do, <i>Simone</i> ?	O que você fez, <i>Simone</i> ?	O que você fez, <i>Simone</i> ...
No, you're <i>Little Miss Miracle-Grow</i> .	-Não, você é a srta. <i>Milagre</i> .	- Não, você é a "Senhorita <i>Milagre</i> ".
I saw you go off with <i>Brody Mitchum</i> last night at the bonfire.	Eu vi você e o <i>Brody Mitchum</i> saindo da festa ontem.	Eu vi que você saiu com <i>Brody Mitchum</i> ontem a noite, na festa da fogueira.

You've got to tell somebody about <i>Brody</i> .	Precisa denunciar o <i>Brody</i> .	Você precisa contar a alguém sobre o <i>Brody</i> .
You're meeting <i>Miss Sakamoto</i> tomorrow at 11 :00 a.m.	Vai encontrar a <i>sra. Sakamoto</i> amanhã às 11 h.	Encontraremos o <i>Sr. Nakamora</i> amanhã às 9.
Oh, so much for <i>Celine Dion</i> .	Não verei mais a <i>Celine Dion</i> .	Oh, lá se vai <i>Celine Dion</i> .
Oh, hey, <i>Lori</i> .	Oi, <i>Lori</i> .	Ei... (<i>Omission of the anthroponym</i>)
You think about that, <i>Niki</i> .	Pense nisso, <i>Niki</i> .	Pense nisso, <i>Niki</i> .
<i>Mohinder?</i>	<i>Mohinder?</i>	<i>Mohinder?</i>
<i>Jackie</i> was going to give me a ride home but she left without me.	Eu ia de carona com a <i>Jackie</i> , mas ela me esqueceu aqui.	<i>Jackie</i> ia me dar uma carona, mas ela foi embora sem mim.
My name is <i>Hiro Nakamura</i> .	O meu nome é <i>Hiro Nakamura</i> .	Meu nome é <i>Hiro Nakamura</i> .

Regarding Anthroponyms, all occurrences were similarly rendered (foreignized). The occurrence 01, *Mr linderman*, was foreignized in the OS and the NS, where the spelling was kept the same as the ST. However, the title *Mr* was translated into its correspondent in BP–*Sr*–giving the TT audience some taste of domestication. Similarly, referent 19, involving a title plus a name: *Miss Sakamoto*, in which the procedure used was a combination of keeping the name and domesticating the title, resulting in *sra. Sakamoto*, which leads to some questioning in relation to forms of address, that is, in English, the title is combined with someone's last name (<http://www.infoplease.com/ipa/A0001618.html>), as opposed to BP, which uses the title with or without the person's first name.

Occurrences 2, 3, 5, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 17, 18, 20, 21, 22, 23, 24, and 25 were kept in the TT, exemplifying the

power that the ST language exerts over the TT's language/culture. In the case of *Little Miss Miracle-Grow*, the procedure adopted was that of domestication and this name also brings specific implication. According to information given in the URL <http://www.tv.com/heroes/collision/episode/861501/trivia.html>, this term is a combination of two allusions: it is the title that newspapers usually give to children who survive certain situations against all odds and a commercially available liquid fertilizer that claims to cause unusually rapid growth in plants. This is a reference to one of the character's abilities, Claire, who is able to quickly heal any injury. The subtitler translated it into *Srta. Milagre*, so as to give the TT audience the idea that the item expresses.

Table 4: Forms of Entertainment

FILM ORIGINAL SPEECH IN ENGLISH	OFFICIAL SUBTITLES	NON-OFFICIAL SUBTITLES
1. Played <i>poker</i> .	Nós só jogamos <i>pôquer</i> .	Joguei <i>pôquer</i> .
2. Mom? Want to play <i>Scrabble</i> ?	Mamãe? Quer jogar <i>palavras cruzadas</i> ?	Mãe... quer jogar " <i>scrabble</i> "?
3. I saw you go off with Brody Mitchum last night at the <i>bonfire</i> .	Eu vi você e o Brody Mitchum saindo da <i>feita</i> ontem.	Eu vi que você saiu com Brody Mitchum ontem a noite, na <i>feita da fogueira</i> .
4. Making banners for <i>spirit week</i> .	Eu fiz cartazes para a <i>feita do colégio</i> .	Fazendo cartazes para <i>semana cultural</i> .

As for Forms of Entertainment, domestication was used more frequently. *Poker* acquired another written form, probably because this word is an already established form in the TC. The item *scrabble* was foreignized in the NS, whereas in the OS the choice was that of domestication, since the subtitler chose to use a more familiar game in order to express this CSI to the TT audience.

In relation to the referents *bonfire* and *spirit week*, domesticating procedures were used, although the rendering choices may have varied to some extent. While the OS tended to be more general using more superordinate words, the NS tended to be more specific.

Similarly, the referent *spirit week* was domesticated acquiring the meaning of a school party or a cultural week at school. *Spirit week*⁶ means a week in the North American schools to promote school pride, foster student belonging and instill a sense of community. In the OS, a broader sense is conveyed in the subtitles *-feira do colégio*—whereas in the NS, the spectator can grasp a more specific notion (*semana cultural*).

Table 5: Fictional Character

FILM ORIGINAL SPEECH IN ENGLISH	OFFICIAL SUBTITLES	NON-OFFICIAL SUBTITLES
Is <i>Peter Parker</i> cheating...	O <i>Peter Parker</i> erra...	Por acaso o <i>Peter Parker</i> trapaceia...
...when he sells pictures of <i>Spider-Man</i> ?	...ao vender fotos do <i>Homem-Aranha</i> ?	...quando vende fotos do <i>Homem-Aranha</i> ?

Fictional Character presented two occurrences. The first refers to Spider-Man⁷, an American fictional character. In *Heroes*, there is a moment in which there is a reference to this fictional character and the man behind the costume, *Peter Parker*. Reference number 1 was kept in both the OS and the NS and, therefore, was translated exactly the same way through foreignization. Regarding fictional reference number 2, domestication occurred in the adoption of the name that already circulates in the Brazilian market: *Homem-Aranha* (http://www.marvelvc.com.br/Aranha/HQ_Aranha.htm).

These items tended to be foreignized when they seemed not to cause strangeness to the TC audience. The same can also be seen in Espindola's study (2005), in which fictional characters tended to be foreignized as well.

Table 6: Local Institution

FILM ORIGINAL SPEECH IN ENGLISH	OFFICIAL SUBTITLES	NON-OFFICIAL SUBTITLES
What are you? <i>FBI</i> ?	De onde você é? Do <i>FBI</i> ?	Você é do <i>FBI</i> ?
Huh? Are you <i>CIA</i> ?	Você é da <i>CIA</i> ?	<i>CIA</i> ?

The two occurrences of Local Institution (Table 6) present two foreignized CSIs: *FBI* and *CIA*. Both abbreviations are known and, thus, did not pose any comprehension problem when foreignized.

Table 7: Food and Drink

FILM ORIGINAL SPEECH IN ENGLISH	OFFICIAL SUBTITLES	NON-OFFICIAL SUBTITLES
Claire, I'm making <i>waffles</i> .	Claire, eu vou fazer <i>waffles</i> !	Claire, estou fazendo <i>waffles</i> !

Concerning Food and Drink, the only occurrence was *Waffles*, which refers to a batter-based cake cooked in a waffle iron patterned to give a distinctive and characteristic shape (<http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Waffle>). The item was foreignized, presenting the target audience with a very typical American dish. When faced with this food, the spectator in both OS and NS establishes some contact with the 'other', and is reminded of the foreignness that lies behind the TV series.

Table 8: Scholastic Reference

FILM ORIGINAL SPEECH IN ENGLISH	OFFICIAL SUBTITLES	NON-OFFICIAL SUBTITLES
---------------------------------	--------------------	------------------------

1. Making banners for <i>spirit week</i> .	Eu fiz cartazes para a <i>festa do colégio</i> .	Fazendo cartazes para <i>semana cultural</i> .
--	--	--

In relation to Scholastic Reference, *Spirit Week* was previously categorized into forms of entertainment, but it also makes clear reference to school matters. This referent was domesticated here in both the OS and the NS. In the OS, a more general sense is expressed in the subtitled discourse, whereas in the NS the spectator can have a more specific notion of the festivity, having the information that it involves, i.e. a cultural week at school.

Tables 9 and 10 present a summary of the results regarding the CSIs in both OS and NS:

Table 9: Subtitling of the CSI and the procedure(s) adopted in OS

CSI Category	Procedure Adopted in Official Subtitles			Total of CSIs per Category
	Domestication	Foreignization	Omission	
Toponym	0	06	01	07
Anthroponym	02	22	01	25
Forms of Entertainment	04	0	0	04
Means of Transportation	0	0	0	0
Fictional Character	01	01	0	02
Local Institution	0	02	0	02
Measuring System	0	0	0	0
Food and Drink	0	01	0	01

Scholastic Reference	01	0	0	01
Religious Celebration	0	0	0	0
Total of Items per Procedure	08	32	02	42

Table 10: Subtitling of the CSI and the procedure(s) adopted in NS

CSI Category	Procedure Adopted in Non-Official Subtitles			Total of CSIs per Category
	Domestication	Foreignization	Omission	
Toponym	02	05	0	07
Anthroponym	02	21	02	25
Forms of Entertainment	03	01	0	04
Means of Transportation	0	0	0	0
Fictional Character	01	01	0	02
Local Institution	0	02	0	02
Measuring System	0	0	0	0
Food and Drink	0	01	0	01
Scholastic Reference	01	0	0	01
Religious Celebration	0	0	0	0
Total of Items per Procedure	09	31	02	42

5 Final remarks

In this article, the treatment given to CSIs from the North American TV Series *Heroes* was analyzed, in the light of the concepts of domestication and foreignization. With this in mind, the Research Questions raised in the introduction of this study are now revisited:

(RQ1) What CSIs are found in the TV Series *Heroes*?

(RQ2) What treatment—domestication or foreignization—is given to the CSIs in the two types of subtitles? What are the possible implications of the treatment given to CSIs in the subtitled film?

(RQ3) Does a pattern emerge in terms of the treatment given to CSIs in the official and non-official subtitles as regards domesticating and foreignizing procedures? If a pattern emerges, may a difference be perceived in the rendering of CSIs comparing the two types of subtitles?

Regarding RQ1, three categories presented no CSIs in the episode that was under study (Means of Transportation, Measuring System, and Religious Celebration), whereas the other seven categories presented a total number of 42 CSIs. Toponyms were the category with the highest number of items (25 CSIs). In what concerns RQ2, the predominant treatment given to the CSIs was foreignization. In terms of implications, the few moments where domestication was used, the strategy used was that of adjustment of the SC context into the TC context, diminishing the impact of otherness as regards cultural elements. When the opposite occurred, by foreignizing, a feeling of foreignness was created, with the consequence of possibly impacting the processing of the subtitles. Unfortunately, the present study did not cover audience response so as to allow for further speculation. This aspect left undiscussed is suggested for further research.

Another aspect relates to issues of power that the SC and its language exert over the TC and its language. This might account for the explicit presence of some values of the ST in the TT, which

deserves careful reflection but which unfortunately goes beyond the scope of this piece of research: Power relationships can serve as a driving force for further reflections.

In relation to RQ3, a diverging pattern was not found. In some categories, the translational pattern showed discrepancy (as in *Anthroponym*, for instance), whereas in some other categories this did not occur (as in *Forms of Entertainment*).

In the case of the OS, subtitlers should follow ‘rules’ or recommendations given by the company (via subtitling manual and by clients). However, the fact that non-official subtitlers are not under such constraints led to the assumption that we would possibly find some discrepancy in terms of domestication and foreignization. Nevertheless, such a hypothesis was disconfirmed.

In one of the e-mails exchanged with Leonardo Neves, *Drei Marc*’s subtitler of *Heroes*, he mentioned that his position to deal with CSIs is to keep them. He does not try to find ‘correspondents’ in BP. Leonardo said that he always tries to ‘explain’ what such a CSI means within the subtitle, as if it were a ‘translator’s note’.

This study does not favor one of the translational procedures in detriment of the other since every situation requires questioning and reflection, and every translational act must be carefully thought out. Translation brings the inevitable clash between cultures and the results obtained here point to a constant presence of foreignization, reminding the spectator of the cultural and the power relationships held between the two languages/cultures involved in subtitling.

Notes

1. The authors are thankful to Dr Maria Lúcia Barbosa de Vasconcellos (Universidade Federal de Santa Catarina–UFSC) and her fruitful contributions.

2. The term interlingual translation is used here in tune with Jakobson (1959') and refers to the "interpretation of verbal signs by means of some other language" (p. 233).

3. The number of characters in subtitles actually varies much, depending on the video type (VHS, cable TV, cinema, or other types of video productions) and its consequent screen space. Drei Marc requires its subtitlers to use a maximum of 31 characters per line, and in case of a line filled up with capital letters, 20 is the maximum number of characters.

4. Legendas.tv is a Brazilian free non-official subtitles source, maintained by Internet users who collaborate with the website by submitting their subtitles. Subtitles for *Heroes* rendered by the group *9th Wonders* can also be retrieved here: <http://legendas.tv/>

5. According to 'Dulio', the head of the group, the team was created to exchange information about the TV series, and then a blog (website) was launched. The group that translated the episode intended to be analyzed here was at that time composed by 08 (eight) people. Subtitles and other information about the group can be retrieved from the Group's Official Website: <http://www.9thwonders.net/>

6. This information was taken from the following website: http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Spirit_week.

7. This information was taken from the following website: <http://spiderman.sony-pictures.com>.

Bibliography

AIXELÁ, J. F. (1996). "Culture-specific items in translation". In ÁLVAREZ, R & VIDAL, C. (1996). *Translation, power, subversion*. Cleveland/Bristol/Adelaide: Multilingual Matters. Ltd.

ÁLVAREZ, R & VIDAL, C. (1996) *Translation, power, subversion*. Cleveland/Bristol/Adelaide: Multilingual Matters. Ltd.

AUBERT, F.H. (1994). *As (In)Fidelidades da Tradução*. Campinas, SP: Editora da Unicamp.

CARVALHO, C. A. (2005) *A tradução para legendas: dos polissistemas à singularidade do tradutor*. Master's Dissertation, Pontifícia Universidade Católica do Rio de Janeiro.

Cambridge Advanced Learner's Dictionary (2003), New York: Cambridge University Press.

CATTRYSSE, P. (1998). "Translation in the new media age". In: GAMBIER, Y. (1998). *Translating for the media*. Painosalama Ou, Turku: Centre for Translation and Interpreting.

DELABASTITA, D. (1990a) "Translation and the Mass Media". In: BASSNET, S. & LEFEVERE, A. (Ed.) *Translation, History and Culture*. London/New York: CASSELL, p. 97-109.

ESPINDOLA, E. (2005) *The use and abuse of subtitling as a practice of cultural representation: Cidade de Deus and Boyz 'N the Hood*. Master's Dissertation, Universidade Federal de Santa Catarina.

GAMBIER, Y. (2002) *Screen Translation: An Overview*. In: Trad. E Comun. São Paulo, p. 93-103.

HALLIDAY, M. A. K. (1989) *Spoken and Written Language*. United States: Oxford University Press.

JAKOBSON, R. (1959) "On linguistic aspects of translation". In: *The Translation Studies Reader*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.

KOVACIC, I. (1998). "Language in the media—a new challenge for translator trainers". In: GAMBIER, Y. (1998). *Translating for the media*. Painosalama Ou, Turku: Centre for Translation and Interpreting.

KRING, T. (2006) *Heroes*. [DVD]. Universal Media Studios in association with Tailwind Productions.

VASCONCELLOS, M. L. B. (2004). "Translation in the Global Cultural Economy: Asymmetries, difference and identity". In: *Cadernos de tradução*. Florianópolis: Universidade Federal de Santa Catarina, p. 45-54, v. XIII, n. 2004/1.

VENUTI, L. (1995) *The translator's invisibility*. New York: Routledge.

_____. L. (1998). *The scandals of translation - towards an ethics of difference*. London & New York: Routledge.

WILLIAMS, J. & Chesterman, A. (2002) *The Map. A Beginner's Guide to Doing Research in Translation Studies*. Manchester, UK: St. Jerome.

